Edited by Associate Professor Jirayudh Sinthuphan and Professor Tom Watson

This new conference was organised by the Faculty of Communication Arts, Chulalongkorn University and The Media School, Bournemouth University to provide a platform for research into Asian perspectives of corporate and marketing communications in all forms and time scales.

February 2014
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s) &amp; Affiliation</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amini Amir Abdullah &amp; Fahmi Azar Mistar, Universiti Putra Malaysia</td>
<td>Media Significance: The understanding of 1Malaysia Concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ana Adi &amp; Nathaniel Hobby, Bournemouth University, UK</td>
<td>Social Media Monitoring for Higher Education: A case study of corporate marketing communications of Bournemouth University and its outreach to Asia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saravudh Anantachart &amp; Papaporn Chaihanchanchai, Chulalongkorn University, Thailand</td>
<td>Current Status of Integrated Marketing Communications in Thailand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peng Hwa Ang, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore</td>
<td>Marketing in an Age of Greater Privacy Awareness in ASEAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigel M. de Bussy &amp; Lokweeptun Suprawan, School of Marketing, Curtin University, Australia</td>
<td>The Impact of Corporate Social Responsibility Branding on Consumer Attitudes: A Thai Perspective (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prapporn Chanssatiporn &amp; Jirayudh Sinthuphan, Chulalongkorn University, Thailand</td>
<td>Message creation of Thai governmental organization to enhance the creative economy in Thailand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graeme Domm, Deakin University/RMIT University, Australia</td>
<td>Western public relations in South East Asian environments: More than just a matter of “cultural sensitivity”?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retno Hendariningrum, University of Pembangunan Nasional “Veteran” Yogyakarta, Indonesia</td>
<td>How is IMC strategies on advertising agency: The Indonesian style of Dwi Sapa IMC company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chun-ju Flora Hung-Baecke Hong Kong Baptist University, Hong Kong</td>
<td>Communication in stakeholder engagement and corporate brand building: A Starbucks case (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Varsha Jain, Neha Damle &amp; Khyati Jagani, Mudra Institute of Communications, India &amp; DDB Mudra Group</td>
<td>Integrated Marketing Communication in Nutrition Segment (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kevin L. Keenan, American University in Cairo, Egypt</td>
<td>Coverage of China in the Egyptian press: A content analysis of years before and after Egypt’s revolution (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melanie King, University of Technology, Sydney, Australia</td>
<td>Corporate blogging and microblogging – how and why is it being used and to what end? (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suresh Kumar, G., Bharathiar University, Coimbatore, India</td>
<td>Transferring Anglo-American Models of Behavioural Theories to Mobile Advertising adoption researches in Asian countries: A Theoretical Perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amia Luthfia, Agus Wasita &amp; Rosidah Syaukat, Bina Nusantara University, Indonesia</td>
<td>Organizational Culture of an Indonesia University (A Case Study of a Private University in Jakarta, Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May O. Lwin &amp; Jack Ho Young, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore</td>
<td>Third Party Endorsements of Nature-based Claims: Influence on Consumers’ Perceptions of Food Products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Mackey, Deakin University, Australia</td>
<td>Better understanding of the rhetoric to public relations nexus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yoseo Maya P. M &amp; Dorien Kartikawangi</td>
<td>Evaluation of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Strategy and Implementation Based on Game Theory and Negotiation Theory, (Case Study: PT Toarco Jaya, Toraja Utara, Sulawesi Selatan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kate A. Mirandilla, University of Technology, Sydney</td>
<td>Inter-agency liaison in crisis decision-making: Exploring public relations’ intervention in crisis decision-making in Australia (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahtiar Mohamad, Ahmed Rageh Ismail &amp; Hassan Abu Bakar Universiti Utara Malaysia, Malaysia</td>
<td>The Development and Validation of the Corporate Communication Management (CCM) Construct using Exploratory Factor Analysis (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mazzini Muda &amp; Rosidah Musa, Universiti Teknologi MARA Malaysia</td>
<td>Celebrity Entrepreneurs: Perceived Credibility and Impact on Advertising Effectiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratanasuda Punnahitanond &amp; Banphot Chomngam, Bangkok University, Thailand</td>
<td>Message Framing and Message Orientation in Energy Conservation Ads: Relative Effect on Asian Audiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pornphan Sheoychitra, Silpakorn University, Thailand</td>
<td>Status of Knowledge of Customer Relationship Management in Thai Graduate Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Simmons, Charles Sturt University, Australia</td>
<td>The influence of Australian local government approaches to communication on community approval, staff turnover and media coverage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raveena Singh, University of Canberra, Australia</td>
<td>Paradigm shift - Repositioning marketing communication (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kamolchanok Sreshthaputra, Burapha University, Thailand</td>
<td>Harley Davidson Community toward Brand Loyalty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suttanipa Srisai, University of the Thai Chamber of Commerce, Thailand</td>
<td>The Influence of Wattana-dharm Thai [Thai Culture] on Thai PR Practice: A Validation of a Qualitative Analysis Using Statistical Factor Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gregoria Arum Yudarwati, University of Atma Jaya Yogyakarta, Indonesia</td>
<td>The Interconnection between Public Relations and Corporate Social Responsibility, Case Studies in the Indonesian Mining Industry (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maydina Zakiah, S.Sn, &amp; Moh. Wildan Universitas Indonesia, Indonesia</td>
<td>Communication strategy for increasing information (Abstract)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Significance of media and the understanding of 1Malaysia concept

Dr. Amini Amir Abdullah &
Fahmi Azar Mistar

Department of Government and Civilization Studies
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
Serdang, Selangor.

ABSTRACT

This study is about the medium used by the youth in Malaysia in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept. The information gained in this study also revealed the understanding of youth on the 1Malaysia Concept. This study also explored the level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept according to race (Malay, Chinese, Indian and others) and identified mediums and methods used by youth in understanding the 1Malaysia concept. Altogether, 1,600 youth were selected as respondents for this study. 100 respondents were selected from each of the states and the three Federal Territories. The respondents were selected via the convenience sampling method. The selected samples represent youth from diverse races and both genders. In this matter, no specific basic procedure is applied in selecting the races and genders of respondents. Information was obtained through questionnaires answered by the respondents. The IBM Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) version 20.0 was used to analyses data gathered via the questionnaires. Two questions were given to get complete inputs on most frequently mediums used by Malaysian youth to obtain information on the 1Malaysia concept, as well as mediums that are most effective in understanding the 1Malaysia concept. Respondents were required to mark unlimited alternatives that are given in the questionnaires. Eleven (11) mediums were used by youth to obtain information on the 1Malaysia concept. They were the television, Internet, newspapers, radio, bulletins, magazines, books, speeches, blogs, newsletters and others. Most of the respondents (83.9%) stated that the television is most frequently used followed by the Internet (67.8%), newspapers (63.7%), radio (50.1%), bulletins (40.4%), magazines (30.9%), books (29.9%), speeches (20.3%), blogs (22.8%), newsletters (7.8%) dan others (1.2%). On the most effective mediums in understanding the 1Malaysia concept, majority of the respondents (77.1%) stated that the television as being the most effective, followed by the internet (63.6%), newspapers (50.9%), radio (43%), bulletins (36.1%), books (25.8%), magazines (25.1%), speeches (23.8%), blogs (20.1%), newsletters (7.9%) and others (1.8%). Overall, the level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia concept is high.
1.0 BACKGROUND

The 1Malaysia Concept is a dynamic Malaysian government unity policy towards national unity regardless of ethnicity, race, religion and territory. Overall, the Concept focuses on social unity and national integrity.

The 1Malaysia Concept is also a mechanism to strengthen the unity of the multiracial community in line with current situation and challenges. All ethnics need to emerge from traditional ways of thinking and embrace each other as Malaysians. The 1Malaysia Slogan is the sacred formula emphasizing that national interest and agenda are of essence as compared to the interest of a particular group and personal interest.

The 1Malaysia Concept is established with the aim of creating a Malaysian Nation that is able to exist in harmony and unity. Unity is the foundation of a peaceful, progressive and harmonious Malaysia. The Concept which was introduced by YAB Datuk Seri Mohd Najib Tun Abdul Razak, the Prime Minister of Malaysia is a drastic approach, taken accurately and appropriately in line with the aspirations of the people. The Concept can inculcate good interracial relationships and a steadfast harmony regardless of religions, races and ethnicity. The basic values that should be possessed by all are mutual respect, understanding and trust.

The objective of the 1Malaysia Concept is to solidify unity in a multiracial community, and it is a form of “investment” for future generation. The Government hopes to see improvements in the context of national administration and the welfare of the people. The 1Malaysia Concept “People First, Performance Now” has become a significant medium of national transformation in all aspects and to nurture unity, as well as upholding the image of the nation at the international level.

2.0 THE PROBLEM

2.1 Statement of Problem

The understanding of Malaysians of the 1Malaysia Concept is sometimes deviated as some leaders of The Opposition claimed that it is similar to the Malaysian Malaysia Concept. The Malaysian Malaysia Concept has long been the pursuit of DAP, so said to strive for justice and equality between the people, but actually DAP aims to abolish the reign of monarchy, the place of Islam as the Federal religion and privileges of the Malay people. Besides that, DAP also tries to terminate the New Economic Policy (NEP). These facts are not simply made ups, but are based on their speeches and write ups in books and blogs of their supporters.

This study is conducted to identify on the frequency of medium used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept. The information gained in this study also revealed the understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept. This study tries to answer the questions that cover the medium most frequently used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept and also identify medium most effectively used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept.

Hence, this research focuses on the medium effect and mostly use to understanding of youth in this country towards the relatively new Concept. Furthermore, the policies of the Government are not made to be understood in a short time. Numerous information and explanatory programs need to be conducted.

The understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept is crucial in ensuring the success of the Concept. This is not the Malaysian Malaysia Concept as it has its own interpretations. There are parties that attempt to similarize the Malaysian Malaysia Concept and the 1Malaysia
Concept. Where in reality, the 1Malaysia Concept emphasizes on national unity and ethnic tolerance.

According to Syed Ahmad Lokman (2009), the Malaysian Malaysia Concept tries to wreck the foundation of Malaysia’s multiracial community that has been widely accepted all along. The Malaysian Malaysia Concept tries to promote equality without taking the philosophy of the Constitution and the reality of our nation’s history. These might confuse Malaysians and might also contribute to unease, especially among the Malays.

2.2 Objectives of the Study

The general objective of this research is to identify the frequency of medium used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept.

The main objectives are as follows:

i. To identify medium most frequently used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept.

ii. To identify medium most effectively used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept.

iii. To study the level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept.

3.0 METHODOLOGY

3.1 Research Design

This is a quantitative study conducted through the response of respondents via questionnaires. Questionnaires were used to identify the level of understanding of Malaysian youth on the 1Malaysia Concept.

The designation of the study focuses on the research framework from beginning to the end including the process of data collection on the understanding of respondents on research subject and the number of respondents who responded to the questions that are important to the findings of the study.

Questionnaires were used to identify the level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia based on questions and answers given by the respondents.

3.2 Location of Research

This study is conducted in sixteen (16) states, including the Federal Territories. They are Johor, Malacca, N.Sembilan, Selangor, the Federal Territory of Putrajaya, the Federal Territory of Kuala Lumpur, Perak, Pahang, Pulau Pinang, Perlis, Kedah, Kelantan, Terengganu, Sabah, Sarawak and the Federal Territory of Labuan.

The locations covered all states and the Federal Territories. Hence, this study has respondents that are balanced and well represented. This is an advantage as no state or Federal Territory is left out from this study.
3.3 Profile of Research Samples

Altogether, 1,600 youth were selected as respondents for this study. 100 respondents were selected from each of the states and the Federal Territories. This means that each state and federal territory is represented by 100 respondents. The respondents were youth who were selected via the convenience sampling method. This method enables the researcher to freely select respondents. It is rather impossible for all Malaysian youth to be involved in this study.

Overall, the respondents are as follows: 1,081 Malay youth, 204 Chinese youth, 143 Indian youth and 172 youth from other ethnic group.

3.4 Data Collection

Data collection was conducted between March and July in 2012. Data was obtained through questionnaires. Respondents were requested to complete the specially engineered questionnaires for this study.

3.5 Limitations of Research

This study involved 1,600 respondents from 13 states and three Federal Territories. As compared to the whole population of Malaysian youth, this is not a big number. It is impossible to involve all Malaysian youth as respondents. Therefore, sampling technique is adapted to select respondents with regards to the whole population of Malaysian youth.

3.6 Research Instrument and Reliability

Basically, the research instrument consists of six parts as follows:

i. The front page
ii. Part A : Profile of respondents
iii. Part B : Questions on understanding
iv. Part C (i) : mediums and methods used in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept (2 multi answers questions)
   v. Part C (ii) : mediums and methods used in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept (Likert Scale, 12 questions)

This instrument is used to assess the level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept.

The reliability of the instrument was measured with the Internal Consistency Analysis (Cronbach Alpha).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>PART</th>
<th>N ITEM</th>
<th>CRONBACH ALPHA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Part C (i) : mediums and methods used most frequently in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Part C (ii) : mediums and methods used in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.03</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The value of Cronbach Alpha for all questions exceed 0.6

These findings prove that this research instrument exceeds the minimum level of reliability for normal social science research.

4.0 RESEARCH FINDINGS

Objective 1: To identify the frequency of medium used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept.

In this section, respondents are given two (2) main questions:

i. What is the medium most frequently used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept?
ii. What is the medium most effectively used in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept?

Both questions are given to get complete inputs on most frequently mediums used by Malaysian youth to obtain information on the 1Malaysia Concept, as well as mediums that are most effective in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept. Respondents are required to mark unlimited alternatives that are given in the questionnaires as follow:

i. Books
ii. Magazines
iii. Television
iv. Radio
v. Internet
vi. Newspapers
vii. Bulletins
viii. Newsletters
ix. Speeches
x. Blogs
xi. Others, please specify: ____________

On response to the question of the mediums most frequently used by Malaysian youth to obtain information on the 1Malaysia Concept, majority of the respondents (83.9%) answered that they most frequently used television, followed by the Internet (67.8%), newspapers (63.7%), radio (50.1%), bulletins (40.4%), magazines (30.9%), books (29.9%), speeches (20.3%), blogs (22.8%), newsletters (7.8%), and others (1.2%). Details are at Table 4.3 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Highest Number</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Television</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Internet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Radio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Books</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Magazines</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Bulletin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Speeches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Blogs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Others, please specify: ____________</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Although only a small minority of respondents gave the answer of “others”, they stated that the other mediums used to obtain information on the 1Malaysia Concept consist of banners, programmers by a government organization, National Civics Bureau (Biro Tatanegara), discussion programmers, Facebook, Twitter, teachers, friends, brochures and pamphlets.

Objective 2: To identify medium most effectively used in obtaining information on the 1Malaysia Concept.

On response to the question of the medium most effectively used in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept, majority of the respondents (77.1%) stated that the television as being the most effective, followed by the Internet (63.6%), newspapers (50.9%), radio (43%), bulletins (36.1%), magazines (25.8%), books (25.1%), speeches (23.8%), blogs (20.1%), newsletters (7.9%), and others (1.8%). Details are at Table 4.4 below.

**TABLE 4.2**

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF MEDIUM USED IN OBTAINING INFORMATION ON THE 1MALAYSIA CONCEPT SORTED BY THE HIGHEST NUMBER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Highest Number</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>TELEVISION</td>
<td>1233</td>
<td>77.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>INTERNET</td>
<td>1017</td>
<td>63.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>NEWSPAPERS</td>
<td>815</td>
<td>50.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>RADIO</td>
<td>694</td>
<td>43.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>BULLETINS</td>
<td>577</td>
<td>36.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>MAGAZINES</td>
<td>412</td>
<td>25.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>BOOKS</td>
<td>402</td>
<td>25.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>SPEECHES</td>
<td>380</td>
<td>23.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>BLOGS</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>20.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For the answer of “others”, respondents stated that the mediums used to obtain information on the 1Malaysia Concept consist of training camps and programmes, National Service Training Camps (Program Latihan Khidmat Negara), novels, posters and campaigns.

Respondents were also inquired on mediums and methods used in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept. These were obtained from statements given to the respondents. They answered by listing their agreements towards the statements. The numbers and percentages in Table 4.5 below are based on the degree of the respondents’ agreement to the statements (Highly Agree to Highly Unagree).

**TABLE 4.3**

**THE FREQUENCY OF MEDIUM USED IN OBTAINING INFORMATION ON THE 1MALAYSIA CONCEPT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Mediums/Methods Used</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Through lessons at Learning Institutions</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>55.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Self effort</td>
<td>775</td>
<td>48.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Courses/Trainings</td>
<td>799</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>795</td>
<td>49.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>607</td>
<td>38.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Table 4.3 above, a majority of the respondents stated that their understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept are obtained through lessons conducted at their Learning Institutions, through self effort in finding information, by attending courses and trainings, as well as via social networks such as Facebook and Twitter.

**OBJECTIVE 3: The level of Malaysian youth understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept.**

Overall, the level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept is high with majority of youth stated their level of understanding at 4.00-4.49=Understand (High). Details of the level of understanding were evaluated by looking at the purpose of the implementation of the 1Malaysia Concept and philosophy behind the introduction of the idea as in Table 4.1.

**TABLE 4.4**

**OVERALL DISTRIBUTION OF THE LEVEL OF MALAYSIAN YOUTH’S UNDERSTANDING OF THE 1MALAYSIA CONCEPT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEVEL OF UNDERSTANDING</th>
<th>MIN</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HIGHLY UNDERSTAND</td>
<td>4.50-5.00</td>
<td>397</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Besides that, the level of understanding is at its highest with an average mean range of 4.00 to 4.21. Item no. 1 – “The nation will only be developed when her people are united” stated the highest level of understanding with a mean score of 4.21 while item no. 10 – “The 1Malaysia Concept is very effective in nurturing unity in a multiracial community” stated the lowest level of understanding with a mean score of 4.00. Further details are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of Understanding</th>
<th>Range</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understand</td>
<td>4.00-4.49</td>
<td>666</td>
<td>41.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Certain</td>
<td>3.50-3.99</td>
<td>426</td>
<td>26.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do Not Understand</td>
<td>2.50-3.49</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highly Do Not Understand</td>
<td>&lt;2.50</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.0 CONCLUSION, IMPLICATIONS OF RESEARCH AND SUGGESTIONS

5.1 Implications of Research

This research validated the statement of YAB Datuk Seri Najib (2011) who believed that majority of the Malaysian people has begun to understand the philosophy behind the 1Malaysia Concept.

The 1Malaysia Concept has been introduced for over four (4) years. In the Government’s effort to promote the idea, it is impossible that Malaysians are still unaware of it. Many Malaysians do acknowledge the existence of the 1Malaysia Concept, but do they really understand it?

This research explored Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept most. We cannot deny the fact that youth still do not fully comprehend, or rather uncertain of this crucial idea. Youth get the information mostly from newspaper and internet. Future researcher may focus on the behavioral aspects of youth and their practices of the 1Malaysia Concept.

This research is limited to 1,600 respondents only. Future research might involve a bigger number of respondents.

Future research might also focus on Sabah, Sarawak and the Federal Territory of Labuan. Research findings might be different as these states have an ethnic composition divide that is far dissimilar to the Peninsular of Malaysia.

Future research might use this instrument with minor revamps so that the results of the analysis might be become better and more validated. Besides that, more respondents should be involved to get improved results.

Other than that future researcher might extend the study of the level of Malaysian’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept towards all Malaysians and not limited to youth only.
5.2 Suggestions

Although this study validated the statement of YAB Datuk Seri Najib (2011) who believed that majority of the Malaysian people has begun to understand the philosophy behind the 1Malaysia Concept, explanatory efforts should be continued in diverse languages such as Mandarin, Cantonese, Tamil, English and the languages of other minority ethnics.

Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept is good, but there is still room for improvement. Youth should be more attentive of the 1Malaysia Concept and related programs as it brings impacts on ethnic relationships and unity. The important thing is youth themselves should endeavor to understand the idea as numerous information on the subject are easily attainable. Youth should also possess good communication and social interaction skills.

Research findings suggest that there is a great potential in youth to understand the 1Malaysia Concept more. Mediums to spread information on the Government’s policies should be broaden to the Internet as this medium has proven to bring greater impacts towards youth’s understanding of the idea. We believe that Internet will also be effective in spreading the Government’s policies to the people of Malaysia.

Explanations on the Government’s policies should begin at school. The implementation of the Government’s policies can benefit all Malaysians and equal justice can be served if it is understood by all.

The involvement of all ethnics is much sought after, and it should be instilled in the younger generation, at school towards the sustainability of interracial unity and the survival of future generation. Besides that, continuous evaluations should be conducted for short and long term interest.

5.3 Conclusion

As explained before, research findings answered research objectives on the identifying mediums and methods used by youth in understanding the 1Malaysia and level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept in general. Overall, the level of Malaysian youth’s understanding of the 1Malaysia Concept is high. However, it can be boost to higher level with explanatory efforts that are more extensive and comprehensive.

Research also shows that the medium most effectively and frequently used in understanding the 1Malaysia Concept are television and internet, majority of the respondents (77.1%) stated that the television as being the most effective, followed by the Internet (63.6%). The mediums most frequently used by Malaysian youth to obtain information on the 1Malaysia Concept, majority of the respondents (83.9%) answered that they most frequently used television, followed by the Internet (67.8%),

68.5% of Malaysian youth admitted that campaigns on 1Malaysia made them aware of the importance of unity. 80.9% of Malaysian youth stated that they understand that the 1Malaysia Concept foster the spirit of cooperation in a multiracial community. Besides that, 79.0% of Malaysian youth stated that they understand that the 1Malaysia Concept emphasizes on interracial unity and harmony.
REFERENCES


Ahmad Shabery Cheek (2010), Semangat 1Belia 1 Malaysia : asas Agenda Hari ini dan Akan Datang, Malaysian Journal of Youth Studies, Jilid 2, Jun 2010, 7-16

Amini Amir Abdullah, “The Concept of 1Malaysia From Islamic Perspectives”, International Conference on Social Sciences, 8 Oktober 2010 – 9 Oktober 2010, Pine Bay Resort, Izmir, Turkey (9/10/2010, Session D2, Room:102,9.00-10.40am)

Amini Amir Abdullah, “The Concept of 1Malaysia From Islamic Perspectives”, FEM Intellectual Discourse, 30 March 2011, Time: 1am-11am, Bilik Sidang, Faculty of Human Ecology, UPM.


Mohd Najib Tun Abdul Razak (2010), Perdana Menteri Malaysia, Gagasan 1Malaysia: 1Belia 1Malaysia, *Malaysian Journal of Youth Studies Jilid 2, Jun 2010, 4-6*


Nik Aziz Nik Pa (2011), Budaya Ketepatan dan Pembinaan JatiDiri 1Malaysia” dalam Sahlan Ismail (Editor), *1Malaysia: Menjana Negara Sejahtera dan Bahagia Menjelang 2020, Petaling Jaya: Iilham Baru Publications dan Center For Glocal Concerns, 105-130.*


Sahlan Ismail (2011) (Editor), *1Malaysia: Menjana Negara Sejahtera dan Bahagia Menjelang 2020, Petaling Jaya: Iilham Baru Publications dan Center For Glocal Concerns,*


Syed Ahmad Lokman Syed Mansur (2009), Perbezaan Antara Gagasan 1Malaysia dengan Malaysian Malaysia, Tanwir: Pencerahan Pemikir Islam, Kuala Lumpur: Jabatan Hal Ehwal Khas (JASA)
Social Media Monitoring in Higher Education: A case study of corporate marketing communications of Bournemouth University and its outreach to Asia

Dr Ana Adi & Nathaniel Hobby
Bournemouth University

ABSTRACT

With increased Internet penetration around the world and the growing adoption of social media platforms, the number of higher education institutions using the new media to reach out to potential students, researchers and staff is growing as well. The higher potential for exposure and engagement also brings a variety of challenges to higher education institutions and their marketing and communication departments, especially monitoring and measuring the success of their online communication efforts when reaching out to geographically and culturally diverse audiences.

Considering this challenge, this paper presents the case of the Marketing and Communications Department of Bournemouth University. Using the department’s review of its current social media monitoring tools, this paper evaluates the outputs provided by listening campaigns initiated by BU during a one-month period monitoring both UK and Asian audiences (mainly from China, Indonesia, Thailand) and their UK university search related conversations. These campaigns will be monitored through three platforms; Meltwater Buzz, Hootsuite and Vocus. Meltwater Buzz (www.meltwater.com) is a public relations dedicated online social media analysis platform, Hootsuite (www.hootsuite.com) acts as a social media management and measurement dashboard while Vocus (www.vocus.com) is primarily a traditional media monitoring tool, with social media monitoring capabilities.

Exploratory in nature, this paper raises valuable questions about the differences in search, reach and engagement in higher education conversations relevant to international recruitment and reputation of UK based HEIs taking place amongst UK and Asia-based audiences. The paper will also assess the ease of use of the monitoring tools used while also proposing a model of how HEIs could monitor social media effectively. In doing so it will evaluate the platforms’ features including multi-user and multi-account management together with their ability to extract conversations based on input keywords and to visualize those
findings through the use of charts enabling practitioners and researchers to get visual cues for further analysis for high amounts of data as well as inform communication strategies. The paper will also propose a discussion of the platforms’ value for money by comparing their price to the features and options offered and the relevance of the outputs to BU’s PR Department searches.

A proposal for how HEIs could use social media monitoring is provided, together with a comparison of the three paid-for social media monitoring platforms used.

Keywords: social media monitoring; social media tools; social media strategy; higher education; Meltwater Buzz; Vocus; Hootsuite
Introduction

With increased Internet penetration around the world and the growing adoption of social media platforms, the number of higher education institutions (HEI) using the new media to reach out to current and potential students, researchers and staff is growing as well. With the increasing competition between higher education institutions both nationally and internationally, the Internet and social media in particular, promise a higher and quicker potential for exposure and engagement with various audiences. This on the other hand brings a variety of challenges to higher education institutions and their marketing and communication departments including the monitoring and measurement of the success of their online communication efforts (Grosseck, 2009).

Considering this challenge, this paper presents the case of the Marketing and Communications Office of Bournemouth University (BU). Using this department’s review of its current social media monitoring tools as a ‘real-life’ opportunity, this paper evaluates the outputs provided by six listening campaigns initiated by BU during a one-month period in July 2013 when it monitored UK and Asian audiences (mainly from China, Indonesia, Thailand) and their UK university search-related conversations.

The paper will, therefore, assess the ease of use of the monitoring tools used while also proposing a model of how HEIs could monitor social media effectively. In doing so it will evaluate the platforms’ features together with their ability to extract conversations based on input keywords and to visualize those findings through the use of charts enabling practitioners and researchers to get visual cues for further analysis for high amounts of data as well as inform communication strategies.

The paper commences by reviewing recent studies into marketing of higher education, then bringing attention to studies about the application of social media in higher education, and the measurement of online communication efforts.

The marketisation of higher education

Discussions about both the role of marketing and marketing communications for higher education institutions and their effectiveness are not new. Grossley (1944) for instance wrote about the relationship that universities need to foster with the communities that host them and their responsibility and accountability towards them. To attain goodwill he argued, a university needs to communicate its image, offer and vision: “(1) through its physical plant,
(2) through its personnel, (3) through its products, and (4) through its report” (p. 340). At a time when communicating the essence of the universities and their image was mostly done by the heads of HEIs, Grossley emphasized the importance of creating long-term relationships through coordinated and planned communications. This was developed in more in depth by Brunner (2005) who examined public relationships and diversity issues at large. Her survey using a seven-point Likert scale using Grunig and Huang’s (2000 cited in Brunner, 2005) relationship indicators (trust, commitment, satisfaction, control mutuality, communal relationships, and exchange relationships) and administered to students a large South-eastern and a mid-sized Midwestern university in the United States, found that students described positive perceptions of their relationship with their respective universities. It also emphasizes the need to expand the scales to include perceptions about globalisation and dialogue between the university and the students.

The marketing vocabulary, however, entered academia only towards the late 1970s (Stricland, 1979). Litten (1980), for instance, questioned its appropriateness to academia. Unlike commercial products that rely of customer loyalty and repeat purchase, the “products” of academia were designed to be purchased only once. This highlighted, Litten argued, a shift in the ways universities perceived their role and a move away from focusing on their social mission alone and into paying more attention to the aspirations and financial possibilities of their target audience.

The increased competition among HEIs on a wider range of issues - better students, more donors, more national and international prestige, higher national and international rankings as well as more loyal alumni (Morris and Cejda, 2001) – brought another shift in the 1990s. While the initial marketing activities of HEIs were associated with recruitment and enrolment, the higher competition saw them paying more attention to integrated marketing for its more strategic approach and its integration of tactics drawn from advertising, public relations, fundraising and recruiting and its subset field, integrated marketing communications.

Hemsley-Brown and Oplatka’s (2006) systematic literature review of higher education marketing between 1992 and 2004 confirmed this: “marketing communications” and “image and reputation” being two of eleven themes they identified. Other themes include market positioning, market planning, transactional marketing and relationship marketing. Looking at marketing communications, Gray et al (2003 cited in Hemsley-Brown and Oplatka, 2006) investigated the media that students use to gain information about foreign universities, the World Wide Web and print media being perceived as the most important sources of
information for Asian markets. Similar results were obtained by Gomes and Murphy’s (2003) study of Internet’s role in marketing international education. Reuben (2008) conducted a survey into the type of social media that HEIs were using and how they used it to reach their target audiences. Managed mostly by the universities’ marketing, communications and public relations departments, Facebook, YouTube and MySpace were among the most frequently used platforms at the time.

As Hemsley-Brown and Oplatka’s (2006) pointed out, many marketing communications studies focused on either student information search behaviour or communication materials. There was a lack, however, both in numbers and depth of studies looking at the elements of the integrated marketing mix or word-of-mouth. This study aims to provide such an example; the analysis it provides being strongly linked with BU’s current communications outputs and the monitoring activities that inform it.

Moreover, in considering the uses of the Internet and social media in higher education, it is their application in the classroom that has been more closely scrutinised than the universities’ marketing communications. McNabb (1994) and Spitzer (2001) discussed interactivity in an online context. Adi (2011) evaluated the use of streaming and live broadcasting technologies into the classroom while providing several case studies. Veelo and Damen (2011) provided a series of recommendations for the use of social media for higher education such as using Twitter to boost student engagement during and outside the classroom. Finally, Adi (2013) proposed a model exercise for social media audits for marketing and public relations courses.

While these studies showed increased awareness and interest in social media, its potential and impact upon education by academics, the need for a similar in-depth inquiry about social media in higher education marketing communications is also needed. Falls’ (2009) call for practitioners to be social media-ready could easily have been applied to marketing communications officers working in HEIs.

**Monitoring and measurement of social media marketing communications**

Social media is a fast-paced and fast-changing environment. Social media are also quickly becoming an important tool in the communication mix (Kaplan and Haenlein, 2011; Scott, 2009). Speaking about public relations, Grunig (2009) suggests that “these new media have the potential to make the profession more global, strategic, two-way and interactive, symmetrical or dialogical, and socially responsible“(p.1). Besides interactivity, intelligence,
individualization and integration that are highly praised benefits of using digital and social media (Chaffee et al, 2009).

However, to be effective as a communication tool, social media needs to follow similar planning, monitoring and evaluation criteria. A vast variety of specialist websites and blogs and more recently books (Blanchard, 2011, Chaffey et al, 2009; Evans, 2010; Lardi & Fuchs, 2013) have provided advice about how to create, manage and implement marketing communication strategies for social media. Similarly, a wide variety of tools that search, monitor, aggregate, manage, measure and visualize are available for prices for prices ranging from free to thousands of pounds per month.

Therefore, besides keeping up to date with the rapid changes of social media and meeting their communications objectives online, communicators face many challenges including manage costs, enhancing productivity and finding the tools that could support their work by providing insight into the big amount of data shared daily online (Dutta, 2010; Kaplan and Haenlein, 2011). This paper aims to address some of those challenges.

**Methodology**

Using the case of the Marketing and Communications Office of Bournemouth University and the department’s current social media monitoring tools, this paper evaluates the outputs provided by listening campaigns initiated by BU during a one-month period monitoring both UK and Asian audiences (mainly from China, Indonesia, Thailand) and their UK university search related conversations. Three platforms were used: Meltwater Buzz, Hootsuite and Vocus. Meltwater Buzz (www.Meltwater.com) is a social media public relations listening tool. It allows users to register multiple accounts. It also enables keywords searches to help monitor, analyse and directly engage with the social media audience via the platform’s dashboard. Hootsuite (www.hootsuite.com) acts as a social media management and measurement dashboard that allows users to set up multiple social media accounts. It also allows users to post and respond to social media comments directly from the dashboard. The platform also offers keyword searches and an analytics option. Vocus (www.vocus.com) is a traditional media-monitoring tool (broadcast, online and print). It also offers a social media monitoring functionality, with the ability to analyse and chart searches.

Exploratory in nature, this paper aims to observe and discuss the differences in search, reach and engagement with Bournemouth University as resulting from social media conversations captured by the three monitoring tools.
Social media is a central part of BU’s marketing communications, monitoring of social media content providing the department with insight into the general online “talk” about the university as well as enabling them to identify new leads and react to potential issues. In an effort to send the right messages to the right people, the BU marketing and communications department has set up multiple social media accounts, all of them addressing a different target group. Both Facebook and Twitter have one general corporate account that is used to talk to the university’s audience as a whole. However, specifically on Facebook, other pages have been set up to talk to a subset of the university’s wide audience. Undergraduate pages have been set up for each year of entry to talk to students who are thinking about coming to study at BU. Advice and information can be tailored to pre-university students on these pages without alienating other stakeholders who may not find the information as useful. Similarly, students who join the university are invited to like the “We’ve Arrived” page for each year of entry to receive information about Bournemouth University that is specific to them.

There is one International specific social media page, housed on Facebook and managed by the International team at the university. This page is promoted among future BU students who live internationally as a way to connect with the university. Tools like Meltwater Buzz, Vocus and Hootsuite have therefore been fundamental in the discovery of “new online talk” about BU as well as in managing the content shared from the multiple accounts held as the university seeks to break new ground. This review is also aimed to help the university to understand its Asian audiences better and guide how to interact with them.

Data collection

Six listening campaigns were created with the intention of having two searches to set up for each platform: one to examine the capability of the platform to find posts from a BU’s UK-based audience and one that looked at the posts created by BU’s Asian audience, more specifically those based in Thailand, Indonesia and China. However, at the set up stage, the platforms chosen did not allow for all the search criteria to be implemented. This led to the keywords and listening campaigns being adapted. Table 1 shows the keywords used.

Bournemouth University has been monitoring social media channels over the past two years for posts that contain information or opinion about the university. Over time it has become evident that the word ‘university’ or ‘uni’ needs to be added to keyword parameters to filter out other results mentioning Bournemouth generally (either as references to the town or its sports teams). By narrowing downs the search parameters for instances where
Bournemouth is mentioned in relation to the university, the chances of finding the results and post that are of higher relevance and interest to the university are maximized. Using this insight the search queries developed included the following variations: “Bournemouth University”, “Bournemouth Uni”. The misspelled “Bournmouth Uni” was also added to the list as a means to verify the search outputs and based on an assumption of possible misspellings of an unfamiliar proper noun.

To widen the amount of data mined for and ensure that content generated from the countries envisaged was captured, country names were also added to the keyword search list: Indonesia, Thailand, China. Additionally, the Indonesian terms, “beasiswa” and “beasiswaindo”, were also added to the list. These two words refer to a social media profile in Indonesia that targets students and shares information about UK universities and their scholarships. Similar to the country names inclusion in the list, this ensured that content about Bournemouth University generated in Indonesia was captured.

Boolean search terms (AND, OR, and NOT) were used to create a more accurate search when analysing social media outputs on Vocus and Meltwater Buzz. Their use gave researchers a greater ability to search for mentions of Bournemouth University in relation to other terms of interest. For instance, “Bournemouth AND university AND beasiswa OR beasiswaindo OR Indonesia OR China OR Thailand” was the criteria for one of the searches on Meltwater Buzz. This allowed for all the mentions of Bournemouth University, not Bournemouth town for instance, to be searched at once alongside with the other terms. Hootsuite does not have this feature.

The data was collected and recorded during the month of July 2013. Table 1 shows the search queries used and the results they yielded.

**Analysis Criteria**

The data collected was used to analyse the platforms themselves rather than the mentions, conversations and online discourses about Bournemouth University. The analysis criteria used, and generated as a result of consultation with the marketing communications team at BU and BU’s communication strategy, included:

- the depth of the search function (the ability of the platform to find posts based on entered keywords),
- the type of analysis tools provided (visualisations, charts, extraction, sentiment)
• the platform’s features (multi-user and multi-account management)
• the existence or absence of data export features.

Results and discussion

Depth of search function:

Meltwater Buzz generated the most results during the one-month period of data collection and analysis. In the Meltwater Buzz test that produced the greatest number of posts, 152 individual clips were recorded. This enabled a more in-depth analysis of the target audience and provided the team with insight into the communication interests and patterns of target groups. This, in turn, should enable the team to create more bespoke content that will further attract these audiences.

Vocus’ inability to conduct backdated searches limited the amount of data collected to results generated from the launch date of the search. This was reflected in the results of the search campaign.

Table 1. Meltwater Buzz, Hootsuite and Vocus results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEST</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Interaction count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meltwater Test One</td>
<td>&quot;Bournemouth University&quot; AND indonesia OR thailand OR china OR beasiswa OR beasiswaindo</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meltwater Test Two</td>
<td>Bournemouth AND University AND indonesia OR china OR thailand OR beasiswa OR beasiswaindo</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meltwater Test Three</td>
<td>.@bournemouthuni AND china OR thailand OR indonesia OR beisiswa OR beasiswaindo</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meltwater Test Four</td>
<td>&quot;Bournemouth Uni&quot; AND indonesia OR china OR thailand OR beasiswa OR beasiswaindo</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meltwater Test Five</td>
<td>Bournemouth AND uni AND indonesia OR beasiswa OR beasiswaindo OR thailand OR china</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meltwater Test Six</td>
<td>Bournemouth (note spelling) AND uni AND indonesia OR beasiswa OR beasiswaindo OR thailand OR china</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Hootsuite Social Media Keyword Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEST</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Interaction count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hootsuite Test One</td>
<td>Bournemouth University Thailand, Bournemouth Uni Thailand</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hootsuite Test Two</td>
<td>Beasiswa Bournemouth, Beasiswaindo Bournemouth, Indonesia Bournemouth</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hootsuite Test Three</td>
<td>Bournemouth University China, Bournemouth Uni China, Bournemouth Uni China</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Vocus Social Media Keyword Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEST</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Interaction count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vocus Keyword set up 1</td>
<td>&quot;Bournemouth University&quot; AND indonesia OR china OR thailand OR beasiswa OR beasiswaindo</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocus Keyword set up 2</td>
<td>&quot;Bournemouth Uni&quot; AND indonesia OR chinna OR thailand OR beasiswa OR beasiswaindo</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hootsuite did not allow for any form of backdated searching, as well, which led to difficulties in collating results. This meant that higher risks of data loss were possible and so alternative archival solutions, such as a printout of the content and the reports at regular intervals, were needed. Of the three platforms, Meltwater Buzz was, therefore, the best at retaining and searching for posts based on the selected keywords.

Furthermore, by comparing the search options provided by Meltwater Buzz, the platform provided the most search options for social media channels. This allowed for a greater reach when finding posts based on the search parameters.

Vocus was limited to Twitter, Facebook and LinkedIn while Hootsuite also provided monitoring opportunities for Google+, WordPress and Foursquare. Meltwater Buzz’ analyses also included message boards, forums and blogs, a feature to the advantage of those searching for posts that mention names or specific content as it enables the analysis of a higher proportion of social media channels, increasing thus the likelihood of finding more content.

The results mined could be analysed for trends and incorporated into content posted in future from BU’s social media platforms. For instance, in BU’s case, the data collected showed that some students are interested in scholarship and bursary information. To further capture the interest from potential students audiences, it may be appropriate to widen the
search to any students talking about scholarships and bursaries in relation to UK universities. Bournemouth University may then be able to proactively send information to students who are seeking this information about universities generally, widening their market.

A number of the posts found were messages from recruitment organisations offering helpful content to students. Accounts such as @beasiswaindo (with over 700,000 followers) and @ScholarshipsUK (with their 82,000 followers) regularly post updates about Bournemouth University scholarships on Twitter. These messages would be considered as “new leads” by the public relations team and, in a real-life scenario, would provide information that team should follow-up on. Furthermore, depending on the content of the tweets, additional search criteria could be developed to expand and include the new leads.

With regard to content searched or translated in a different language, the platforms provided little insight. While the platforms did not provide a translation option, access to content in a different language was also restricted by other factors. For instance, access to western social platforms is limited and strictly monitored in China, requiring connection via VPN (Carsten, 2013). This means that only a limited number of Chinese students interested in studying abroad are able to access platforms like Twitter or Facebook. As a result of this limitation, more Chinese students are prone to use alternative China-only platforms such as RenRen and Sina Weibo that offer services similar in style to those of western-based and western-operating social media platforms. Since the services are China-based and are aimed at a Chinese speaking population, it is highly likely that the content shared will be in Chinese. With Meltwater, Vocus and Hootsuite not having access to Chinese-based social media platforms nor having features that enable keyword translation, their search results therefore exclude a potentially wide amount of data that could be of high relevance. For this research project, none of the keyword searches undertaken yielded a single response from China. Future searches, therefore, should consider including the foreign language translation of the search query in order to ensure that conversations not in English are captured. Especially with languages that use a different alphabet, as many Asian languages do, translation of institutional names and names of cities becomes a necessity.

While the platforms used play an important role in monitoring and managing English conversations, they have limitations when it comes to capturing and providing in-depth analysis of social media conversations outside their traditional area of operation. In this case, the search queries used yielded more results and captured more conversations from Indonesia and the USA. This is also confirmed by the 152 mentions captured by Meltwater Buzz and could be in large a attributed to the inclusion in the search terms of @BeasiswaIndo, an
Indonesia-based and Indonesia-focused social media account. When compared with posts mentioning/originating from China or Thailand, Indonesia proved to be the country with users most engaged with finding content and information about Bournemouth University through social media channels. The Meltwater Buzz chart (Figure 1 below) provides analysis to support assertions that Indonesia gave the highest mention rate, the English keywords used also generating interest in the USA as the second biggest region. While the USA did not represent the focus on the current research, the amount of content mined indicates an increasing interest and visibility of Bournemouth University in the Northern Hemisphere as well.

Twitter was the primary source of engagement with BU from overseas as Meltwater Buzz Figure 2 shows. The results indicate that Twitter had the highest interaction rates. Any monitoring platform used in the future must therefore be able to analyse Twitter. This can be undertaken with all the three analysis platforms evaluated by this research as they actively monitor Twitter as a standard part of their service.

Figure 1. Meltwater Buzz chart of messages by location

Figure 2. Meltwater Buzz chart of conversations by channel
The incorrect spellings yielded no results and may indicate that either the chosen misspelling was not representative or that, in most instances, Bournemouth was spelt correctly. No conversations were recorded through LinkedIn, despite being monitored by all three channels. This shows that LinkedIn is not a platform regularly used by Bournemouth University’s international audience.

**Analysis tools provided, platform features and data export**

The output of the social media content analysis is usually presented in a chart form, providing thus more depth and a visual interpretation of the data (Adi and Moloney, 2012). All three platforms have the capability of creating charts that analyse the posts found. Meltwater Buzz and Vocus provided word clouds that indicated the most frequent tags and keywords as Figure 3 shows. In Meltwater Buzz word clouds are generated based on the aggregated posts mined and represented based on their frequency – the bigger the word or expression, the more frequent the word is. Word clouds, therefore, provide a quick insight into the emerging popular trends.
Each platform also provided charts on influencers, geographic data and day-by-day analysis. These helped build up a more complete picture of data and allowed explorations from various perspectives such as common topics spoken about and geographical locations of users, depending on the search and monitoring objectives. Information related to the time, place, sentiment and content of the conversations of the target audience about the inputted key terms can provide useful detail to develop more effective content plans. For instance, information given by Meltwater Buzz suggesting that Twitter was a primary source of conversation amongst Bournemouth University’s audience (see figure 1) would allow the team to make their communication efforts platform-specific generating content fits both the formatting requirements of the platform as well as the interests of the identified target audience.

Hootsuite, however, does not include charts and visualisations in its standard form making the evaluation of its features exceed the parameters set for this project. Marketing and Communications offices could make the decision to purchase “credits” through the Hootsuite system that would allow for chart creation and a greater depth of analysis. Moreover, it does not have the capability to export the mined data into an easy format, such as a PDF or Microsoft document.
Discussion and conclusion

This research used the timely evaluation of the paid-for social media analysis tools, Meltwater Buzz, Hootsuite and Vocus, for the monitoring activities of the Marketing and Communications Department. Instead of focusing on the role of the Internet in marketing international education (Gomes and Murphy, 2003) or on the ways in which higher education institutions use social media (Reuben, 2008), this research focused on the tools used to monitor social media content reflecting thus wider communications concerns, spanning beyond higher education (Blanchard, 2011, Chaffey et al, 2009; Evans, 2010; Lardi & Fuchs, 2013).

Of the three platforms analysed, Meltwater Buzz provided the most extensive search results as well as the most analysis and data export features. Moreover, the bespoke social media analysis tool was easy to navigate and offered helpful tips for setting up keyword searches (including advice on using Boolean words) and the depth of data, features not provided by the other two platforms.

In terms of search results, the listening campaigns generated limited data. This could be a relevant limitation because of the restricted nature of the search, as the time of the year when the listening campaigns were undertaken when most northern hemisphere students were on, holiday. The results, however, indicated that more work is needed to identify target market in Asia and engage with them through social media. This was an exploratory study aiming to test the platforms and focused only on the general volume of results that they yield. For a listening campaign to be effective and drive strategic insight however, more information about the target audience would enable further filtering of the results. This includes additional research into social media usage patterns in each country of interest as well as more in-depth information about how universities communicate with prospective students.

The results of the listening campaigns also emphasize the need for keyword searches to include translations. While Meltwater Buzz provided suggestions for improved Boolean searches and key term combinations, neither the platform nor the other two platforms tested enabled translation. This was particularly relevant for searches of content in languages that have a different alphabet or alternative spellings of common names of places or institutions. By including the names of the countries of relevance, this research captured some data that either included geographical stamps or mentioned the country in their conversation. However, this did not guarantee the search of content in Thai or Chinese for instance due to
the lack of translation. The inclusion of language-specific search terms and the mining of language-specific content, however, brings further challenges. Those in charge of monitoring these campaigns will require knowledge or further translation assistance to understand the mined content and engage with the publics identified. This is, perhaps, one of the biggest challenges of social media monitoring of international content and certainly a challenge for marketing and communication departments of higher education institutions as well. Close working with the institution’s International Team may be necessary in order to use their knowledge of international markets and languages to further enhance the capability of the team to search for posts that are written in another language, or using another alphabet.

**Social media tools and higher education**

This review has prompted the team to revisit their online activity and in particular their online listening and content management strategy. Using the team’s example, and the results of the current research, higher education institutions interested in using social media should consider and clarify:

- The role that social media plays in their wider communication strategy (whether recruitment, reputation, research dissemination)
- The target audiences (this implies a thorough analysis of the access and skills of the public targeted but also of the knowledge and language skills of the team managing the communications).
- The human resources available for social media on a daily basis. In the current, multimedia climate it has become of paramount importance that proper resource is given to a social media post within an institution. This study has shown the value of analysing social media and social media is no longer simply the act of posting content online. The analysis emphasized the importance of trends research, online monitoring and content planning to reflect and address those trends. Furthermore, the need to constantly monitor social media (for mentions and direct contact the institution may have from its audience) and provide timely responses to the posts mined highlight the heavy human resource investment needed.
- The financial resources available for social media monitoring, management and measurement.
The recommendation from this study is for the use of a social media monitoring tool that allows for in-depth analysis and searches of multiple social media platforms to enable higher education institutions to tailor their content for their individual audiences.

References


Grosseck, G. (2009) To use or not to use web 2.0 in higher education? *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 1*(1), 478-482.


ABSTRACT

Using the mail survey research methodology, this study is aimed to study the current status of integrated marketing communications (IMC) in Thailand. Three main aspects are examined accordingly: 1) general opinion and perception on the concept of IMC, 2) perceived satisfactions on IMC practices, and 3) perceived barriers to IMC practices. The data were collected with 122 marketers and 109 advertising practitioners in Thailand. The findings showed there was a good indication of acceptance and practices toward the integration among Thai marketers and advertising practitioners. The results also presented that both groups consistently perceived the main aspects of IMC examined, including client-agency relationship in IMC. In addition, Thai market characteristic tended to be more relationship-oriented marketing, and that inclined to change to interactive IMC. Finally, it could be concluded that the status IMC in Thailand has been currently moved to the third level regarding the level of integration proposed by D. Schultz and H. Schultz (1998).

Introduction

Because of economical, social, and technological changes, the market circumstance was accordingly changed. Previously, the market focused on massive production, but now turning into so-called customer-centric market. Consumer behavior has also changed including media consumption, product and service consumption. All these changes including media fragmentation, message credibility, and higher competition, etc., drove integrated marketing communications (IMC) to play an important role in marketing communications. IMC, emerged in 1990s, has been recognized as a marketing concept focusing on unified messages and communications across all channels around customers (Duncan & Everett, 1993).

IMC, currently, has been prevailed and used across the U.S. where this marketing strategy was initiated, and across the world. With its benefits, both marketers and advertising practitioners pay more interest and support the IMC concept by implementing the IMC principle in their organizations. Including Thailand, IMC started around early 1990s and has been popular since then. However, with regards to Anantachart’s research in 2003, the result found that IMC was implemented only the early stage among marketers and advertising practitioners, according to D. Schultz and H. Schultz (1998)’s levels of integration. As the time goes by, IMC concept in Thailand might be more developed and utilized. Therefore, this research is aimed to explore the current status of IMC in Thailand to identify if there
have been any changes on perceptions, satisfactions, and obstacles of Thai marketers and advertising practitioners after the previous research.

**Starting with IMC Conceptualizations**

Initially, IMC is defined by the American Association of Advertising Agencies (4As) as the planning activity that recognizes the added value of a comprehensive plan which evaluates the strategic roles of various communications tools, and combines them to provide clarity, consistency, and maximum communications impact (Caywood, D. Schultz, & Wang, 1991). From this viewpoint, integration focuses on the process and requires maintaining a clear and consistent image, position, message, and theme across all marketing communications tools used. In other words, this is what Nowak and Phelps (1994) term *one voice* marketing communications.

Later on, D. Schultz and his colleagues revise the IMC definition by placing more emphasis on customers and brand-customer relationship building while Duncan adds various stakeholder groups as the other key targets that any company must concern in doing IMC (Duncan & Caywood, 1996). With the coming of digitalization, information technology, intellectual property, and new communication systems, D. Schultz and Kitchen (2000) finally come up with taking IMC as a strategic process used to plan, develop, execute, and evaluate coordinated measurable, persuasive brand communications programs over time, with both customers and other relevant external and internal audiences.

Meanwhile, with the same thought of stressing on the process of managing various relationships that could drive brand values, Duncan (2005) redefines IMC as the cross-functional process to create and maintain long-term relationships with customers and other stakeholders. This is done by controlling and influencing all brand messages as well as encouraging data-driven and purposeful dialogues with the targets to provide creativity, integration, and communication impact.

After reviewing existing definitions of IMC, Kliatchko (2005, 2008, 2009) comes up with four core pillars underlining IMC. That is, IMC should be stakeholders focused (i.e., both internal and external targets), contents concerned (i.e., planned and unplanned messages), channels centered (i.e., multiple tools and new media), and results driven (i.e., behavioral and attitudinal responses). In addition, these four structures must be concerned under the strategic management of brand communications program which is operated by the entire organization.

Recently, as technological advances become imperative among marketers in doing businesses and play an important part of consumer lives, the interactive IMC concept is introduced by Peltier, Schibrowsky, D. Schultz, and Zahay (2006). By developing and implementing consumer databases, they would help marketers get more understanding on consumer behavior, better serve consumer needs, and better meet consumer complicated expectations (D. Schultz & H. Schultz, 1998). Gurau (2008) and Mulhern (2009) add that consumers in the digital age are very active and smart in searching, surfing, and seeking any information they want. That is why marketers have to catch up with their behavior by taking interactive communication alternatives into consideration.

In conclusion, though the development of definitions of IMC seem to depend upon one’s personal perspective rather than a generally agreed-upon approach (Stewart, 1996), recent definitions of IMC sound consistent in terms of expressing the process of creating meaningful messages to communicate with customers and other stakeholders in order to generate long-term relationships and build brand equity. And such efforts could only be done through the work of various traditional and interactive functions available for the organization.
Looking What Drives and Obstructs IMC

Recently, significant changes and trends in the marketing and communications environment that have contributed to the growing importance of IMC include media fragmentation, advances in audience assessment, consumer empowerment, message clutter, retail power, brand and product proliferation, price sensitivity, and accountability (Duncan, 2005). D. Schultz and Kitchen (2000) also stress that information technology is the building block of the development and implementation of any IMC program. Such trends make IMC become critical in communicating with any type of targets. For example, as many communication channels are available nowadays, consumers are less reliant on mass media. Other marketing communications options (e.g., public relations, direct marketing, special event, social media) might receive more emphasis instead.

Yet, the theory of IMC has usually been failed or could not be fully adopted in a practical manner due to the significant structural and functional barriers to its implementation (Percy, 1997; Pettegrew, 2000-2001; D. Schultz et al., 1993). They are, for example, vertical organizational structure, too many functional specialists working independently, low standing of marketing communications within companies, rigid organizational cultures. A fully integrated company requires a great deal of development process, for example, a cross-functional approach, a new type of compensation system, core competencies, a database management system that tracks customer interactions, strategic consistency in all brand messages, marketing of the company’s mission, and zero-based marketing planning (Duncan & Moriarty, 1997). To add more serious thought, Yastrow (1999-2000) further points out that no choice is available for the IMC challenge. Well-articulated and well-adjusted companies with a customer-focused mindset would be the only winners in the current battlefield of business.

Such goals could be implemented as an ongoing process through what Stewart (1996) calls a continuous learning organization. That is, changes and improvement in personnel and organization might be gradually proceeded as it moves towards IMC. Alternatively, Prensky, McCarty, and Lucas (1996) offer short-term and long-term business strategies to convert a company into an IMC-driven one, by first recognizing and organizing on its competitive advantages, and finally remaking its organizational structure, culture, and politics to ensure its viability.

Researching Client-Agency Relationship in IMC

One of the key elements of working towards IMC is to maintain a good, purposeful, and long-termed relationship between the main players in the process. While customers and other stakeholders are always the center of IMC planning programs, marketing companies, marketing communications agencies, and various media are the critical surrounding components (Duncan, 2005). Gould, Grein, and Lerman (1999) mention that appropriate cooperation and links between client companies and their marketing communications agencies could help achieve the authentic integration that facilitates a common goal and mutual interest. It, nonetheless, is always the challenge to make outside agencies support the IMC programs (Gronstedt, 1996a).

While past research on client-agency relationship (e.g., Michell, 1986; Prendergast & Shi, 2001; Wackman, C. T. Salmon, & C. C. Salmon, 1987) focus on issues related to the agency selection and relationship life cycle, efforts on defining the quality of relationship have been rare. Among a few, Gronstedt (1996b), drawing from the total quality management (TQM) areas, describes the client-agency relationship in IMC as the close collaborative one, a condition that both parties, considered partners, create new values together. Hutton (1996) also offers the humanistic view of IMC relationships that stresses a harmonic connection between parties that allow for win-win and synergistic relationships.
Although IMC calls for neutrality in communications tools used to reach targets, past IMC studies (e.g., Abratt & Cowan, 1999; Caywood et al., 1991; Duncan & Everett, 1993) identify that advertising agencies are more likely to handle multiple communications tasks than other marketing communications agencies. Kerr and Drennan (2010) indicate that advertising agencies still play a crucial role in IMC programs of most companies, but the opportunity to use other communications tools make coordination and integration much more challenging than in the past. Beard (1997) also finds that marketers using the IMC approach are more satisfied with their advertising agencies and have less conflict and stress associated with the relationship.

Therefore, the current study intends to examine the perceptions of the two key players in IMC practices, that is, marketing companies and advertising agencies. The main objective is to inspect how they similarly or differently look at IMC. While there have been a few research studies investigating the IMC practices in non-Western countries, this study was conducted with Thai practitioners. As an open country, Thailand has long accepted Western concepts and knowledge, including IMC, and adjusted such gains with Thai cultures and ways of living.

**Method**

To learn about the opinions and perceptions of Thai marketers and advertising practitioners, self-administered, mailed questionnaires were used as an instrument to collect survey data in this research. Questions were borrowed and adapted from previous studies in the IMC areas (i.e., Anantachart, Leelahabooneim, & Nakwilai, 2008; Beard, 1997; Kliatchko, 2008; McArthur & Griffin, 1997; Nowak, Cameron, & DeLorme, 1996; Peltier, Schibrowsky, & D. Schultz, 2003; Phelps & Johnson, 1996; Reid, 2005; D. Schultz & Kitchen, 1997). The questions for both marketers and advertising practitioners were planned to make them parallel and comparable in most parts. This resulted in 64 and 65 questions for marketers and advertising practitioners, respectively.

Since Thailand is not an English-speaking country, the researchers first translated all questions in the questionnaires into Thai language, with the similar sequences as original. Then, two Thai advertising professors who completed their graduate degrees in the U.S. checked for the correctness of the translation.

Two comprehensive business source books (Marittanaporn, 2012; Shrestha, 2012) were used as frameworks to draw the samples. After removing redundant names, the marketer sample was 529 managers in local and international companies operating their businesses in Thailand. The advertising practitioner sample was 531 managers in local and international advertising agencies. The survey procedures were as follows: (1) a package composed of a cover letter, a questionnaire, and a postage-paid envelope was mailed; (2) a follow-up letter was sent and phone calls were made to the non-returned samples after waiting for four weeks. By the cut-off date, 122 marketers and 109 advertising practitioners returned the questionnaires and all were usable while 16 and 36 were undelivered, respectively. These resulted in a 23.8% response rate for marketers, and a 22.0% response rate for advertising practitioners.

**Findings**

For the marketer samples, 63 (55%) were marketing managers/directors who were responsible for their companies’ marketing communications programs. Fifteen respondents (13%) were top management in their companies. More than three of fourth of the marketer respondents have spent time with their current companies between one and ten years, with an
average of nine years. Most of their educational levels were graduate degrees (69%) and undergraduate degrees (28%). Sixty-one percent of the sample considered themselves devoting 25 to 74% of their time to the areas of marketing communications while 25 percent devoted more than 74%.

The samples from advertising agencies were mainly composed of 48 key client service personnel (44%) and 22 top management (20%). The average of years that the samples have worked with their current agencies was nine. Fifty-five and 43 percent of the respondents hold graduate and undergraduate degrees, respectively. Fifty-three samples (51%) mentioned that their agencies’ billings were more than 100 million baht while the rest had less than 100 million baht billings. Forty-nine percent of the samples considered themselves devoting 50% or more of their time to IMC programs on behalf of client companies while another 33 percent devoted 25-49% of their time to do so.

In the beginning, when familiarity and agreement with the IMC term, along with Duncan’s (2005) IMC definition, were asked, both groups of respondents replied with high scores. Based on five-pointed scales, the marketers said that they were familiar with the term at 4.24 while the advertising practitioners did at 4.39 (t = -1.32, p = .19). Similarly, when asking about their agreements with the given definition, both groups answered so at 4.12 (for marketers) and 4.24 (for advertising practitioners) (t = -1.24, p = .21).

As this study wanted to explore the current status of IMC from Thai marketers and advertising practitioners’ views, the next question dealt with how they interpreted the relationship between each other when developing and implementing the IMC concept.

Table 1 presents the four alternatives of client-marketing communications agency relationship. The samples from both groups tended to agree that client companies and their marketing communications agencies should set communications strategies together, then each communications function would be executed by different agencies (44% and 43% for marketers and advertising practitioners, respectively). Nevertheless, another 36% of the marketers mentioned that client companies alone should determine communications strategies and assign individual communications functions to individual marketing communications agencies (but all these communications suppliers stay in touch with each other) while another 33% of the advertising practitioners said that client companies and their only one marketing communications agency should collectively set communications strategies, then this one-stop shopping agency should administer executions of all of the communications functions.

### Table 1: Perceptions of Marketers and Advertising Practitioners on the Client-Marketing Communications Agency Relationships Following the IMC Concept*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>Marketers</th>
<th></th>
<th>Ad Practitioners</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A client company and its marketing communications agencies collectively set communications strategies, then each communications function is executed by a different agency</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>44.3%</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>42.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A client company and its only one marketing communications agency collectively set communications strategies, then this “one-stop shopping” agency administers executions of all of</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13.0%</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the communications functions

A client company alone determines communications strategies and assigns individual communications functions to individual marketing communications agencies, but all these communications suppliers stay in touch with each other

A client company alone determines overall communications strategies, then each communications function is executed by a different marketing communications agency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Marketers (M)</th>
<th>Ad Practitioners (M)</th>
<th>t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>An IMC program would increase the impact of a marketing communications program.</td>
<td>4.50</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>-0.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over the next 3 years, most of the new ideas in marketing communications will come from advertising agencies.</td>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>-5.70*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An IMC program would provide client companies with greater consistency in their marketing communications.</td>
<td>4.28</td>
<td>4.28</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The idea of presenting “one voice” and “one brand personality” will increase in importance.</td>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>-0.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An integrated marketing communications program would eliminate the miscommunication (or lack of communication) that can occur when several agencies are used.</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>-0.40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note.** *This study used the IMC definition by Duncan (2005): A concept and process of planning, executing, and monitoring the brand messages which recognize synergy among marketing communications disciplines to provide creativity, integration and communication impact to create customer relationships.*

**χ² (3, 223) = 16.75, p < .01.*

Marketers vs. Advertising Practitioners’ Opinions on IMC

The main part was composed of 43 Likert-typed, five-point-scaled questions asking about respondent’s general opinions on IMC utilizations (22 items), perceived satisfaction on IMC (12 items), and perceived barriers towards IMC (9 items). First, the results of items regarding the general opinions on IMC utilizations are presented in Table 2.

Table 2: Comparisons of Marketers’ and Advertising Practitioners’ General Opinions on IMC Utilizations
An integrated marketing communications program would reduce the cost of client companies’ marketing communications program.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Marketers (M)</th>
<th>Ad Practitioners (M)</th>
<th>t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>An IMC program would enable client companies to maintain more control over their marketing communications</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>1.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An advertising agency responsible for IMC can come up with solutions faster</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>3.63</td>
<td>-1.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Client companies would be willing to compensate advertising agencies for the additional responsibility of developing an IMC plan.</td>
<td>3.43</td>
<td>3.43</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An IMC program is likely to be supported by client companies’ top management.</td>
<td>4.57</td>
<td>4.55</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An IMC program would increase the impact of a marketing communications program.</td>
<td>4.03</td>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>-0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An IMC program would increase client companies’ competitive advantages.</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>4.26</td>
<td>-0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Client companies are more inclined to hire marketing communications agencies who understand IMC.</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>-2.02*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From the outset of a new marketing communications campaign, client companies should select a common strategy that unifies their advertising, sales promotion, public relations, and direct marketing.</td>
<td>4.07</td>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>-0.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cutting the costs of your advertising, sales promotion, public relations, and direct marketing is an extremely important goal in client companies’ marketing communications program.</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td>2.01*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising, sales promotion, public relations, and direct marketing each should have its own independent goals.</td>
<td>2.52</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td>-1.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Client companies should revise their IMC plans regularly.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Marketing Practitioners</th>
<th>Marketers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Client companies’ strategic brand communication plans would benefit most from utilizing various marketing communications tools together.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Marketing Practitioners</th>
<th>Marketers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.77</td>
<td>3.72</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ultimate goal of client companies’ brand communication plan is to build and maintain relationship with all stakeholder groups.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Marketing Practitioners</th>
<th>Marketers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Client companies have already included new media in their current IMC plans.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Marketing Practitioners</th>
<th>Marketers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>0.40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note.  

*Each statement is a five-pointed scale ranging from strongly disagree (1) to strongly agree (5).  

bThe alpha coefficients for the marketers and advertising practitioners were .80 and .84, respectively.  

*p < .05

Among 22 items shown here, both groups tended to have similar opinions on IMC practices. The top five items that the marketers and advertising practitioners had most positive opinions are as follow. First, an IMC program should be supported by client companies’ top management (Ms = 4.57 and 4.55 for marketers and advertising practitioners, respectively). Second, an IMC program would increase the impact of a marketing communications program (M = 4.50 for marketers and M = 4.54 for advertising practitioners, respectively). The next two items are that the idea of presenting one voice and one brand personality will increase in importance (Ms = 4.30 and 4.35 for marketers and advertising practitioners, respectively), and an IMC program would provide client companies with greater consistency in their marketing communications (Ms = 4.28 for both groups). And the fifth one is that an IMC program would increase client companies’ competitive advantages (M = 4.50 for marketers and M = 4.54 for advertising practitioners, respectively).

However, the advertising practitioners showed much higher levels of agreement than the marketers on the statements relating to the IMC practices by them. Elaborately, the former tended to believe that, in the near future, most of the new ideas in marketing communications will come from advertising agencies (M = 3.84), and that client companies would be more inclined to hire marketing communications agencies who understand IMC (M = 4.00). Oppositely, the marketers had a more positive perception than the advertising practitioners that cutting the costs of their advertising, sales promotion, public relations, and direct marketing would be an extremely important goal in their companies’ marketing communications program.

Next, twelve questions on perceived satisfaction on IMC were asked. The results showed that both marketers and advertising practitioners agreed on most items in the same ways. For instance, that is an IMC program would provide client companies with greater strategic and creative consistency in their marketing communications, that is an IMC program would force their staff to learn various marketing communications tools and new media, and that is the IMC concept benefits their businesses. In addition, the advertising practitioners showed much higher levels of agreement than the marketers on two statements. First, an IMC program would enable client companies to work with various marketing communications agencies (M for advertising practitioners = 4.21, M for marketers = 4.00, t = 
Second, having an IMC program with one advertising agency gives client companies greater control of the marketing communications budget ($M$ for advertising practitioners = 3.75, $M$ for marketers = 3.40, $t = -2.60, p = .01$).

Last, the other nine questions in this part dealt with perceived barriers towards IMC. What they both saw as barriers to IMC practices look mostly similar. For example, they agreed that client companies’ staff lacks the expertise that is required to properly manage an IMC program, that an IMC program would increase the cost of a marketing communications program, and that an IMC program would require additional staff to coordinate the program. Nevertheless, the only item that the marketers had significantly stronger opinion than the advertising practitioners is that an IMC program would be difficult to operate because advertising agencies would lack knowledge about more than one marketing communications areas ($Ms = 3.00$ and 2.70 for marketers and advertising practitioners, respectively, $t = 2.03, p = .04$).

### Database Usage

To effectively work on IMC nowadays, databases are one of the key tools to be utilized to serve consumers and customers’ needs. Hence, four questions on database usage were asked. The results in Table 3 indicate that 114 marketers (95%) mentioned that their companies have already had consumer databases. Beyond that, 80 percent of them (90 respondents) have had such databases for more than three years while another 15 percent (17 respondents) have had them for one to three years. For the advertising practitioners, 84 of them (77%) confirmed that their clients have already used consumer databases. Moreover, 62 percent of this number (50 respondents) has had the databases for more than three years.

#### Table 3: Database Usage and the Time of Use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marketers*</th>
<th>Having databases</th>
<th>114</th>
<th>95.0</th>
<th>Not having databases</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>5.0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>When used?</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td>When to use?</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 6 months ago</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td></td>
<td>Within the next 3 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past 6-12 months</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td></td>
<td>Past 6-12 months</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past 1-3 years</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Past 1-3 years</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 3 years ago</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>80.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>More than 3 years ago</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>61.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advertising Practitioners</th>
<th>Clients having databases</th>
<th>84</th>
<th>77.1</th>
<th>Clients not having databases</th>
<th>25</th>
<th>22.9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>When used?</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td>When to use?</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past 6-12 months</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>Within the next 3 years</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past 1-3 years</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30.9</td>
<td></td>
<td>Within the next 4-5 years</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 3 years ago</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>61.7</td>
<td></td>
<td>Not in the next 5 years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>41.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note.* *Missing cases = 2
Further findings show that 45 and 40 percent of the marketers and advertising practitioners, respectively, indicate that their companies/clients utilized consumer databases for the purpose of customer-brand relationship development. Meanwhile, the media planning and direct mailing purposes were the second- and third-most reasons among both respondent groups.

Table 4: Goals of Database Usage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goals of database usage</th>
<th>Marketers</th>
<th></th>
<th>Ad Practitioners</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(N)</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>(N)</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For direct mailing purpose</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>28.2</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>27.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For media planning purpose</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>30.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For client-company relationship development</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>44.5</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>39.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong>*</td>
<td><strong>227</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>184</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Each respondent can answer more than one.

Discussion

While the IMC concept has been globally exposed and practiced, Thailand has been one of the countries included. Following what Anantachart (2003) did, the results from the current study continuously showed that the concept was widely and highly accepted among Thais, both marketers and advertising practitioners. Albeit not using English as a mother language, most of the Thai marketers and advertising practitioners were familiar and agreed with the IMC concept. Parts of this adoption would imply to such a globalization and continuing development of the IMC concept and practices (Peltier et al., 2003; Schultz, 2001).

In terms of the client-agency relationship in IMC, many Thai marketers and advertising practitioners saw it similarly as the one-to-many relationship between a client and various communications agencies in developing and executing communications programs. With this pattern, it implies that client companies would like to work with external advertising and other marketing communications agencies from the beginning step, as partners, to help support, coordinate, and integrate all their communications programs (Kim, Han, & D. Schultz, 2004). Gould et al. (1999) add that such relationship should be appropriate in making the genuine cooperation between the two parties in IMC practices and lead to long-termed accomplishment.

When further investigating perceptions and attitudes of both marketers and advertising practitioners regarding the general views, perceived satisfactions, and perceived barriers on IMC, most of the results indicate similar opinions among them. Those agreed-upon items present shared thoughts and knowledge in the positive directions. Elaborately, both Thai marketers and advertising practitioners nowadays have broader consumer-oriented
mindset and receive more understanding of the IMC concept, which is a critical sign toward more IMC development in the future (Eagle & Kitchen, 2000). Nonetheless, as shown in some items tested, the advertising practitioners still have a viewpoint that they should be in a leading role among marketing communications agencies to implement IMC strategies. Meanwhile, what the marketers concern most regarding on how advertising agencies work is IMC knowledge that the agencies would have, in order to run their integrated brand communications programs successfully. Such arguing issues were previously reported in Beard’s (1996) study.

While the findings from the former research (Anantachart, 2003) found that the samples utilized their databases for the main purposes of direct mailing and promotional activities, the current study demonstrated that Thai marketers and advertising practitioners have moved to the higher level of strategic use of their customer databases, that is, for customer-brand relationship development and media planning. This is another crucial IMC movement in the era of advanced information technology (Lee & Park, 2007; Lucka & Moffatt, 2009). Such database usages would help practitioners have more understanding of their customer’s behavior in the long run (D. Schultz & H. Schultz, 1998).

In conclusion, the current findings prove that Thai marketers and advertising practitioners have gained more understanding and performed IMC to higher level comparing with what is found in Anantachart’s (2003) research. As D. Schultz and H. Schultz (1998) provide a framework of IMC development, four stages of integration are emerged. They are tactical coordination, redefining the scope of marketing communications, applications of information technology, and financial and strategic integration. Initially, a company would attempt to coordinate all marketing communications functions by depending on one established communications discipline (i.e., advertising). In the next step, the company begins to focus less on such a functional area, and more on all touchpoints that consumers perceive about the company and brand. Third, the usage of information technology would help differentiate between and communicate to the customers. The focus here would be on the prediction of customer behavior. The last step of the integration is the complete picture of outside-in planning. Therefore, understanding how companies proceed along this framework would be the possible step that IMC researchers could work on.

As the results explained, it could be believed that broadly the IMC practices in Thailand have moved pass the first and second stages of such the development process. That is, the samples had positive attitudes toward IMC and they have utilized various marketing communications functions both inside and outside their companies. Hence, based on such reports, it could describe that the current status of IMC among Thai practitioners is in the midst of the third level of the integration process, in order to adjust itself to the highest level of the scheme.

Practical Implications

Although Western researchers have long understood IMC concept and practices, this study was among the beginning attempts to survey and monitor how marketers and advertising practitioners in Thailand, a Southeast Asian country, perceived the concept. The results showed positive, empirical information that IMC was widely accepted among the two key parties of Thai businesses. This would benefit practitioners in Thailand and foreign investors who plan to participate in the Thai marketplace. To exploratory learn how overall businesses and advertising agencies think about the way they utilize marketing communications tools would be a must to survive and grow in the current competitive time frame.

In addition, other marketing communications agencies could utilize such findings as an initial outlook for how they adjust themselves to serve changing needs of their current and
prospective partners and client companies. As future surely relies on IMC, various marketing communications tools, once called below-the-line, should be integrated with advertising under the new through-the-line approach. That is, advertising and other marketing communications tools must be coordinately and collaboratively utilized together to reach new generation of consumers, customers, prospects, and other stakeholders of the twenty-first century.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

Marketing in An Age of Greater Privacy Awareness in ASEAN

Peng Hwa Ang
Nanyang Technological University
Singapore

In the last few years, several ASEAN nations have passed, or proposed to pass, legislation that would enhance the privacy of individuals vis-à-vis business. Malaysia, Singapore and the Philippines have passed omnibus data protection laws that require business (but not government) to protect the data of individuals. Thailand and Indonesia are expected to pass similar legislation soon.

The aim of this paper is to analyse the impact such laws on the marketing efforts of companies. On the one hand, such laws are expected to increase consumer trust. On the other hand, there is no doubt that there will be increased cost for business. Will the benefits outweigh the costs?

The paper begins with a look at the intent and historical context of the law. It would appear that the law is intended to meet the “adequacy regime” of the European Union’s Data Protection Directive. The paper then compares and contrasts the provisions in ASEAN with the requirements of the EU.

Implications for marketing will be discussed.
The Message Creation for Promoting Creative Economy Approach by Thai Governmental Agencies

Prapassorn Chansathitphon
&
Jirayudh Sinthuphan PhD
Faculty of Communication Arts
Chulalongkorn University
Bangkok

Background and the Significance of the Study

This study on 'The Creation of Message to Promote the Creative Economy Approach by Thai Governmental Agencies' begins with the researcher's awareness of the effectiveness of 2 key phrases which lead to the questioning process or the determination of the main issue to be focused on this individual study. The first phrase is “Creative Thailand” which was first publicized at the announcement of the commitment for governance by the Cabinet of P.M. Abhisit Vejjajiva. The issue of creative economy was included in the Cabinet's policy announcement to the Parliament on 29th December 2008. The Master Plan of Creative Economy was made. This master plan emphasized on the development of creative economy for developing knowledge and innovations, strengthening Thai entrepreneurs, creating business standards, and developing both the market and the people in order to drive Thailand towards the status of the Creativity Hub of Southeast Asia. This would boost the economic capacity of Thailand so that the country needed not only rely on the export which was ever-changing in accordance to the global market (The Secretariat of the Cabinet, 2008).

This key phrase reflects that the Creative Economy approach, which was originated from the suggestion by the UNCTAD Creative Economy Report 2008, is an important tool that can be used for triggering the economic and social development for the modern world. Creative Economy approach has played significant roles and has been officially recognized by people in Thai society recently.

The second phrase is “We live on a story we are told” by W. Fisher. This phrase draws attention to the narration which is the researcher's fundamental knowledge and interest. The narration can influence the understanding and lives of people included in the story. If Thai society is to listen to the 'Creative Economy' as a story, what message creation scheme can the governmental agencies that want to convey this story apply in order to tell the story of the creative economy in the substantial manner? With the narration that has precise criteria for the study and analysis, and the elements with evaluation steps, the researcher deems that this narration can be used as the analytical mean to study on the creation of creative economy message by governmental agencies.

The researcher has studied on the fundamental knowledge on creative economy and realize that Thailand relies on the learning from the successes of international programs such as the “Creative Nation Initiative in 1994” program by Australia, which creates the new-age labour and youth characters that consider skill-related jobs that are based on their local identities as their new way of life, and the “Creative Britain: New talents for the new economy” by England, which promotes the changes in the infrastructure systems to be based on creativity which is also the core of the reform of education, information technology or the public and private administration (Andrew White, 2009), or the excitement from the
immediate success of Korea's “Seoul Creative City” program that focuses on the creation of the messages concerning cultural identities and way of life such as foods, costume and music through its proficiency and knowledge on advanced IT, and the great success of Singapore in urging its citizens to drive the country towards the status of the city of designing through the “Design Singapore” program.

The researcher notice that the reason why all of these aforementioned programs for promoting creative economy by foreign governments succeed is not the beautiful and touching 'slogans' but, beyond such memorable slogans, there are efficient and effective communication processes which are comprised of various elements such as the determination of the main departments to take responsibilities for key communication activities, the determination of the themes and directions of the contents, the reliance on the investment in study and research, and the development of infrastructures such as the extension of creative areas, art centers, facilities of transportation, communication and leisure activities. It is apparent that the attempts to tell the 'story' of creative economy in these foreign cases are precise and substantial. Thus, the researcher wonder, in the contexts of Thailand, what directions that the communication of the creative economy approach goes, especially the creation of messages that highlight this approach or urge the society to have some movements. In case of Thailand, what does creative economy really mean? How can the governmental agencies that have direct responsibilities for the creation of these messages create them and convey them to people in Thai society? These questions are the grounds of this study.

The researcher regard the creative economy approach as the 'message' that does not mean just an element of human communication process but means the merge of messages and contents with differences in social and economic contexts. Thus, this approach is regarded as an on-going 'story' because it affects people's lives in the broad fashion. For the researcher, 'messages' concerning creative economy are unique because they are about the aspect that is highly intangible and concerning both the dimension of way of thought and the dimension of implementation. This aspect triggers intelligence, imagination, creativity and behaviours. Hence, the researcher need to learn about the 'narration' schemes for telling the story of creative economy that are reflected through the messages that the governmental agencies in charge convey to audience in order to see what elements and schemes they use for publicizing the story of creative economy.

Concerning the “We live on the story we are told” phrase by Walter Fisher, it means that narration is regarded as a science. In Fisher's study titled 'Human Communication as Narration: Philosophy of Reason, Value and Action', which was carried out in 1987 when the narration was increasingly seen to extend from fictional narration to non-fictional one. Fisher's methodology for the study on the narration that can be applied to both fictional narration and non-fictional one was firmly supported by the fact, “where there are human being, there is narration.” Therefore, narration can also be applied to the communication of other serious subjects as science and political science (Fisher, cited in Kaewthep, 2010). This phrase is the foundation for the researcher's perspective that narration plays vital roles in linking people's awareness with their understanding on the contents they listen to as audiences. With the principle that narration has multiple functions as Fisher concluded that human beings are narrative being, which is more fundamental that other attributes, all the stories surrounding human beings, including non-fictional stories, can be studied on the basis of narration.
The communication of creative economy approach in Thailand begins with the reform of the country development under the 10th National Economic and Social Development Plan of Thailand which emphasizes on developing people to be important resources of the country. This approach also appears in the following 11th version whereby some agencies that are related to the development of knowledge to be an essential tool for development human resources are established. An agency that the researcher should regard as the one with important roles is the Office of Knowledge Management and Development (Public Organization), which is well-known as OKMD. The objectives of this office are to encourage people to pursue and develop their knowledge, and to improve the quality of people's thinking process. OKMD is comprised of many units with particular fields of expertise. However, for the researcher, there are 3 units that implement the policies of the office and play vital roles in driving this creative economy approach and promoting the development of the creative economy approach in the dimension of communication in Thailand. These 3 units are as follows:

1. **Thailand Knowledge Park or TK Park**: This unit is the master learning center that promotes reading and learning by providing books and multimedia to users so that they can use these tools for developing their skills of thinking which will lead to creative learning processes;

2. **Thailand Creative and Design Center or TCDC**: This unit is a hub of resources for the learning on designing which can inspire and urge Thai people to release their creativity that is based on the consideration of cultural identities, which will lead to the creation of new products or master pieces; and

3. **Museum Siam**: This unit holds creative exhibitions that use innovations to tell stories of the nation, and Thai way of life, wisdom and economy in the lively manner in order to trigger the visitors' curiosity, questioning and interactions with the exhibitions, which will generate the self-learning skill for audiences, which can be used for generating economic advantages and the overall development of the country.

The researcher can deem that these 3 units have direct responsibilities for conveying messages and promoting creativity in audiences of all levels. The preschool or intermediate audiences can use TK Park which aims to create the creative learning society for children and the youth. Meanwhile TCDC develops intermediate audiences or teenagers and working adults whose creativity is applied to the designing until valuable products or master pieces are produced. As for Museum Siam, it is the promoter of continuous learning because it shows the roots of Thai culture that affect creativity and wisdom of Thai people.

As the main message senders in Thai society, how these governmental agencies create messages that can transform the policies to the practice through media and communication channels and how the communication of creative economy approach by these agencies should be are the questions that should be answered. The answers to these questions can turn Thai society into a creative one that will develop the economic system to the country to be equivalent to the economy of other countries in the context of creative economy that has been carrying out. This study gleans the principles and approaches concerning the elements or factors that promote creative economy with the emphasis on the 4 types of Creative Capitals that UNCTAD mentioned that human beings’ creativity can generate economic growth only when there is development in 4 types of capitals, namely, Human Capital, Cultural Capital, Social Capital and Structural or Institutional Capital. The principle of 4 Creative Capitals is
used as the fundamental principle for the analysis on the contents and messages. This study will eventually lead to the attainment of a message creation model that is appropriate for Thai governmental agencies responsible for the communication of creative economy approach, which will help them to have clearer directions in the future.

**Research Questions**

1. Within the context of creative capital, how do Thai governmental agencies tell the story of creative economy, and why do they do it that way?
2. Analyzed within the frame of creative capital, how is the creation of the messages to promote creative economy approach by Thai governmental agencies?
3. How should the message creation model to promote creative economy in Thailand for Thai governmental agencies be?

**Research Objectives**

1. To study on and analyze the narration of the creative economy story by Thai governmental agencies in the creative capital context;
2. To study on and analyze the creation of messages that appear in media used by Thai governmental agencies; and
3. To create a message creation model that Thai governmental agencies can use for promoting creative economy in Thailand.

**Research Scope**

**Studied Organizations**

This study focuses on the 3 organizations or units under the control of the Office of Knowledge Management and Development (Public Organization) or OKMD, namely, Thailand Knowledge Park (TK Park), Thailand Creative Design Center (TCDC) and Museum Siam.

**Research Methodology**

This study is a qualitative research work that aims to study on and analyze information as follows:

**Information from Human Sources:** The information of this type is collected with the in-depth interview. The obtained information is analyzed with the narration approach which generates the analytical framework that consists of 8 elements of the narration. The respondents are the directors and the chiefs related to the studied issues from related governmental organizations, which are Office of Knowledge Management and Development (Public Organization) or OKMD as the chief organization, Thailand Knowledge Park (TK Park), Thailand Creative and Design Center (TCDC) and Museum Siam. The number of the respondents participating in the interview is 7 in total as follows:

1. Mr. Araya Ma-Indhra, the Director of the Policy and Planning Office and the Director-in-Charge of OKMD;
2. Miss Thassanai Wongphisetkul, the Director of TK Park;
3. Mr. Weerachai Wenitchakul, the Chief of the Academy and Knowledge Department, TK Park;
4. Mr. Aphisit Laisattruklai, the Director of TCDC;
5. Mr. Phichit Werangkhabut, the Chief of the Content and Knowledge Department and Exhibition Department, TCDC;
6. Mom Luang Orn-amphai Phananurat, the Manager of Museum Siam; and
7. Mr. Ronnarit Thanakoset, the Adviser and Co-Founder of Museum Siam.

The in-depth interviews with these seven respondents were held during the period of May 2011 and September 2011.

**Information from Documentary Sources**

The documentary analysis relies on the content analysis technique within the framework of the 4 Creative Capital approach, which will give the criteria for the analysis on media that each of the studied units uses. Since the 3 studied units are centers and a museum, media used are spatial media, which are the areas that the units set such as the Silent Room at TK Park and the Old Buildings Telling Old Stories Room at Museum Siam, websites of the 3 units, which are www.tcdc.or.th, www.tkpark.or.th, and www.museumsiam.com, events such as the Night at the Museum event by Museum Siam and the Light Emission event by TCDC, magazines such as 'Creative Thailand' magazine by TCDC, and exhibitions such as the 'Thailand's Articles' permanent exhibition by Museum Siam and the 'Ghost- Fear Managed by Creativity' temporary event by TCDC. The information of this type is the one concerning the media that the studied governmental agencies create for promoting the creative economy approach during the period of May 2010 and April 2011 only.

**Theories and Approaches Used in the Study**

The research on 'The Message Creation for Promoting Creative Economy Approach by Thai Governmental Agencies' concentrates on the message creation by Thai governmental agencies that are responsible for communicating the creative economy approach since the beginning of the project until the period of time during which is study is carried out. Three theories or approaches used as the bases for this study are as follows:

1. **Creative Economy Approach**: This approach incorporates 2 key issues, which are (1) the contemporary situations about creative economy in Thailand, and (2) Thai governmental agencies that communicate the creative economy approach;
2. **The Approach of the Narration as Message Creation**: The analysis and assessment of the studied messages are based on this approach which suggests that a story is comprised of 8 elements, which are (1) narrator or story teller, (2) theme, (3) character, (4) setting, (5) situation, (6) temporal relation, (7) rational relation, and (8) audience or listener; and
3. **The 4 Creative Capital Approach**: These 4 creative capitals are Human Capital, Cultural Capital, Social Capital and Structural or Institutional Capital.
Conceptual Framework of the Research on 'the Message Creation to Promote the Creative Economy Approach by Thai Governmental Agencies'

Creative Economy Approach

OKMD as the Agency to Promote Creative Economy Policy

TK Park

TCDC

Museum Siam

Interviews with Directors, Chiefs and Heads

Analysis on the Information from the Interview with the Narration Approach by Fisher, 1987

Message Creation to Promote the Creative Economy Approach by Thai Governmental Agencies

Documentary Analysis on Materials and Media Used by the Agencies

Documentary Analysis Using the Principle of 4 Creative Capitals

Message Creation Model to Promote the Creative Economy Approach by Thai Governmental Agencies

Research Question 1
Within the context of creative capital, how do Thai governmental agencies tell the story of creative economy, and why do they do it that way?

Research Question 2
Analyzed within the frame of creative capital, how is the creation of the messages to promote creative economy approach by Thai governmental agencies?

Research Question 3
How should the message creation model to promote creative economy in Thailand for Thai governmental agencies be?
Research Findings

The results from the analysis on the information obtained from the in-depth interviews with all the respondents on the bases of the 8 elements of the story and the analysis on the contents from all the related media on the bases of the 4 creative capitals can be used for drawing the message creation models for creating messages to promote the creative economy approach by each of the 3 studied Thai governmental agencies. The message creation models of the 3 agencies are shown in the following sub-sections.

Message Creation Model to Promote the Creative Economy Approach by TK Park

The Principle of 8 Elements of a Story
- Narrator: Providing services to promote learning
- Audiences: Both the service providers and service receivers
- Characters: Learning facilitators and learners
- Theme: People can learn about the creative economy when they learn creatively.
- Setting: Live library
- Situation: The society of the creative economy emerges through creative learning
- Rational Relation: Creativity generated through appropriate learning is the thinking capital that can be used as a tool of creative economy.
- Temporal relation: Creative economy is a continuous state following the policy to create the learning society.

Message Creation to Promote the Creative Economy Approach
- Conceptual Message Emphasizing on the Development for an Individual
- Operation Message Emphasizing on Human Capital

The Principle of 4 Creative Capitals
- Human Capital: Promoted through the development in living skills and voluntary minds through a variety of media
- Cultural Capital: Promoting and encouraging the art and cultural expressions, especially the contemporary culture by children and the youth
- Social Capital: To promote the interaction among service providers and receivers in order to establish creative learning groups and networks
- Structural Capital: The knowledge center that publicizes knowledge through various media in accordance to service receivers' needs both directly and through the internet

Theme
- People can learn about the creative economy when they learn creatively.
From the shown model, it can be concluded that the message creation for promoting the creative economy approach by TK Park, analyzed with the principles of the 8 elements of a story and the 4 creative capitals, is discovered to emphasize on 'people' and 'creative learning materials' as the foundations to create messages to promote the creative economy approach.

The reason why the contents of the messages are said to emphasize on 'people' is that TK Park is the prototypical learning center that aims to develop live long learning for people and is emphatic on self-administered learning whereby learners can practice various learning schemes, learning about different bodies of knowledge and using different learning materials. Therefore, the analysis on the messages in both the operational level and the policy level leads to the results that precisely indicate that learning is set to be in the individual level; or that individual learning is tremendously important. This means the 'human capital' which is an element of the 4 creative capitals is regarded as the most important of the four because TK Park deems that to have learning skills that are appropriately developed and creative is a tool that people can use for turning the society to the creative economic one.

At the same time, the interactions between learners and learning facilitators or the congregations in the forms of groups or networks will build up the 'social capital'. The appropriate learning that incorporates creative processes is an essential event that the agency uses for communicating its ideas to the target audiences. Meanwhile, the utilization of the live library as the setting or scenario for the events is also regarded as the uniqueness of this governmental agency. It can also be assumed that the learning through the learning center and the provision of various learning materials online are the 'structural capital' for the promotion of the creative economy approach. Meanwhile, the contents and activities designed and implemented in addition to the main system, especially the performances in different forms can be seen as the 'cultural capital'.

Therefore, the message creation model for promoting the creative economy approach by TK Park, which is a Thai governmental agency the missions of which are to improve people's learning efficiency and to promote creative reading, is agreeable to the approach of creative economy and can be adapted to the message creation for promoting the creative economy approach, especially in case of the message creation for promoting creative learning as a tool that people can use for obtaining knowledge and improving themselves in order to attain the creative thinking process that can lead to differentiated outcomes.
From the model shown, it can be concluded that the message creation for promoting the creative economy approach by TCDC, analyzed with the principles of the 8 elements of the story and the 4 creative capitals, is found to emphasize on 'designing', 'creation' and 'way of life' as the foundations for its message creation for promoting the creative economy approach.

The reason for its emphasis on the 'designing and creation' for its message creation is that TCDC is the prototypical center that aims to urge the society to aware of the value of the creative thinking and realize that designing is an important process or tool for living the life in all dimensions. Hence, the analysis on the messages in both the operational level and the
policy level leads to the results that precisely reveal that designing and creative thinking are two important aspects that must be reflected through the expression of people's ways of lives so that they can convey messages with significant contents to the public. Thus, the message creation for promoting the creative economy approach by TCDC emphasizes on 'structural capital' and 'social capital'.

Meanwhile, the encouragement of the exchanges of knowledge and experiences among creative thinkers, new designers and entrepreneurs or new wave business people, or the congregations in the forms of groups or networks can generate the 'social capital'. The arrangement of events that alert the people by giving the examples of successful cases in foreign countries that audiences can learn and discuss together is the use of the spaces of this creative center. These spaces include the library of designing and exhibition halls that provide different learning materials including online ones. This is the 'structural capital' that supports the creative economic approach. Meanwhile, the contents and activities designed and implemented in addition to the main system, especially the exhibitions, forums and seminars, can be seen as the 'cultural capital'.

Therefore, the message creation model to promote the creative economy approach by TCDC, which is a Thai governmental agency the missions of which are to educate and encourage the public to use designing and creative thinking as tools to develop the live quality and economy, is agreeable to the creative economy approach and can be adapted to the message creation for promoting the creative economy approach in the most unique and substantial fashion because it creates linkage between knowledge and application, especially in case where the communication of messages that use 'social capital' and 'structural capital' is necessary.
The Message Creation Model to Promote the Creative Economy Model by Museum Siam

**The Principle of 8 Elements of a Story**
- **Narrator:** Curators who have experiences and knowledge on Thai wisdom
- **Audience:** Thai people, teenagers, and young working adults
- **Characters:** Thai people and peoples in Suvarnabhumi region, Thai culture
- **Setting:** Museum Siam - the Live Museum
- **Situation:** To urge people to find out about Thai identities through the learning of Thai wisdom
- **Rational Relation:** Thai wisdom is a factor that turns Thai society to the society of creative economy
- **Temporal Relation:** Thai identities have been developed for 3,000 years from the past to the present.

**Message to Promote the Creative Economy Approach**

**Conceptual Message Emphasizing on the Philosophy**

**Operation Message Emphasizing on Cultural Capital**

**Human Capital:** To educate people about Thai identities and Thai wisdom, and to make people aware of themselves

**Cultural Capital:** To present Thai identities in a variety of contemporary styles, and to present the origins and causes of Thai identities

**Social Capital:** To set up networks whereby people of different sexes and ages gather together and have interactions with the contexts.

**Structural Capital:** The live museum that inserts the contents of Thai wisdom and Thai identities in the different person.
From the shown model, it can be concluded that the message creation for promoting the creative economy approach by Museum Siam, analyzed with the principles of the 8 elements of a story and the 4 creative capitals, is discovered to emphasize on 'Thai people', ‘Suvarnabhumi region’ and 'Thai wisdom' as the foundations to create messages to promote the creative economy approach.

The reason why the contents of the messages are said to emphasize on 'the wisdom of the Thais in Suvarnabhumi region’ is that Museum Siam is the institute that promotes Thai identities by providing the learning through the live museum, the aim of which is to urge the society to find answers and to be aware of the value of Thai identities as important tools that can be in all the dimensions of life. To enable visitors (audiences) to learn through direct experiences is a significant way to develop the ‘human capital’. The analysis on the messages in both the operational level and the policy level leads to the results that precisely indicate that the messages are created with the main purpose to educate the visitors about Thai people and Thai identities that are related to the region of Suvarnabhumi. Together with the thinking processes that extract the knowledge from the messages, the core messages create important knowledge for audiences. Hence, the messages to promote the creative economy approach created by Museum Siam incorporate the ‘cultural capital’ and ‘social capital’ as well.

To create the situations that urge visitors (audiences) to finds answers about where did the Thais come from and what are Thai identities present the stories about Thai identities that have been built upon the difference and inter-relationship among peoples in Suvarnabhumi region, which is an important base of the 'social capital'. These stories enable the visitors to learn together in the spaces of the museum which include the exhibition halls and the library that provide a variety of learning materials, including the online ones. This is an important type of the 'structural capital' that can be used for promoting the creative economy approach. At the mean time, the contents and activities, especially the performances, temporary exhibitions and seminars, designed to supplement the main activities, can make the 'social capital' prevail.

Therefore, the message creation model to promote the creative economy approach by Museum Siam, which is a Thai governmental agency the missions of which are to educate and to make Thai people aware of the value of Thai wisdom, are the intellectual capital that is developed to cover the economic matters is agreeable and applicable to the message creation for promoting the creative economy approach because it links the knowledge about Thai identities, which are the 'cultural capital', 'social capital' and 'structural capital', through the human capital development through the learning from direct experiences.

Research Findings Discussion and Presentation of the Model of the Collaboration among Thai Government Agencies to Promote Creative Economy Approach

From the research results, the researcher could figure out four main points that should be discussed.

1. The point about meanings and definitions. The definitions and classification of creative economy in Thailand have not been clear or united. This is because the theme of the story about creative economy in Thailand is still vague whilst each of the governmental agencies has its own theme that is not agreeable to each other's. Hence, it is advisable that the definitions should be firmly created on the basis of Thai contexts.
2. **The point about the administration structure of the governmental agencies.** Thailand is a case that does not have any governmental agency to be directly responsible for or to support the implementation of the creative economy policy. On the contrary, it is discovered that the administration in this case is widely spread and lacking of integration. As for the narration, this situation reflects that all the narrators who tell stories of creative economy in Thailand have not cooperated with each other, nor have they had the narration scheme that determines the characters, settings and situations that can affect the development of the country. Even though some agencies with direct responsibilities like OKMD have been used as the center to disseminate all the movements concerning the creative economy approach, the unique natures of all the 3 units of OKMD lead to the redundant and confusing directions for the narration.

3. **The point about infra-structures and facilities.** Databases and all the facilities including the spaces, laws or communication technology such as hi-speed internet, which have been gathered or created, still cannot facilitate the production, distribution or services for the audience in the satisfying level. This imposes the significant obstacles to the determination of the situation or setting of a story, which will make the characters play their roles. Unless there cannot be the creation of the situations or settings that proceed the story, the stories that promote creative economy approach will not be proceeded in the systematic manner.

4. **The point about the relevant knowledge and other research works.** From this study, it is found that the operations of the studied agencies do not present clear strategies, processes or even communication forms, nor do they suggest the ways to disseminate the policy to all the related people, although such activities are remarkably essential. The weaknesses of the elements of the stories and the absence of the analysis on the audiences of the stories make the communication of the creative economy approach in Thailand incomplete and not truly effectiveness. From the aforementioned four points of the discussion, the researcher can assume that the narration of the creative economy stories by Thai governmental agencies should rely on the researcher's assumption, “the narration or story telling is a form of communication,” and “…t story is not just a fiction; on the contrary, knowledge or principle can be a story that audiences can pleasantly learn about.”

Concerning the communication of the creative economy approach in Thailand, which, in accordance to the administrative structure, is a main responsibility of OKMD, it is apparent that even though there have been the attempts to communicate or disseminate the creative economy approach as a body of knowledge to the society, the findings from this study reveal that each of all the studied agencies do not regard themselves as the organizations that have been established with the major objective to communicate the creative economy principle. This is because they have just been informed about the creative economy principle or policy in 2008. Even though OKMD is a major unit the major roles of which are to reform the education system and to develop people's learning, its role in telling the creative economy story as a body of knowledge are not substantial, and do not contain enough contents because all the sub-units, namely, TK Park, TCDC and Museum Siam, which have been assigned to promote this policy, have their own operations, which are different from each other's. In addition, these agencies do not regard themselves as the units that have direct responsibilities for the dissemination of the creative economy approach. As a result their frameworks or models of the message creation to promote the creative economy to the public do not have unity, and the contents of the messages vary.
Regarded as a non-fictional story, the creative economy story has many OKMD as the narrator whilst the 3 sub-units or TK Park, TCDC and Museum Siam are main characters. The main factors, especially the unique natures of each of them and the differences in terms of their visions and missions, make the stories that they tell different from the stories told by others in all aspects. This confusion is caused from the characteristics of each character that are completely different from others'. It can be assumed that TK Park is a character of an expert of education science who is proficient in creating learning media or materials. Meanwhile, TCDC is a designer character who wants to work and make money. As for Museum Siam, it is like a Thai archaeologist who is proficient in contemporary communication. These different characteristics of the 3 sub-units make the settings and time told by each agency different from those told by others. Most importantly, the themes of the stories, which should have been similar to each other, differ. Thus, this story is separated into 3 sub-parts in a major story. Consequently, audiences might have to select the stories they prefer because the story told by each agency is for a specific group, not for the public in general.

Analyzing the contents of the messages in different media with the principle of 4 creative capitals, which are human capital, cultural capital, social capital and structural capital, the researcher can see that the 3 studied agencies create the messages by using spaces, exhibitions, websites, activities and magazines as media or communication channels. All of these media incorporate the 4 creative capitals. This means the created messages can communicate the creative economy approach. This is precise when considering the aspect of human capital because these 3 agencies have the structures that aim to develop human resources. Hence, they cannot deny the responsibility or role of the narrators of the creative economy story because the products they have produced and publicized are clear enough. Therefore, as the agencies that receive policy from OKMD, all of these 3 studied agencies should work with each other in order to determine the direction of the narration that fits their roles, tasks and natures whilst having agreement to the stories told by others in terms of the 8 elements of a story.

However, the most important context is to adjust the educational system to truly facilitate the creation of the creative thinking society. One of the obvious indicators is the lacking of learning media and materials produced for creating the understanding on the creative economy approach. All the available research reports, journals and policy plans are limited within specific areas. At the same time, the education system, from the fundamental levels to the university levels have not carried out enough productive or creative research works. Hence, an important issue to be considered when creating messages to promote the creative economy approach in Thailand is to change the educational reform policy into creative ones that emphasize on creativity, modern and up-to-date learning management, with the advancement in all aspects especially learning media and materials, the accessibility of sources of knowledge and the versatile learning management that suits for the different learning requirements of learners. These aspects must be developed in the wide range. The 3 agencies which are TK Park, TCDC and Museum Siam have been trying to deal with these issues as the learning centers. Therefore, it is advisable for all learning agencies in all systems to adjust and change themselves, and to collaborate with each other by applying knowledge and practices of the 3 schools to their operations. From the results from the analysis and discussions of the research results, the researcher would create a new model, which is derived from the models of the three agencies. This new model will facilitate the message creation to promote the creative economy approach in accordance to the principles of 8 elements of a story and the 4 creative principles.
Collaborative Model for Thai Governmental Organizations to Promote Creative Economy Principle

Creative Economy Approach in Thai Context

3 Foundations of Creative Economy
Creative Wisdom + Creative Learning + Creative Products

Ministry of Culture
The organization to generate knowledge on Thai culture and wisdom

The Ministry of Education, MUA
The organization to promote research inside and outside the systems

The Ministry of Industry and the Ministry of Commerce
The organization to promote production, investment and export

Message Creation to Promote Creative Economy
Narration + Media + 4 Creative Capitals

Narration (Story Telling)
Narrator: Promoting participation and freedom
Theme: Reflecting the knowledge that an individual apply
Character: Covering the 3 bases of creative economy
Situation: Reflecting the truth of the society that is interesting and allows people’s participation
Setting: Projecting everyday’s life scenarios that audiences can understand and link to themselves
Rational Relation: Covering the dimensions of economy, society, culture and their importance to life
Temporal Relation: Having realms, orders, and acceptable beginning and ending point
Audiences: Participating in the determination of the direction of the issue

People Sector
Networks, Unions and Groups

Used Media
Spaces, Exhibitions, Printed Media, Website and Other Media such as TV and Social Network

Private Sector
Entrepreneur and Investors

Framework the Principle of 4 Creative Capitals
Human Capital, Cultural Capital, Social Capital, Structural Capital
Suggestions

Suggestions to the public sector: The findings from this research show the situations about the understanding on message creation, especially the creation of messages to promote the creative economy in Thailand. They can also be used as a tool to evaluate the operations to publicize the creative economy approach by governmental agencies as narrators. The researcher would like to suggest that the messages that the governmental agencies should create are 'informative messages' rather than persuasive ones because the creative economy can be promoted as mechanism that can be used for developing the country only when people understand its meaning.

After the creative economy approach, the study and development of the 4 creative capitals, which are human capital, cultural capital, social capital and structural capital, in Thai context should be carried out. To study and develop these 4 creative capitals is meant to review the existing capitals and develop them in accordance to the changed circumstances.

In addition, the clarification of the roles and tasks of the relevant agencies and the identification of the links between such roles and the promotion of the creative economy approach can be important factors that affect the message creation to promote the creative economy approach. This is because almost all of governmental agencies such as TK Park, TCDC and Museum Siam have to serve the public. Thus, if they consider themselves as a chain in the service or learning businesses, they can better determine how they are related to the creative economy approach.

As for the Collaborative Model for Thai Governmental Organizations to Promote Creative Economy Principle presented in this study, the researcher would like to reflect the roles of the related ministries in taking parts in the communication process, especially in creating the messages that fit their missions and responsibilities. For example, the Ministry of Education, especially the Ministry of the University Affair (MUA), which has controls over all the universities, should have tasks to create people's awareness of the advantages of the creative economy, to encourage the linkage among different sciences and to enable the academics to apply their knowledge to their professions. All the theoretical and operational research works must be able to be extended to the implementation to the actual situations, and the directions prescribed by the National Economic and Social Development Plan must be substantially followed.

The Ministry of Culture, especially the Department of the Contemporary Culture, should encourage and support new and existing artists, designers and craftsmen to develop and express their artistic skills and exchange their experiences with each other through the Creative Public Space. This Creative Public Space should be promoted as a facility that people can use in their daily lives. Crafts and arts must be regarded as the professions that require both skills and experiences. Artists and culture-experts in of all branches of arts, such as traditional and contemporary ones, must be honoured. Traditional and contemporary artists should be encouraged to work or exchange ideas with each other.

Another important task of the Ministry of Culture is to gather all bodied of knowledge and Thai wisdom, to categorize them, to link those in the past to the contemporary ones, and to publicize them. These messages must rely on mechanisms that enable the governmental agencies who have the access to such knowledge to become the leaders of changes. Culture and traditional wisdom should be added to people's daily lives. People should be made
familiar to arts and culture which should be promoted as aspects in people's ways of lives instead of being just symbols because people will pass on the aspects in their real lives onto their offspring without the need for teaching process.

At the same time, the Ministry of Commerce and/or the Ministry of Industry can also take parts in message creation to promote the creative economy approach by collaborating with other agencies or sectors, facilitating all the individuals and/or organizations that are related to creative economy by taking into account that creative economy is comprised of human capital, cultural capital, social capital and structural capital. A product is just at the downstream level, compared with the creative thinking process that leads to the production of such a product. Hence, both the Ministry of Commerce and the Ministry of Industry should have the fundamental operations by identifying the strengths of Thai manufacturers. This might require the Ministry of Culture to take part if the promoted products are creative industrial ones. These ministries must set the direction of product designs for Thai industry. Once this can be identified, the messages communicated to people will be clear and the private sector and respond to and extend its production in the easier manner.

**Suggestions for the private sector:** Organizations that are related to the promotion of the creative economy can use the findings from research works as the data and information for making their message creation plans to promote creative economy approach. They can also give supports in terms of information, and providing the missing information and ideas to the governmental agencies that promote the approach in order that the creative economy approach in Thailand will be feasible.

**Suggestions for academic and educational sectors:** The results from this study are generated from the qualitative perspectives that are based on the narration (story telling) in order to learn about the message creation to promote the creative economy approach, which seems to be a modern approach that plays important roles in developing the country. The study and analysis with the narration and message creation principles, as well as the test and the attainment of the message creation model to promote the creative economy approach, will have academic values because students in mass communication can take parts in developing, improving or supporting the communication of the approach. These activities can also be extended to other activities or implementation of other policies by other governmental agencies in the future.

However, presenting the Collaborative Model for Thai Governmental Organizations to Promote Creative Economy Principle, the researcher expects the extended operations whereby the narration principle is applied to the study on the communication of the governmental policies. This is because the researcher believes that the success in the communication of governmental policies relies on the narration process that is interesting and pleasant that everybody wants to listen to. Therefore, within 5 years after the 10th and 11th National Economic and Social Development Plans are over, this model should be tested and studied with the extension to the policy management levels or the ministries, departments and divisions in order to learn about the efficiency and effectiveness of the communication of the creative economy media in Thailand. Such knowledge can be obtained from the comparative study between the communication of this approach in Thailand and the communication in other countries, especially the successful one or developing ones. The findings obtained from such studies can be used for setting the directions to tell stories in the successful manner.
Authors’ note

This article is a part of the thesis titled, “Message Creation to Promote the Creative Economy Approach by Thai Governmental Agencies,” by Prapassorn Chansatitporn, under the supervision of Dr Jirayudh Sinthuphan, thesis advisor, and was the winner of the 90 Years Chulalongkorn University Scholarship.
REFERENCES

Thai Language

กาญจนา แก้วเทพ. (2553). แนวพินิจใหม่ในสื่อสารการศึกษา. โครงการเสริมสร้างวิทยา (ครม.).

กาญจนา แก้วเทพ. (2548). ทฤษฎีการสร้างสาร. เอกสารการสอนชุดวิชาการสร้างสารในงานนิเทศศาสตร์. สาขาวิชานิเทศศาสตร์, มหาวิทยาลัยรังสิต.


Werangkhubut, Phichit. (28th July 2011). Chief of the Content and Knowledge Department and Exhibition Department, TCDC. Interview.


Laisattruklai, Aphisit. (6th May 2011). Director of TCDC. Interview.


Ma-indhra, Araya. (29th September 2011). Director of the Policy and Planning Office and the Director-in-Charge of OKMD. Interview.

English Language

Creative Macao (ออนไลน์). 2010. (13 มกราคม 2553). แหล่งที่มา:
http://www.creativemacau.org.mo/EN/overview.php

China Creative Space. (ออนไลน์). 2010. (13 มกราคม 2553). แหล่งที่มา:
http://www.798space.com/index_en.asp


The impact of Corporate Social Responsibility branding on consumer attitudes: A Thai perspective

Nigel M. de Bussy
School of Marketing, Curtin University
GPO Box U1987
Perth WA 6845, Australia
N.Debussy@curtin.edu.au

&
Lokweeptpun Suprawan
Marketing Department,
Bangkok University

The relationship of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) to corporate and marketing communication has attracted considerable attention from scholars and practitioners alike. Yet much current research focuses on Western priorities. This quantitative study investigates the perceptions of young Thai consumers in relation to CSR branding and its impact on corporate brand reputation, product brand attitude, and purchase intention. CSR branding is conceptualised and measured using three dimensions drawn from a recently developed scale. Two of these dimensions – related to environmental performance and community contribution – are generally regarded as key drivers of corporate brand reputation. However, this study finds that commitment to the community and the environment is far less important to the Thai respondents than the third factor – financial fairness. This refers to perceived treatment of customers and suppliers in relation to financial transactions. Does the company charge fair prices for its products? Does it pay fair prices to its suppliers? Perceived financial fairness is found to make a substantial contribution to corporate brand reputation, which in turn a major determinant of product brand attitude. Purchase intention is found to be strongly affected by product brand attitude.

The study is based on a survey of 220 marketing students at a university in Bangkok. The questionnaire was translated into Thai from the English original. Ninety-eight per cent of respondents were aged from 18 to 24 years. Respondents were asked to think about their perceptions of a famous global electronics brand and to answer the questions in relation to that company. The constructs of interest - corporate social responsibility branding; corporate brand reputation; hedonic and utilitarian product brand attitude; and, purchase intention - were measured using established scales from the marketing and corporate communication literature.

The study’s originality relates to the implications of three of its findings. First, the concept of financial fairness has emerged as a potentially important but as yet under-researched aspect of CSR with implications for corporate brand reputation. Even CSR-related studies conducted in Asia have generally not considered this construct as a potentially important dimension (e.g., Lii and Lee, 2012), despite existing research indicating Chinese consumers may have different CSR priorities than their Western counterparts (Ramasamy and Yeung, 2009). Secondly, the findings suggest young Thai consumers place relatively less weight on environmental performance and community contribution in evaluating corporate reputation than might be expected, based on research conducted from a Western perspective. The study indicates the merits of examining alternative conceptualisations of CSR in Asian contexts.
Thirdly, the findings show the importance of corporate brand reputation to the formation of product brand attitudes which, in turn, strongly influence purchase intentions.

REFERENCES


Western public relations in South East Asian environments: 
More than just a matter of “cultural sensitivity”? 

Graeme Domm, 
Deakin University Australia / RMIT University Vietnam 
graemedomm@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Interest in inter-cultural and cross-border conduct of public relations (PR) and corporate communication activities has been growing in recent years. At the same time, South East Asia is emerging as one of the world’s most dynamic and significant growth regions, rapidly moving toward closer economic integration between neighbouring countries. Despite these parallel developments, relatively little research exists into the attitudes, experiences and worldviews of public relations practitioners who are located in the countries of this region, and arguably well placed to observe and provide practical insights into current developments in their communities.

Drawing on the results of an online questionnaire completed by 30 practitioners in six countries of the region, and in-depth semi-structured face-to-face interviews subsequently conducted with 14 experienced practitioners, a study has sought to explore the ways in which practitioners in these countries view their work, their profession, their circumstances, and the challenges they face in their everyday professional practice, both individually and collectively. The practitioners reveal some shifting aspects of their professional culture and the societies in which they operate. The study also explores the relationship between public relations theory and the world of actual practice as experienced in the region. In addition, it traces some possible links between public relations theory, broader communication theory, and a wider world of social science and management theories not frequently explored by PR scholars. The study concludes that public relations and corporate communication practitioners in the region do have some distinctive insights to offer and that in some respects these insights challenge the conventional wisdom of ‘western’ public relations theory which has sought to portray itself as universal in its applicability. The study suggests that implications may flow from this for PR education and teaching in the region, particularly at undergraduate level.

Keywords: South East Asia, corporate communication, public relations, culture, values, attitudes, language, education, infrastructure, development, media systems, politics, gender, globalisation, professional associations, ethics, professionalism
Introduction

Recent decades have brought growing awareness of the importance of culture as a factor to consider in the conduct of public relations and corporate communication activities; in particular, the possibility that local and regional cultures may render aspects of professional theory and practice less relevant in other locations than in the countries of North America and western Europe where they were formulated.

Since at least the 1990s, a small but growing band of scholars has begun to explore the extent to which commonly accepted western models and concepts of public relations practice hold validity in ‘non-western’ locations.

As early as the 1970s and 1980s, in fact, some researchers (for example, Idid, 1978, and Kaul, 1988) observed that public relations and corporate communication may exhibit distinctive characteristics in so-called ‘non-western’ locations, although the implicit assumption seemed to be that PR was simply ‘less developed’ as yet in these locations.

But from the early 1990s, the critique began to take a clearer form, with researchers including Krishnamurthy Sriramesh (1992a, 1992b, 1996), Dejan Vercic (2000) and James Van Leuven (1996) beginning to question, either directly or implicitly, whether the ‘Excellence Model’ of public relations propounded by the doyen of American public relations scholars, James Grunig (1984, 1992), could be seen to have equal relevance in Asian societies. Given the model’s expectation of ‘two-way symmetrical communication’ between organisations and their stakeholders and target publics, what account did it take of societies in which communication activities might be more stratified and hierarchical, for example, or perhaps more heavily contextualised by traditional social relationships?

Drawing on the work of Dutch researcher Geert Hofstede (1981, 2001), whose research arose from a corporate ‘human resources’ background, Sriramesh and others came to contend that substantial differences in the so-called ‘power-distance’ relationships between social groups in western societies and their eastern counterparts meant that it might be impractical to expect communication ‘symmetry’, a state of informed and respectful two-way dialogue in which all parties could be equally open to influence and to being influenced. Perhaps drawing unconsciously on the earlier work of anthropologists including Edward Hall (1977) and Stuart Hall (1992), who wrote of the importance of understanding the central role of context in understanding communications within different societies, and the processes by which people form and reinforce their senses of identity within their own communities, Sriramesh initially focused on cultural variables in public relations in a south Indian context (1992a), but later extended this to other projects, sometimes in collaboration with peers elsewhere, investigating cultural variables and how these might impact on public relations conduct in ‘non-western’ locations. These collaborations included projects which looking more closely at Korea and Japan (Sriramesh, Kim and Takasaki, 1999), contrasts between central Europe and Asia (Sriramesh and Vercic, 2001), and further studies involving Grunig himself, who appeared open to critique and modification of his Excellence Model to take account of societal differences in locations outside the US (for example, Grunig, Huang and Lyra, 1995). A small number of other public relations scholars made distinctive contributions of their own, primarily focusing on the influence of specific cultural factors within their own countries. These included, for example, Daradirek Ekachai and R. Komolsevin in Thailand (1996, 2004), Syed Idid (1978, 2004), Karanjit Kaur, Jamilah Ahmad and colleagues in Malaysia (Kaur, Ahmad, Ch’ng, Ismail and Annaur, 1999), and Juan Jamias and Ramon Tuazon (1996) in the Philippines.
In 2004, Sriramesh (2004) sought to bring this steadily emerging regional literature together into an anthology on public relations in Asia, summarising common themes and elements in the work of authors across the region. Sriramesh asked contributing authors to consider a list of five key ‘environmental variables’ that had been identified earlier by Dejan Vercic, James Grunig and Larissa Grunig (1996) when they sought to develop a framework for analysing international public relations practice. The variables they had identified were political ideology, economic system (including its level of development), levels of community activism, culture, and prevailing media system.

While most of the contributing authors attempted to build their analysis around this framework, to varying degrees, the sum total of their labours moved Sriramesh to conclude that the case for its importance could still only be made “conceptually” or based on limited anecdotal evidence (Sriramesh, 2004; p 3). Sriramesh lamented that “the body of knowledge of public relations in Asia is sparse and growing at a slow pace” (Sriramesh, 2004; p 323). As recently as 2009, Sriramesh (2009) repeated his refrain that the body of PR knowledge continued to exhibit serious deficiency in terms of empirical evidence from different parts of the world about phenomena relevant to public relations practice, with much of the so-called ‘international’ data in the literature still coming only from a small set of countries.

In recent years, however, there have been signs of renewed scholarly interest in quantifying the real extent and relevance of the environmental variables said to affect PR practice in Asian locations, with the biggest focus to date going to matters of culture and how it can affect the work of professional communicators. Examples of such research include the work of Caroline Hodges (2006), Nilanjana Bardhan (2011), Jacqui L’Etang (2011) and Mahuya Pal and Mohan Dutta (2008), all of whom have also sought to broaden the theoretical prism through which international public relations is viewed, giving consideration to disciplines such as anthropology and critical modernism as well.

Perhaps surprisingly, however, little of this research has offered any insight into the day-to-day realities and challenges facing PR and corporate communication practitioners in the region, as seen by practitioners themselves, in a way that can reveal the depth and colour of their experienced relationship between theory and practice. While worthwhile research has been conducted into aspects of practitioners’ views in their region, this research has tended, for the most part, to focus on a relatively narrow range of professional issues. Typically, questions have explored issues such as to the extent to which practitioners feel they are respected for the work that they do, or appreciated by their employers, or able to progress within their organisations and careers. An example of this type of approach is the work of Ekachai and Komolsevin (1996, 2004) in Thailand. It might be suggested that the formulation of such research questions in itself provides useful insight into cultural priorities in South East Asia, though it does not necessarily reveal much about what may be happening beneath the surface. More recently, practitioner views in Perth (Australia) and Singapore have been compared and contrasted in an effort to ascertain how much value practitioners are attaching to inter-cultural awareness (Fitch, 2012). Yet beyond this recent advance, surprisingly little information has been uncovered about practitioners’ general outlooks and worldviews in the region, their dispositions toward ethics and values, their views on the importance of formal knowledge about their own discipline, and a range of other broader issues which could more closely relate the world of PR theory to their lived realities, in ways that could shed more light on the complex environments in which they seek to survive and prosper.

While remaining sensitive to the danger of setting up a binary opposition between the worldviews of PR practitioners and theorists, of the kind noted by Betteke Van Ruler (2005)
in an aptly titled paper *Professionals are from Venus, Scholars are from Mars*, it has seemed nonetheless true to this writer, who has experienced a career spanning both 'sides', that a reading of public relations literature often produces visions of reality that depart substantially from what practitioners tend to report themselves when in conversation.

Is it possible that more might be learned about the impact of the oft-cited ‘environmental variables’ affecting the conduct of public relations in different parts of the world if practitioners in these locations were to be quizzed more comprehensively about their views on a broader range of issues and experiences? Equally, might practitioners be able to reveal more about the question of whether public relations success can be replicated in multiple locations through a sensitive appreciation of cultural differences, or whether there might be other key factors ‘beyond culture’, so to speak, that have important practical significance as well? These thoughts have helped form the background to a doctoral research project undertaken by this writer that has sought to explore views amongst public relations and corporate communication practitioners in six countries of South East Asia. The project is now close to completion.

The study

Between 2010 and early 2012, research was undertaken amongst practitioners in six member countries of ASEAN: Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, Singapore, Thailand and Vietnam. Four member countries were excluded, for reasons relating to their unique circumstances, as explained more fully in the report. These were Brunei, Cambodia, Laos and Myanmar (Burma).

The major components of the research were an online questionnaire and a series of semi-structured in-depth interviews, supplemented by background research on each country and on the region as a whole viewed from various contexts including frameworks outside conventional public relations theory. The last component was included in an effort to explore, at least tentatively, the extent to which other social science disciplines may be able to help answer questions not yet addressed by mainstream public relations theory, particularly as they pertain to complex multi-cultural environments of the kind existing in South East Asia. These frameworks include religion, sociology and critical studies, anthropology, cultural studies, political history including colonialism and post-colonialism, management studies, and broader communication theory.

Questionnaire participants were purposively selected for their work roles and locations, drawing on the local membership of two major international professional associations: the International Association of Business Communicators (IABC), and the International Public Relations Association (IPRA), as well as some practitioners separately brought to the author’s attention. One hundred practitioners were approached, and of these 30 responded. Participants were asked a total of 35 questions, covering a broad range of topics.

Following the completion and preliminary analysis of the questionnaire results, in-depth semi-structured interviews were conducted in all six countries amongst 14 practitioners, with a view to further exploring the issues revealed in the questionnaire. No fewer than 2-3 practitioners were selected from each participating country, to ensure diversity across the region. Many participants, both in the online questionnaire and interviews, reported themselves to be operating across more than one country in any case, and some had region-wide responsibilities. A broad mix of participants was sought, according to age, gender, seniority, in-house versus consultancy, and other participant variables which might have the potential to affect results. This targeting is explained...
further in the full report. Interviewees were asked 32 questions, broadly similar to the online questionnaire though mostly structured in a more open-ended manner to obtain qualitative insights.

By combining the questionnaire, interviews, inter-cultural PR literature review and broader contextual research in this way, the author sought to:

(1) help address a scarcity of documented practitioner perspectives and broad worldviews ‘at the coalface’ of professional practice, especially in South East Asian environments; and

(2) test, at least tentatively, the extent to which public relations practice in this region may be understood more deeply by considering concepts and theories that have arisen from other social science academic disciplines.

**Limitations of the study**

The research draws heavily on the membership of two major professional associations with a strong international outlook, perhaps giving it a more globally-aware flavour than might be the case with a differently drawn sample of practitioners. The practitioners all exhibit high levels of English language proficiency, which may also affect the regional representativeness of the sample. Similarly, the fact that the research was conducted entirely in English may mean that the full richness that could be revealed by a multilingual research study drawing on commentary and outlooks available in other languages will have eluded this writer. To the extent possible, the researcher has sought to compensate for this by making particular note of any respondent comments highlighting linguistic considerations and concerns of non-English speaking populations, and to ensure that such observations are well documented (once again, in English, with whatever limitations this might entail).

**Selected findings: Yes, culture does matter - but that’s not all**

In the spirit of helping to construct what Holger Sievert and Stefan Porter (2009) have described as a much-needed ‘global dashboard’ for international communicators, this writer’s research amongst South East Asian communication practitioners has highlighted a number of distinctive local and regional issues which extend beyond obvious matters of ‘cultural difference’ and arguably warrant greater attention than they have received to date.

Not surprisingly, 100 per cent of survey respondents agreed that culture was an important factor to consider in communication programs in the region, and high agreement ratings were also given to a range of other propositions concerning the importance of local environmental knowledge. However, perhaps the most revealing aspects of the research came at the qualitative interview stage, where more subtle and nuanced issues came to the fore.

It may be going too far to suggest that any of these issues are just being ‘discovered’, but it might reasonably be argued that the level of explicit recognition and analysis they have attracted in public relations and corporate communication circles remains very limited to date. On that basis, they appear to be worthy of greater exposure. Some highlights are summarised below.

**Language issues**
One of the more challenging outcomes of the research is a conclusion which can readily be
drawn that knowledge not just of culture but of the structure and composition of local
language can be important to achieving effective communication results. Comments made by
one interviewee, for example, about the national language of Indonesia, Bahasa Indonesia,
being built more on oral tradition than literary tradition, suggests that simple translation of
corporate communication documents from English into Indonesian may produce
disappointing results amongst targeted readers, if no other adjustments are made to mode of
delivery or other tactics. According to this successful local practitioner, Bahasa is well suited
to informal discussion but not nearly as well suited to detailed documentation and analysis of
the kind commonly to be found in PR background papers and the like.

Interviews highlighted the fact that the diversity of languages spoken within individual
countries of South East Asia – and the distinctive qualities of each – continues to receive
scant attention amongst PR scholars. Once more taking Indonesia as an example, there are
hundreds of languages spoken across the diverse archipelago, with the largest being Javanese,
spoken by around 100 million people (Robson, 2004). Importantly, it cannot be assumed that
most of these people are equally fluent in Bahasa Indonesia; education and literacy levels in
the national language vary widely even across the island of Java, let alone more widely across
the diverse and far-flung archipelago.

It is worth reflecting for a moment on the implications of this kind of statistic for effective
communication campaigns of many kinds, including, for example, national health education
campaigns, or corporate reputation programs for mass consumer brands: as many as 100
million people in one part of one country alone, many of whom do not have their strongest
fluency in either the national language of the nation nor in English. Indonesian practitioners
increasingly need to consider such challenges, as do practitioners elsewhere across the region,
but to date ‘international’ public relations scholarship has been largely silent on the matter.

Complex considerations around language and literacy levels are by no means confined to
Indonesia. Respondents indicated parallels in other nations of the region, with variations
according to local circumstances. In some parts of the region, however, the task was seen to
be easier. For example, the Philippines, for all its recognised difficulties with poverty,
nonetheless enjoys high levels of literacy in the national language, Pilipino (Tagalog), as well
as a majority of the population comfortable using English as a second or third language.
Vietnam, for its part, is a country in which English is not widely spoken nationwide (though
increasingly embraced by young and upwardly mobile urbanites) but which can boast more
than 90 per cent literacy in the national language, Vietnamese – no small achievement in a
developing nation still emerging from a lengthy period of 20th century upheaval.

But elsewhere in the region, language considerations present conundrums to the 21st century
corporate communication practitioner. It has been observed, for example, that Thai language
does not lend itself readily to fast, interactive online communication (Asia Media Forum,
2010), creating considerable challenges in reconciling local language with global business
communication patterns and technologies. The result at times appears to be the emergence of
distinctive new forms of hybrid online language that are neither one language nor another.

A successful practitioner in Vietnam remarked at length to this researcher about the distinct
structural challenges presented by that country’s language, which was, he said, “hard wired”
with a respect for authority built into its grammatical structure. This had to be borne in mind
when conducting local PR activities, and particularly when translating materials to and from
local audiences, so that not just literal meanings but matters of tone and respect were also
properly addressed. For example, when speaking to a person in Vietnamese each statement needed to be preceded by acknowledgement of the relationship between the speaker and the person being addressed – for example, “em” when speaking to a younger person, “anh” when speaking to a comparable or older man, “ba” for an older woman, “ong” for a very senior man, and so on. As this practitioner observed: “The pronouns shape everything.” Yet when speaking or writing in English, such locally important nuances of relationship and social context almost inevitably disappear.

Even in ‘western-friendly’ Singapore, with English its official language, there are complex linguistic undercurrents to be found. For example, Singaporeans are expected to learn at least two languages: English, and the mother tongue of their own ethnic group. The success of this bilingualism has been a cornerstone of Singapore’s success as a community and an economy, but not without ongoing complications. Ethnic Chinese in Singapore are more likely to have come from Hokkien or Cantonese speaking backgrounds (dialects different to Mandarin, the official language of China). In the modern world of international business, Mandarin is becoming much more useful. However, Singapore’s multi-racial composition would make it difficult to insist on any version of Chinese as the national language, particularly amongst Indians and Malays. English was adopted as the official language on the basis that English language was more acceptable across all groups, and provided better access to the rest of the world, in which English was, if not always the first language, then very commonly a secondary language. In practice, there has been wide variation in language proficiency between Singaporeans based on their education levels, ethnicity, and generations – at times leading to a level of fragmentation, isolation and uncertainty between groups.

In an effort to bolster Singapore’s Mandarin capabilities, founding Prime Minister and now elder statesman Lew Kuan Yew has urged Chinese Singaporeans to speak English at school and Mandarin at home, to ensure younger generations develop greater Mandarin proficiency (Toh and Ong, 2011). Incidentally, Mandarin is Mr Lee’s fourth language, after English, Hokkien, and Malay.

In a reflection of how some of this plays out in managing national communication activities, when presenting his annual address for Singapore’s National Day, Prime Minister Lee Hsien Loong gives a live broadcast firstly in Malay, recognising Singapore’s origins as a breakaway from the Malaysian federation, and then repeats it in Mandarin. After a short break, he addresses the audience again, this time in English (Straits Times, 2011). Despite ethnic Indians being close to 10 per cent of the population (Department of Statistics, 2012) their language is not used officially at any time. If this was to change, it would raise the question as to which language to use, based on the breakdown of Singapore’s Indian population: Malayalam, Gujarati, Punjabi, Hindi - or perhaps one of the 18 other officially recognised Indian languages? Given India’s common background as a British colony, it is fortuitous that English has long been a second language throughout most of India, and remains the second recognised national language of India, for official business, after Hindi.

In the realm of religion, Malay remains the dominant language of instruction in Singapore’s mosques, preaching to those of the Islamic faith, but a trend has been reported for sermons and religious classes, at some mosques, to be presented in English (Othman, 2009). In contrast, in nearby Malaysia, government authorities have recently moved to stop the customary use of English language high school text books in mathematics and science, replacing them with Bahasa Malaysia-based texts (Renganayar, 2012). At least one Malaysian school has moved recently to make Arabic a mandatory language, rather than its long-established customary place as an elective (Renganayar, 2012). Language can be seen in
this context as an actively considered tool of politics and religion in some quarters, as much as a simple reflection of local custom, and communication practitioners may need to become more mindful of this over time.

At a more mundane level, judging the extent of local media translation needs was reported to be an issue for some practitioners interviewed for this study. One practitioner working in both Indonesia and Singapore explained that local translation of print and video materials was important in Indonesia because English is not as widely spoken as elsewhere in the region, but it was less important in Singapore where English is almost universally spoken. But judgment calls were still required even in Singapore, with another practitioner explaining that when targeting groups such as Tamil or Malay media in Singapore it was necessary to translate all items intended for publication or broadcast into the appropriate language, but accompanying emails could be written in English. Phone conversations could also occur in English. In Thailand, the picture was reported to be somewhat more mixed; but as a general rule, the further one travelled from the big cities, the more important translation became.

Other examples of linguistic sensitivity driven by educational, political, religious, cultural and other factors were identified across the region. Overall, the picture that emerges is that language use is a matter which needs to be approached deliberately and with careful forethought – not only taking account of what language can be understood by a particular target public, but also what will be the most effective, respectful and appropriate use of language and mode of delivery in each situation, given the complex considerations of education levels, differences in dialect, local cultural, religious and political sensitivities, and other factors. Often the choice of language/s and mode/s of delivery is simple and unproblematic, but at other times less so than it might first appear to an outsider.

Education

Two issues emerged clearly in regard to education. One of these relates to education in general within the region, and how the work of communication practitioners can be complicated by the diversity in education levels within nations and across the region (as noted above in the context of linguistic considerations). The second relates to professional education for practitioners, and the fact that many practitioners evidently see severe shortcomings in local public relations and corporate communication education offerings intended to provide a foundation for success in their profession.

To take the first of these issues, respondents across the region – especially in Thailand and Indonesia – commented upon the challenge to practitioners seeking to develop programs aimed at reaching communities with diverse education levels and consequently differing lifestyles and media habits. Particular mention was made of the urban-rural divide in Thailand, with development and education levels said to be growing further apart in places. In the words of one Thai practitioner: “Thailand still has a technology divide. Remote provinces are very different to the city areas. You have to target audiences carefully – if your target is in a remote area you can’t use the same channels.” In Indonesia, comment was made not just on the urban-rural divide but a massive divide to be found even within the national capital. As one Jakarta practitioner observed: “Jakarta is a city of 14 million people – less than 10 per cent are university graduates.” Clearly, such issues may have little relevance to a
marketing communication program for luxury goods for urban-dwellers, but for a nationwide public health campaign, or a campaign seeking to target emerging aspirational consumers beginning to enjoy a new-found level of discretional spending for the first time in their lives, the question of how to factor in such education and literacy variations is an important one at a strategic and tactical level.

When it comes down to the much more particular matter of education for PR and corporate communication practitioners, respondents to this study suggest there are troubling issues of other kinds to consider. A general picture emerged of most practitioners feeling, at best, only mildly supportive of university and college PR and communication programs in terms of the contribution they make to preparing people for careers in the profession.

A number of practitioners observed what they saw to be a “huge gap” between PR practice in their working world and the world of PR theory, in terms somewhat reminiscent of PR scholar Betteke Van Ruler’s (2005) paper ‘Professionals are from Venus, Scholars are from Mars’. Some contended that curriculum had not kept up enough with the changing realities on the ground in their own countries. For example, one senior practitioner in Malaysia complained of the poor level of strategic thinking she saw in Malaysian practice: “There is so much emphasis on events here. A monkey with a checklist can run an event – but it’s a strategic thinker who has to do the checklist.” The same practitioner described local academic studies and subsequent professional practice as “too tactical”, and this was one of the reasons she had recently opted to undertake Masters studies in the United Kingdom rather than at home in Malaysia. In her view, Malaysian PR studies needed to develop more focus on broader management perspectives – along the lines of those offered by management theorist Peter Drucker (2001) and others – and a stronger emphasis on identifying “what you want to achieve”.

Across the ASEAN region, views tended to range from dismissive - seeing formal PR and communication studies as simply “not relevant” - through to being, in some cases, more positive in regard to the role communication studies had played in practitioners’ own success. At the extreme end of disdain was the comment from an agency proprietor in Vietnam that “even if you are focused on western cultures a lot of the (public relations) theory is useless, with or without cultural differences. I don’t know I hold the theories up as very useful.”

Overall, a greater degree of credit was given to the value of what had been learned in the workforce, both inside and outside the profession, even amongst those who had enjoyed formal education in PR or communication or in allied fields like journalism or marketing.

One Western-educated Vietnamese practitioner took issue with PR theorist James Grunig’s advocacy of ‘symmetrical two-way communication’ between organisations and their publics: “I think two-way communication works well when both sides have good access to information. But if one side does not have adequate background or resources you can’t have effective dialogue.” In a situation like Vietnam’s, where many people remained underprivileged and had limited access to information, practitioners had no choice other than to “guide” people toward desired outcomes, she argued. With Vietnam only re-opening to the world since 1986, and most of its population still conditioned to propaganda guiding them on what to think about major issues, it was not yet an environment conducive to dialogue-driven public relations. In this practitioner’s view, it was difficult to reconcile a Grunig-style model with the realities of professional practice in Vietnam, yet this was what was being taught to public relations students.
Significantly, in making hiring decisions, most interviewees indicated they gave little weight to the question of whether or not an applicant held formal qualifications in public relations or communication studies. This may be in part a reflection of the fact that such studies remain relatively undeveloped as academic disciplines in the countries of South East Asia. But one might also entertain the possibility that the theory and practice taught in the academy is observed to be further removed from the realities of professional practice in South East Asia than it is in North America and western Europe. If the latter is true, the question of how to close this gap will be an important one for the future relevance and survival of these academic disciplines seeking to win greater acceptance and respect in the region.

**Differences in infrastructure, development and local habits**

One factor which emerged strongly in the research is the amount of consideration many South East Asian practitioners say they must give to differences in infrastructure levels, including computer and internet access and mobile telephone networks. Beyond the question of sheer accessibility, the matter of local communication _habits_ loomed large as well – an aspect which goes beyond what people _can_ access to consider as well what they _want_ to access.

Asked about the relevance of such considerations in their own countries, nearly 70 per cent of survey participants rated these as ‘often important’, and a major factor in their decision-making about what to do with campaigns and programs. Just over 30 per cent rated them as ‘sometimes important’. Not a single South East Asian practitioner rated these matters as ‘never important’.

In the interviews, reasons for this were more fully elucidated. One Indonesian practitioner emphasised some distinctive characteristics of the Indonesian technology scene. While only 14 per cent of the total population (of around 250 million) had internet access, 67 per cent had access to mobile phones – and with the rapid growth of smartphones within this, this meant the primary growth in internet usage was now coming from people using hand-held devices rather than computers sitting on desks.

The short message SMS format was said to be especially appealing in the Indonesian context, partly because of the structure of the national language, Bahasa Indonesia, which readily renders statements into short conversational chunks. Other aspects of Indonesian lifestyle were also said to favour the popularity of social media interaction as well. In the words of one Jakarta practitioner: “There’s something about Indonesian culture. People like to gather, have coffee and gossip. This is very conducive to much of the social media experience too.” He noted that one of the more interesting characteristics of the Indonesian scene in recent years had been the exceptional popularity of the Blackberry smartphone. One reason, he felt, was its ‘group discussion’ feature allowing for simultaneous conversation between several people – a particularly appealing feature for economic reasons, keeping down the cost of staying in touch with friends and family – as well as for the ‘virtual gathering’ that it made possible amongst groups of friends often separated by distance or heavy urban traffic. “People will ask ‘What is your (Blackberry) PIN number?’ It’s often more important than your phone number.”

Other interviewees gave their own distinctive examples about communication practices and customs and how these linked to technology access in each of the six countries surveyed. Comments highlighted not just some country-by-country differences, but also differences at the provincial level on occasion. Overall, the research suggests that when formulating
communication programs for countries of the region, it may be unwise to make sweeping assumptions about what is “right for Thailand” on a nation-wide basis, or “right for Malaysia”, and so on. By analogy: What’s good for New York may be fine for Denver and San Diego too, because of similar infrastructure and consumer habits, but what’s good for Bangkok may not be good for Chiang Rai or Songkhla. A clever online campaign which hits the mark in Ho Chi Minh City and Hanoi might prove invisible in Haiphong and Can Tho. And so on. The reasons for this may be multifaceted; partly about incomes and education, partly about unevenness in infrastructure, partly about issues of local dialect, accents or local lifestyles, and sometimes about other distinctive one-off factors (for example, the apparent Indonesian urban love affair with the Blackberry, making it a potentially powerful campaign response tool in that location). Issues of this nature may seem less significant when campaigns seek only to target the ‘low hanging fruit’ of affluent people in the biggest cities, but the significance is likely to rise considerably as the imperative grows to reach more of the national populations beyond the biggest cities.

More broadly, interviewees confirmed that a growing appetite for instantaneous two-way dialogue is as apparent in South East Asia as it is elsewhere in the world, with many populations rapidly leap-frogging over the stages of technological development experienced across a longer period in western countries. Hundreds of millions of people, in many cases with limited formal education, and no previous ownership of a land-based telephone or desktop computer, are arming themselves with internet-enabled smartphones, and now able to access and respond to multiple sources of information in ways never before experienced in their communities. The example of community ‘self-help’ administered via social media, at the time of recent major floods in Thailand, provided just one instance of how communities are learning to by-pass slow moving and less-than-candid official information channels to seek out the comfort and information they need. It seems that the implications of this for communication practitioners in the region – not to mention some governments - are only just beginning to be grasped.

Media systems

Asked about their local media environments, most practitioners had comments to make which highlighted distinctive features of their local media scenes. These often related to ownership patterns, and in particular the multiple commercial interests of media owners. Another frequently remarked upon feature was the closeness of major media owners to governments, notably (though not exclusively) in Malaysia, and in some cases full ownership and control of most media by government interests (most notably Vietnam and Singapore). More vigorous and freely critical media were reported in Thailand and the Philippines, though not without certain areas of sensitivity which practitioners said they needed to bear in mind when mounting campaigns.

From Manila, one successful agency proprietor conceded the conduct of PR campaigns needed to take careful account of local media characteristics in all locations: “In a country like Singapore one’s options for PR campaigns are probably limited because of their censorship or control the government has over the media. Here it’s easier to have access to the media and get coverage for ideas.” But he described media ethics as a continuing stumbling block in the Philippines, with the practice of so-called “envelopmental journalism” (bribes to journalists delivered in envelopes) still prevailing in some quarters. He nominated “show business” as a media sector in which envelopmental journalism remained particularly rife.
Some practitioners’ concerns about media environments were more mundane, even ironic. For example, one practitioner in Singapore lamented: “Sadly, it’s come to the point where the media in Asia tend to cater to what’s popular at the moment, rather than what they think people should be reading about. It’s too populist.” In a rare example of a PR practitioner bemoaning the perils of media showing too much interest in their media release, she recalled her involvement in the launch of personal banking via the Apple iPhone, which had resulted in local journalists coming back to her “again and again”, repeatedly searching for new angles on the same story, far beyond its innate merits: “It gets tedious.”

One Bangkok practitioner emphasised the special importance of the journalist-practitioner relationship in Thailand, contending that “relationships are quite different in Thailand”. Both sides were close and forthcoming with each other about their needs – more so than in many other countries, in his experience. This was sometimes helpful but had its pitfalls too, as the working relationship risked becoming “too personal”. The same practitioner noted that government in Thailand exercised somewhat less control over local media than in times gone by, but that “in the last few years some political problems have strained things”.

A practitioner in Vietnam noted the paradox that while Vietnamese people tended to have little trust in government and authority, they retained a level of trust in their media – despite the fact that it was heavily government controlled. They reserved particularly high esteem for print media, he said. In this respect, members of the public made a distinction between what the practitioner called “real journalists” and “online journalists”, with real journalists being seen as the ones who appeared in print. While there was growing interest in blogs in some quarters, trust in the output of bloggers, reportedly, was yet to be strong in Vietnam.

One practitioner dividing his time between Bangkok and Ho Chi Minh City took issue with the suggestion that media environments in Asian countries were any more “sensitive” than their western counterparts: “If you say something wrong to a western journalist they can be extremely sensitive.” There were, he contended, only a small number of “no go” areas remaining in both countries; for example, in Vietnam, one could not speculate about democracy and changes to the system of governance, and in Thailand it was not permissible to make statements criticising the monarchy. But outside of those, in the commercial world there were now very few “no go” areas remaining. Almost anything else could receive coverage, he argued – “as long as it’s interesting”.

Another observation from Vietnam, perhaps significantly, was that while mainstream news and current affairs outlets remain mainly under state control and with little prospect to include content which might cause discomfort to government and its associated business interests, there had been strong recent growth in entertainment, show business and lifestyle publications, and growing PR practitioner influence seeping into them – sometimes including subtle discussion of contentious social and political issues as well. A form of ‘backdoor democracy,’ it might be said.

One Malaysian practitioner felt it was important to recognise the significance of ethnic media divisions in some circumstances: “It helps to consider how to position your client. (For example) you may not get much traction profiling a Chinese business client in Malay media.” The segmentation of media interest along ethnic lines at times went as far as to lead to major differences in what was being reported to different groups in Malaysia.

From these and other examples given across the region, it can be seen that interviewees had a wide variety of perspectives on what they felt were the most noteworthy characteristics of
their local media environments. The majority noted, one way or another, issues around journalistic freedom, media ownership, government ownership and/or control, the significance of ethnic media segmentation, and the shifting relationships between traditional ‘mainstream’ media and rapidly evolving social online media channels. While practitioners in all countries reported some overlapping themes and issues, it is noteworthy that individuals in each location also highlighted some distinctive ways in which these issues were said to play out in their own locations. This is discussed in more detail in the full research report.

Politics

Politics featured strongly in the discussion of local practitioners, confirming contentions by earlier researchers including Vercic, Grunig and Grunig (1996), Sriramesh (2004) and others which have suggested that PR’s societal role in a free ‘contest of ideas’, or ‘marketplace of opinions’, may have severe limitations in countries with political characteristics removed from western-liberal traditions, no matter whether they proclaim themselves to be socialist, pro-business, democratic or of any other hue.

A particularly striking outcome of the online survey is that more than 62 per cent reported that political sensitivities were sometimes a major consideration in their decision-making about work, with 17 per cent saying it was a frequent consideration. ‘Fear of offending authorities’ was the most frequently expressed reason for such concern (54.2 per cent). However, the steady rise of online social media and its ability to cut through censorship attracted considerable comment from interviewees across the region, mainly of a positive nature.

In the interviews some practitioners were particularly strident about the difficulties created by pervasive government control and vested interests in government. As one in Jakarta lamented: “We don’t do political stuff, because we don’t think the politicians are ready for it. We don’t touch it. I’m interested in politics, but I don’t think the environment here is ready for real PR in that area.” Rather than having open competition and debate between different interest groups, this local practitioner contended that the Indonesian scene was still characterised by “elite politics, and pork barrel politics between the elites”, with elections held regularly to legitimise the deals made between groups. “There is no grass roots power as such, and until you get to that stage a lot of PR (which assumes open competition for popular opinion) will not be meaningful.”

Another practitioner, in Ho Chi Minh City, sounded similarly bleak: “A lot of the time we have to get involved – for example when there is sponsorship of events from government. It’s not pleasant dealing with government officers. They’re usually looking for something, either power or monetary reward. I just try to minimise all government involvements.”

Not all interviewees were as harsh as this – and some interviewees had more to say about the perils of internal organisational politics than politics on the national stage – but nevertheless a clear enough picture emerged of a community of practitioners feeling the need to tread warily in their professional work, mindful of the unevenness of the “contest of ideas” in many countries of the region, whether due to the power of government or the power of those who pull the strings of government. One interviewee in Manila, notwithstanding positive comments he made about the general openness of the Filipino media environment in many respects, made the most chilling remark of all when explaining why he had decided not to undertake any PR work with obvious political implications: “I know of a number of political PR operatives who have been very effective – but one day have just disappeared.”
Other factors

A range of other influences ‘beyond culture’ were also highlighted in interviews. These included gender issues, dissonance between the personal views of practitioners and those who employ them, and important nuances around what constitutes ethical and responsible behaviour in different locations. These are discussed in more detail in a paper presented by this author to the Corporate Communication International Conference, Baruch College, City University of New York in June 2013 (Domm, 2013) and soon to be published in the Corporate Communication International Journal.

Conclusions

It would seem that success in public relations and corporate communication practice in South East Asia does require more than mere ‘cultural sensitivity’, important as that may be. Based on this sample, it appears that success also requires an awareness of complexity around issues including language, media systems, local politics, infrastructure and development levels, communication habits and a range of other matters that go beyond culture (or at least are intertwined with it in complex and subtle ways).

Based on the research findings, it could be suggested that existing ‘international’ public relations theory still has a way to go in accommodating such complexity, though it should also be conceded that interest in more sophisticated forms of ‘cross-cultural’ scholarship appears to be growing. It will be important for scholarship to embrace the full range of local characteristics and contexts that may impact upon professional practice, in addition to those of culture alone.

In the full research project upon which this paper is based, it is suggested that an understanding of matters including comparative religion, politics including colonialism and post-colonialism, anthropology, sociology, cultural and critical studies, economics and broader communication theory might prove fruitful in assisting the formation of a more comprehensive understanding of the communication environments in which 21st century practitioners operate, in this region and elsewhere, and that such understanding might contribute toward a better synthesis between public relations and broader social science disciplines in future years.

Apart from the value such synthesis could have in its own right, it is likely to serve the interests of corporate communication and PR professions wanting to be taken more seriously as contributors to social development and prosperity around the globe, and the interests of scholars in these fields who wish to cement the perceived relevance of their disciplines in a world that is rapidly becoming more diverse and multi-polar in its sources of influence. The insightful perspectives of South East Asian public relations and corporate communication practitioners can be seen as interesting and instructive in their own right, but might usefully be viewed through these other prisms as well.

REFERENCES

Bardhan, N (2011), Culture, communication and third culture building in public relations within global flux. In Bardhan, N, and Weaver, C K (eds), Public relations in global cultural contexts: Multi-paradigmatic perspectives, Routledge, Abingdon, UK; pp 77-107


Domm, G (2013), Beyond Culture: Further dimension of difference in corporate communication operating environments in South East Asia, Corporate Communication International Conference, Baruch College, City University of New York, 5-7 June 2013


Grunig, J (1992), Excellence in Public Relations and Communication Management, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Hillsdale, NJ, USA


Hall, E (1977), Beyond Culture, Avon, New York, USA

Hall, S (1992), The question of cultural identity. In Hall, S, Held, D and McGrew, T (eds), Modernity and its futures, Polity Press in association with the Open University, Cambridge, UK


Hofstede, G (1981), Culture’s consequences: Comparing values, behaviors, institutions and organisations across nations, Sage/Corwin Press, Thousand Oaks, CA, USA
Hofstede, G (2001), *Culture’s consequences: Comparing values, behaviors, institutions and organisations across nations*, Second edition, Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA, USA


Kaur, K, Ahmad, J, Ch’ng, M, Ismail, H, and Annaur, S (1999), *Principles of Public Relations*, University Teknologi Mara, Shah Alam, Malaysia

L’Etang, J (2011), Imagining public relations anthropology. In Edwards, L, and Hodges, C (eds), *Public relations, society and culture: Theoretical and empirical explorations*, Routledge, Abingdon, UK; pp 15-32

Othman, D (2009), Some mosques using English more, *Straits Times*, 29 January, p B5).


Renganayyar, C D (2012), Students left carrying a mixed bag, *New Sunday Times*, Kuala Lumpur, 15 January


Van Ruler, B (2005), Professionals are from Venus, Scholars are from Mars, *Public Relations Review, 31,* pp 159-173


ABSTRACT

How is IMC strategies on advertising agency?
The Indonesian style of Dwi Sapta IMC company

Retno Hendariningrum
Communication Department
Faculty of Social and Political Science
University of Pembangunan Nasional “Veteran” Yogyakarta
Jl.Babarsari No.2 Tambakbayan
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
retno_hendari@yahoo.com.sg

Integrated Marketing Communication (IMC) was a communication marketing planning process that introduced comprehensive planning process to evaluate strategic roles of various marketing communication elements, such as public relation, advertising, direct selling, sales promotion and interactive marketing to give explanation, consistence, and maximum communication effect.

Dwi Sapta IMC Company was one of national advertising agencies in Indonesia. In order to the agency development and the clients’ product development, Dwi Sapta was based on Integrated Marketing Communication (IMC). The aim of this research was to find out Dwi Sapta IMC Company’s strategies as an advertising agency in implementing IMC strategies to reach and maintain the clients. The utilized research method was qualitative descriptive method. The data was obtained through interview, observation, and literary study.

The research result indicated that IMC strategies implemented by Dwi Sapta had their own different Indonesian style. Dwi Sapta IMC Company was successful to take this agency to be Top 5 player in Indonesia. The success of Dwi Sapta was supported by its unique characters. The character building was done in it and Dwi Sapta was an experimental field of character building. Dwi Sapta had The Triple P of Dwi Sapta, which was started from the Philosophy. Philosophy was Dwi Sapta’s main values of cultural support pillars. These values were the most essential element for Dwi Sapta. The elements were “client’s success is our success”, “commitment for Excellence”, “serve with the heart”, “care to our people,” and “give to society”.

These values shaped thinking and acting pattern of all Dwi Sapta individuals in implementing daily company’s activities. The second P was “the principles”. The “principles” was the principles in building strategies, tactics, and Integrated Marketing Communication programs (IMC). The third P was “the practices”. “The practices” was Dwi Sapta’s practices as an agency in handling clients using the existing principles.

Keywords: IMC, Dwi Sapta, philosophy, principles, practices.
ABSTRACT

Communication in stakeholder engagement and corporate brand-building: A Starbucks case

Chun-ju Flora Hung-Baesecke, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor
Department of Communication Studies
Hong Kong Baptist University
Hong Kong

Corporations nowadays function in a diverse, complex environment with dynamic stakeholders. Steyn (2003) pointed out that the business role in society in the 90s has moved to the ‘corporate community’ approach in that stakeholders are considered partners of an organization in this socioeconomic business environment, and stakeholders co-create values with organizations. As a result, organizations should integrate socio-political-economic resources and views to enhance their competitive advantage.

In dealing with an ever-changing and complex business environment, the role of corporate communication has no longer just been fixing the negative media coverage, or creating “noise” for organizations (Schulz & Kitchen, 2007). Various studies (e.g. L. Grunig, et al, 2002; Yang & J. Grunig, 2005; Bronn, 2007) have shown that public relations helped building mutually beneficial relationships with stakeholders, improving return on investment, and enhancing corporate reputation. The functions of corporate communication should be interactive, integrated, global, intangible values, bringing values to customers (and stakeholders), helping building alliances, leading with communication, and establishing the corporate brand (Schulz & Kitchen, 2004).

Yet, Gregory (2007) contended that corporate communication for effective brand-building is largely under examined by empirical research. As this is the corporate community era, corporations should build a brand with values that are widely accepted by stakeholders who are partners for corporations. The “negotiated brand” (Gregory, 2007) that the corporation works on with the stakeholders and responds to their inputs will bring competitiveness for the corporation. Communication therefore is important in building the negotiated brand.

This study aims to explore how Starbucks, a community-oriented corporation with a shared-value corporate mission, applies different communication strategies in engaging with stakeholders for enhancing the corporate brand and benefiting the community. Its mission has guided the company in collaborating with NGOs and its global community in promoting quality coffee and being a responsible company. The efforts of engaging with different
stakeholders have made Starbucks a unique brand.

This study employed the methodology of case study to identify how corporate core values and corporate communication in engaging stakeholders play a role in enhancing the corporate brand. In specific, Starbucks’ recent re-branding campaign was the main focus of this research. Methods for this study included 1) interviews with Starbucks corporate communication department, its public relations agency, the community (e.g. the NGOs), and the consumers; and 2) document analysis on Starbucks’ company profile, media reports and its communication strategy documents. The results indicate, first, acknowledging employees as partners of the company highly motivated the employees’ participation for sharing visions of company development and enhanced employee commitment. Second, engaging NGOs in community service efforts has enabled the company’s co-creating the values of the brand appreciated by different stakeholders. Third, effectively conveying corporate visions and missions by diverse two-way communication strategies and channels helped achieving mutual understanding between the company and the influential stakeholders.
ABSTRACT

Integrated Marketing Communication in Nutrition Segment

Dr Varsha Jain (Correspondence Author)
Assistant Professor, Integrated Marketing communication
Chair, Dissertation and MICAMINDS (Student Consulting Cell)
Mudra Institute of Communications
Shela, Ahmedabad – 380058
India
Phone: 09879394222
varsha@micamail.in; varsha8075@yahoo.co.in

Neha Damle
Management Trainee-Account Planner
DDB Mudra Group "Mudra House", Opp. Grand Hyatt,
Santacruz (E), Mumbai 400055. Tel : 022-33080808
neha.damle@ddbmudragroup.com; nehadamle11@micamail.in
91-8898782279

Khyati Jagani
Research Assistant
Mudra Institute of Communications
Shela, Ahmedabad – 380058
India
Phone : 09409435556
khyati@micamail.in

Integrated Marketing Communication (IMC) combines advertising, sales promotion, public relations and direct marketing by developing clear, consistent and relevant marketing message (Schultz, 1993). In the present market where communication is cluttered, IMC helps in creating an interactive communication strategy through consumer engagement (Moriarty & Schultz, 2012).

Nutraceutical, a combination of nutrition and pharmaceutical, has become one of the fastest growing sectors. The Indian market is estimated to reach at US $2.7billion in 2016 at a CAGR of 13%, from US $1.5billion in 2011 (Corporate Catalyst India, 2012). Although rapidly growing, it is a difficult segment to market through different media as there are many rules for marketing messages. The application of IMC is therefore not as straightforward as in other product segments such as FMCG goods or consumer durables because of regulatory restrictions in the communication of the message. Marketers thus have to integrate all the communication and marketing approaches in a strategic and tactful.

Using the four theories of IMC (interactive, perceptual integration, reciprocity and process), four research questions were developed to understand the perspective of all the stakeholders: (i) How do advertising executives’ apply IMC with respect to communication messages? (ii) What role does IMC play in influencing doctors and how does it influence the end consumer? (iii) What role does a chemist/pharmacist play at the point of purchase in influencing a consumer to buy a particular brand? (iv)What are the consumer beliefs with respect to nutritional supplements and how does IMC affect their purchase decisions?
Qualitative research through 28 semi-structured in-depth interview was conducted with four stakeholders; namely advertising agency planners, doctors, chemist and consumers in Mumbai, India’s most populous city that has health conscious consumers.

It was found that advertising agencies educate the consumers and increase their confidence in the nutrition segment by different media channels. They differentiate the brands through innovative and exclusive communication messages. Doctors gain knowledge of various brands primarily from the medical representative and medical conferences. It helps them in recommending the brand to the consumer based on their requirement. Doctors play an important role in influencing and guiding consumers about the need to include nutritional supplements in their daily diet. Moreover, in-store communication between the chemist and the consumer plays an important role in the final decision of the consumer. In-store promotion, knowledge of chemist and location of the pharmacy also play an important role in selecting the brand. Consumers consider nutritional supplements as curative solution then a preventive measure. They prefer doctor prescribed brands but also take recommendations from the chemist. They also believe in worth of mouth publicity of brands and healthcare articles. It implies that marketers need to develop strong association with doctors, educate chemist, create innovative in-store promotions and educate the consumer through creative, informative and engaging marketing approach to thrive in the market.

References

Cleary, L. (2009). Integration is the name of the game. Media Forum.


ABSTRACT

Coverage of China in the Egyptian press:
A content analysis of years before and after Egypt’s revolution

Kevin L. Keenan, PhD
Department of Journalism and Mass Communication
American University in Cairo
AUC Avenue, Box 78
New Cairo 11835, Egypt
keenan@aucegypt.edu

In recent years, numerous studies have examined the portrayal of China and the content of news stories about China in western media. Findings generally show substantial increases in the coverage of China and topics related to China over time. They also tend to indicate certain foci and patterns in the kind of coverage the country receives. One summary of existing research suggests the US media in particular have been increasingly negative and tend to concentrate on crisis events in covering China (Li & Tang, 2012).

Missing from the literature until now is consideration of how China is covered in less developed parts of the world, including Africa and the Middle East. The research described here is intended to address this omission in part by describing a content analysis which looks at the coverage of China in Al-Ahram, the largest circulation newspaper in Egypt. This work includes evaluation of coverage both before and after the Egyptian revolution of 2011, as there are indications that the relationship between the two countries has changed as a result of the revolution and its aftermath (Cunningham, 2012).

The study’s methodology consists of a full census of news items that appeared during the pre-revolution year of 2010 and the post-revolution year of 2012. An online keyword search of the Al-Ahram website for “China,” and sub-searches for “Hong Kong” and “Macau,” produced a total of 130 items in 2010 and 209 items in 2012. Each item was coded by two independent investigators on a number of dimensions, including overall tone, topic area, location and length of item, and centrality of China focus.

Analysis is currently underway, with the full data set of 339 news stories providing an overall profile of recent press coverage of China in Egypt and comparisons of the pre-revolution and post-revolution years offered for comparison throughout. Findings should contribute some understanding of how China comes across through the media in a previously unstudied part of the world and an examination of possible changes since the 2011 revolution in Egypt. They should also serve as a starting point for further consideration of how China is presented by media outside the west and the developed world.

Implications of the research for practice and theory in public relations, communication, and nation branding are touched on and ideas about future studies in the area are brought up. Conclusions are put forward relating the value and fit of the study to the themes and interests of the First International Corporate and Marketing Communication in Asia Conference.
REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

Corporate blogging and microblogging – how and why is it being used and to what end?

Melanie King
PhD candidate – Public Communication
UTS (University of Technology, Sydney)
Melanie.king@uts.edu.au

Social media communication channels blogs and Microblogs as part of Web 2.0 are designed to be at best collaborative, participatory and engaging. Corporate blogs and microblogs are those created on behalf of organisations, primarily their public relations or corporate communications practitioners.

The use of social media channels by Australian corporations, compared with other corporations in Australasia and in Europe (Macnamara & Zerfass 2012) is similar to those of the US; microblogging is more popular in Australasia than in Europe where blogs are more popular (Macnamara & Zerfass 2012, p. 296).

Web 2.0 social media are characterised by their affordance of interactivity and transactional rather than transmissive approaches to communication. Accepted public relations and corporate communications theory discusses best ethical practice as two way and dialogic. Healthy democratic societies depend on a ‘public sphere’, now including the Internet, that is open to a range of voices and is participatory, rather than limited to top-down information flow from those in positions of power. Low levels of equality in dialogue ‘indicate low levels of commitment and imbalances of power’ (Pedersen 2006, p. 142).

An organisation’s dialogue with its publics is then of crucial importance, demonstrating trust and engagement, an interactive process allowing movement from confrontation to consultation and cooperation. The use of social media is potentially transformative and allows corporations to build relationships with their publics in a dialogic way. The intent of this research is to determine if they are being used dialogically. Until now, there were significant gaps remain in the knowledge of how corporations use social media and with what results.

This research was undertaken to determine whether or not major corporations (those on the ASX 200 and spanning many industry sectors, were interacting with their publics dialogically or simply using Web 2.0 channels in the same fashion as traditional media. 20 in-depth interviews were conducted with those responsible for social media strategy – CMOs, social media managers, or digital and community managers – in organisations which met the criteria. The expected results were based on what the theory suggests - interaction, engagement and dialogue were a given, but actual (preliminary results were quite different: interaction and dialogue are limited and engagement equates to a Facebook ‘like’ and sharing content.

The implications of these results indicate

- an opportunity to change and improve the teaching of public relations in universities, to focus more on dialogue and interaction and less on transmissive implementation; and
an opportunity to demonstrate to public relations and corporate communications practitioners that dialogue will enhance an organisation’s relationship with its publics.
ABSTRACT

In mobile advertising research, the Anglo American Behavioural models such as Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA), Technology Acceptance Model (TAM), and Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) are most commonly used theoretical underpinnings to study the consumer adoption behaviour. As these models were formulated, tested, and validated in the U.S, as evidenced in the literature, it may not predict technology adoption across all cultures. So, the inclusion of native cultural dimension (Hofstede, GLOBE and/or Hall) as a means of explanation for consumer adoption behaviour in the studies of mobile advertising studies is suggested to improve the applicability of these models across cultures. The objective of this paper is to critically review how Anglo American behavioural models were applied in mobile advertising studies of Asian countries and to check out whether Cultural elements have been looked into while adopting Anglo-American models of behavioural theories as a means of explanation for consumer adoption behaviour. The critical review reveals that majority of the mobile advertising studies applied Anglo American models without considering the native cultural values of the consumers and there is also a lack of comprehensive cross-cultural study in the mobile advertising adoption literature. For the future research direction, the paper suggests that upcoming studies can investigate mobile advertising adoption by integrating culture as an integral component in the Anglo American behavioural theories. Studies need to be conducted between developing countries and also between developing and developed countries to get more insights into consumer behaviour in diverse cultural context. This will render useful implications as to expanding mobile advertising business across cultures.

Key words: Anglo American Models, Mobile Advertising Adoption, Cultural Dimension
1. Introduction:

Transferring a behavioural model developed and validated in one cultural context to another requires rigorous testing (McCoy et al, 2007). In mobile advertising adoption literature, the U.S. based Anglo American Behavioural models such as Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA), Technology Acceptance Model (TAM), and Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) are the most commonly used theoretical underpinnings. Since these Anglo American behavioural models were formulated, tested, and validated in the U.S, which has a well developed technology infrastructure with different cultural values, the application of the same models in developing countries context requires some caution. As human behaviours are subject to societal and cultural influences, it is reasonable to assume that psychological constructs (attitude, intention and behaviour) and processes may vary and be functional in a specific society and culture (Yoo, 2009). Previous researches on information systems adoption demonstrated that when applying Anglo American models such as TRA, TAM, and TPB in developing countries context that must be led by specificities of native cultural dimension (Pavlou & Chai, 2002; McCoy et al, 2007; Ling 2009; Miller & Khera, 2010; Akour & Dwairi,2011; McCoy et al, 2007; and Alsughayir & Alberq, 2012. To date, a lot of research has been done on mobile advertising acceptance around the world. Much of the existing studies on mobile technology usage and mobile advertising have been conducted in developed countries; those studies can hardly be applied to study the problem in developing countries (Saadeghvaziri and Seyedjavadain, 2011). As cultural characteristics of the individuals affect their belief, attitude, and behaviour toward advertising (Wang and Sun, 2010), it is imperative for the researchers to study the consumer acceptance of mobile advertising specific to developing nations’ context.

According to Hofstede (1980 and 2001), who proposed a dominant metric of cultural values, one’s attitude, behaviour and life pattern can fit into five cultural dimensions: Power Distance, Individualism/Collectivism, Uncertainty Avoidance, Masculinity/Femininity and Long term/Short term orientations (Mooji and Hofstede, 2010). When exploring cultures of Asian countries and U.S through the lens of Hofstede’s 5D model it is clear that Asian countries were culturally distinctive from each other and also chiefly from the U.S (refer Fig. 1). This may reflect largely in the divergence of consumer belief, attitude and behaviour toward mobile advertising when applying U.S based models in Asian setting. Hence, the inclusion of cultural dimension in mobile advertising researches of Asian countries is expected to bring some useful outcomes.

The purpose of this study is to look into how Anglo American behavioural models were applied in mobile advertising studies of Asian countries and also to check out whether Cultural elements have been looked into while adopting Anglo-American models of behavioural theories as a means of explanation for consumer adoption behaviour. The results of this paper will be helpful in providing some meaningful directions to the future studies of mobile advertising in Asian context.

The remainder of this paper is constructed in the following manner. Section 2 defines Culture, and gives an overview of various cultural dimensions such as Hofstede, GLOBE and Hall and its relevance to advertising. Section 3 provides a brief summary of Anglo American Behavioural Theories used in Mobile advertising research and reviews its applicability across various cultural contexts, Section 4 critically reviews the application of Anglo American Models in Mobile Advertising adoption research, Section 5 and Section 6 present discussion and conclusion respectively.
2. Culture and Advertising

Culture is defined as collective programming of the mind that distinguishes the members of one group or category of people from others. In other words, culture is an interactive aggregate of common characteristics that influence a group’s response to its environment (Hofstede 1980). Another Definition given by the U.S Anthropologist Edward T Hall (1976) referred culture as the way of life of people for the sum of their learned behaviour patterns, attitudes, and material things. Hall’s definition gives a functional look to the meaning of culture. From the above definitions it is understood that culture is basically learned one through interaction and which is common among the members of a group that helps distinguish one group of people from the other. A society is culturally distinguished from another based on the existing cultural values between the two societies. This is popularly known as cultural dimensions in cross-cultural research.

2.1. Dimensions of culture

One of the major breakthroughs in the study of cultural values across cultures is the landmark study of Social psychologist, Professor Geert Hofstede. He conducted a most comprehensive study of cultural influence on workplace values among the IBM employees between 1967 and 1973, covering more than 50 countries, and came up with four clusters of cultural values that differentiate one country from the other. These four groups are known as Hofstede dimensions of national culture:

- Power Distance (PDI)
- Individualism versus Collectivism (IDV)
- Masculinity versus Femininity (MAS)
- Uncertainty Avoidance (UAI)

A fifth Dimension, which is concerned with ‘Confucian dynamics’, known as Long-term orientation LTO was added in 1991 based on research by Michael Bond after his international study among students with a survey instrument that was developed together with Chinese employees and managers. Another new and sixth dimension, ‘Indulgence versus Restraint’, was added in the year 2010, based on Michael Minkov's analysis of the World Values Survey data. The model provides scales from 0 to 100 for 76 countries for the first five dimensions and each country has position on each scale or index relative to other countries (Mooji and Hofstede, 2010). According to Hofstede culture existed only in comparison and without comparison the country scores on each dimension is meaningless.

Hofstede defines all the six dimensions as follows. Power distance is defined as the extent to which the less powerful members of institutions and organizations within a country expect and accept that power is distributed unequally. Individualism/Collectivism is the degree of interdependence a society maintains among its members. Uncertainty avoidance is the extent to which the members of a culture feel threatened by ambiguous or unknown situations and have created beliefs and institutions that try to avoid these. Masculinity/Femininity dimension describes the gender roles in a society. Long-term/Short-term orientation is the extent to which a society shows a pragmatic future-oriented perspective rather than a conventional historical short-term point of view. Indulgent/Restraint is related to the gratification versus control of basic human desires related to enjoying life (Hofstede, 2011).
Of all the six dimensions the first five are the most commonly used dimensions in the advertising literature. In advertising perspective, Power distance explains the extent to which consumers are easily persuaded by marketing communication messages.

High Power distance indicates that consumers are easier to persuade by advertising messages (Wang and Sun, 2010). Individualism/collectivism is the degree of social influence (Family, friends, group opinion, reference group and etc) on buying decisions (Hossin and Hamed, 2012) In individualistic western cultures social influence has relatively weak influence as individuals refer their own attitude, where as in Collectivistic cultures individuals are in part influenced by group opinion apart from their own attitude (Yang, 2008). Uncertainty avoidance is related to consumer’s cautiousness about purchases and transactions. Consumers of High uncertainty avoidance are less open to change and adopt innovations in their life than their Low uncertainty avoidance counterparts (Wang and Sun, 2010). Masculinity and femininity dimension describes the gender roles with regard to buying behaviour. Long term/Short term orientation describes one’s attitude toward consumption/spending (Wang and Sun, 2010). Long term orientation is associated with thriftiness and consumers are reluctant to spend much (Mooji and Hofstede, 2010).
The Hofstede’s work is primarily linked with organizational culture, but his multidimensional model is most widely used national cultural framework in psychology, sociology, advertising, marketing and management sciences (Steenkamp, 2001 in Soares et al, 2007). To date there are so many replications of the Hofstede model, but one such major replication is the GLOBE (Global Leadership and Organizational Behaviour Effectiveness) Project. It was conceived by U.S. Management scholar Robert J. House in 1991. The study data was collected from about 17000 managers in nearly 1000 local organizations (Non-multinational) in some 60 society throughout the world in the period 1994 -1997. The study expanded the five Hofstede dimension to nine for conceptual reasons. It maintained labels Power distance and Uncertainty avoidance, and split Collectivism into Institutional collectivism and In-group collectivism. Masculinity/Femininity is divided into Assertiveness and Gender egalitarianism. Long term orientation became future orientation. Apart from these dimensions, two more dimensions were added, humane orientation and performance orientation.

In Globe study,

- The Performance orientation reflects the extent to which a community encourages and reward innovation, high standards, excellence and performance improvement (Grove, 2005).
- Uncertainty avoidance is the extent to which a society, organization, or group relies on social norms rules and procedures to alleviate the unpredictability of future events (House et al, 2004).
- In-group collectivism is the degree to which individuals express pride loyalty and cohesiveness in their organizations and or families (House et al, 2004).
- Gender egalitarianism is the degree to which a collective minimizes gender equality (House et al, 2004).
- Human Orientation is the degree to which an organization or society encourages and rewards individuals for being fair, altruistic, friendly, generous, caring and kind to others (House et al, 2004).
- Institutional collectivism refers to the degree to which organizational and societal institutional practices encourages and reward collective distribution of resources and collective action (House et al, 2004).
- Future orientation is the degree to which a collectively encourages and rewards future-oriented behaviour such as planning and delaying gratifications (House et al, 2004).
- Assertiveness denotes the degree to which individuals are assertive, confrontational and aggressive in their relationship with others (House et al, 2004).

Though both Hofstede and GLOBE models are found to have similarities, they still differ a lot (Shi & Wang, 2011). Studies that applied these models for investigation of cultural values ended up with two different results (Shi and Wang, 2011). GLOBE provides data on societal level and explicitly differentiates between societal values and societal practices. Further, Globe dimension has some advantages over Hofstede’s dimension as it is the only recent and comprehensive study.

Another famous cultural dimension in the cross-cultural study is Edward T Hall’s Cultural dimension. According to him culture is communication and communication is culture. He divided cultures according to their ways of communicating into high context and low context culture. In high context culture much of the information is implicit and low context culture
nearly everything is explicit (Hall, 1976). His dimension is useful in understanding the
information needs of the consumers in different cultures of the world.

Cultural influences on consumer’s beliefs, attitude and behavioural responses have been
well established in the advertising literature. Choi et al (2008) have done a cross cultural
examination of key drivers of mobile advertising message success factors between Korean
and American consumers. Adopting Hall’s parameters of cultural differences in
communication phenomena, the study found out differences between American (Low
Context) and Korean (High Context) consumers’ preferences for message characteristics. In
another cross-cultural study, Liu et al (2012) investigated consumer’s perceptions toward
mobile advertising between Japan and Austria. The study employed Hofstede and Hall’s
framework of cultural dimensions to analyse the effect of national culture. The study
demonstrated significant differences. Japanese consumers are more irritated by
advertisements than are Austrian consumers. In online advertising context, Wang and Sun
(2010) assessed beliefs, attitudes and behavioural responses in three countries namely the
U.S, China and Romania. Using both Hofstede and Hall models the study demonstrated the
significance of culture in consumer’s behavioural responses to online advertising in three
countries. Adopting gender egalitarianism from Globe dimension, Okazaki (2007) has shown
gender effects and its significance to mobile advertising acceptance behaviour.

3. Behavioural theories used in mobile advertising research

The U.S based behavioural models such as Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA),
Technology Acceptance Model (TAM), and Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) are most
commonly used theoretical frameworks in mobile advertising adoption research; these
theories were commonly used as an explanation for establishing the relationship between
adoption attitudes, behavioural intentions and actual behaviours. A brief overview of these
models is given below.

3.1. The Theory of Reasoned Action

The Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) (in Fig. 2) was first proposed by Fishbein and
Ajzen (1975). The model views individuals as rational organism and they use information at
their disposal to make judgements, form evaluations and arrive at decisions. According to this
theory, an individuals’ attitude toward performing a given behaviour is related to his/her
beliefs related to certain consequences and his/her evaluation of those consequences in
performing that behaviour. The theory viewed attitude as one major determinant of the
person’s intention to perform the behaviour in question. Apart from attitude, normative
beliefs are relevant on person’s intention. Normative beliefs denote: belief that certain
referent (people who are influential to a person. i.e., friends, family, media and etc) think that
the person should or should not perform the behaviour in question. The normative beliefs and
motivation to comply lead to normative pressures. The collective influence of normative
pressures is termed as ‘subjective norm’. Thereby, attitude toward the behaviour and
subjective norms are the determinants of one’s intention to perform the behaviour. Lastly,
intention leads to performing the intended behaviour. This theory precisely explains the
antecedents of technology adoption as long as the behaviour is voluntarily controlled by the
individual (Beiginia, 2011).
3.2. Technology Acceptance model (TAM)

Later the TRA model was extended to become Technology Acceptance model (TAM) (in Fig. 3) in management information systems research by Davis (1986). TAM posits that the two particular beliefs Perceived usefulness (PU) and Perceived Ease of Use (PEOU) are of primary relevance for computer acceptance behaviour within an organizational context. PU is the subjective probability that using a particular application system will increase one’s job performance. PEOU is the degree to which using an application system is free of effort. Both PU and PEOU predict attitude. PEOU has a relationship with PU. TAM differs from TRA predominantly in one aspect in this behavioural intention is being jointly determined by the person’s attitude toward using the system and Perceived Usefulness. One serious drawback in the TAM model is the exclusion of subjective norm (Support). So, TAM model is weak when it comes to explaining mandatory usage of technology in organizations where the subjective norm (social pressures) plays a major role. This was later complemented by the works of Venkatesh and Davis (2000) with their new adapted TAM model, which is popularly known as Extended Technology Acceptance Model (TAM2). TAM2 explains perceived usefulness and usage intentions in terms of social influence and cognitive instrumental processes. Social influence attributes include subjective norm, voluntariness and image, whereas cognitive instrumental processes include job relevance, output quality, result demonstrability and perceived ease of use. Later, the TAM 2 was again extended to become TAM 3 to account for the influence of managerial interventions on Information Technology adoption and use in work place context (Venkatesh and Bala, 2008).
3.3. Theory of Planned Behaviour

The Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) (in Fig. 4) (Ajzen, 1991), which is another extension of TRA proposed a new construct called perceived behavioural control as a determinant of behavioural intention. Perceived behaviour control is the individual’s perception about ease or difficulty of doing behaviour and indicates the individual’s perceptions about required skills, resources, and opportunities in doing the behaviour. Rather than TRA, the TPB model with regard to perceptions of performance control, attempts to predict both voluntary and involuntary behaviours (Beiginia et al, 2011).

(Fig. 4) Theory of Planned Behaviour (Ajzen, 1991)

3.4. Applicability of Anglo American Models across Cultures

Studies that investigated the applicability of U.S based behavioural models such as TRA, TAM, and TPB in various cultural contexts shown that these models may not predict behaviour and its antecedents across all cultures.

Malhotra and McCort (2001) verified the application of TRA with samples from U.S and Hong kong for their reasoning processes. Models considered Western, Oriental, and universal were compared. As predicted, the most Western model fit the USA data best and the most Oriental model fit the Hong Kong data best. Results suggest that the BI framework is applicable across cultures, yet must be operationalized with the distinctive thought processes of each culture in mind. Pavlou and Chai (2002) investigated the drivers of e-commerce across cultures the U.S and China, by applying Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) and hofstede’s 3 cultural dimensions; Individualism/Collectivism, Power distance and Long-term orientation. The study results render support for the role of culture in the of e-commerce adoption. Averweg (2005) tested the applicability of TAM model in the IT acceptance context in three developing countries namely Saudi Arabia, Malaysia and South Africa. While the applicability of TAM is supported in Saudi Arabia (Arab culture) and also to Malaysia, it is not supported in South Africa. Averweg’s results was not in support of basic tenets of TAM which emphasize perceived usefulness over perceived ease of use as the key determinant of IT acceptance, this is a possible indication of a difference in overall contextual
factors, primarily culture. McCoy et al (2007) conducted a cross-cultural study of IT usage among 4000 students of several universities around the world. And study results revealed that TAM model doesn’t hold for certain cultural orientations. Low uncertainty avoidance, high masculinity, high power distance and high collectivism seem to nullify the perceived ease of use and / or perceived usefulness. This is a clear indication of cultural influence. Gao ling (2009) studied Chinese consumers purchasing behaviour regarding luxury fashion related goods by using TRA and TPB. And the study results suggest that cultural orientation has indirect effect on consumer’s intention to purchase luxury goods by influencing consumer’s beliefs. The original TPB model to be modified to predict consumer’s intention to purchase luxury goods in the context of the Chinese environment, and a combination with cultural orientation the modified TPB model has a high explanatory power for explaining the intention of Chinese consumer’s intention to purchase luxury goods. Tlou (2009) tested the applicability of TRA and TPB models in a workplace HIV/AIDS health promotion programme in South Africa. The study concludes that the intervention based on theories of reasoned action and planned behaviour did not produce health behaviour change. The authors attributed it to the collectivist cultural influence. Miller and Khera (2010) conducted a cross country analysis (Kenya and Peru) of Digital library adoption by using TAM. Overall they found that predictors of usage, Perceived usefulness, and ease of use were consistent across cultures where as other constructs such as social norm, domain knowledge, visibility and self-efficacy were found to have predictive power in only one setting. The study suggests that IT implementation in developing countries requires acknowledgement of the diverse conditions (cultural factors) in which ITs are used both between different developing countries and also between developed and developing countries. Straub et al (2012) examined the application of TAM model across three different countries, Japan, Switzerland and The United States. The study was conducted among the employees of three different airlines, all of whom had access to the same information technology innovation, in this case, E-mail. The results indicate that TAM holds for both the U.S. and Switzerland, but not for Japan, suggesting that the model may not predict technology use across all cultures.

With all the above evidences, it is learnt that the culture has an influential role in the consumer adoption behaviour. The Anglo American behavioural models such as TRA, TAM and TPB are proved to be culturally sensitive. So that the adoption of these models as a theoretical framework in the studies of diverse cultural context must be guided by specificities of native cultural dimension.

4. Application of Anglo American models in mobile advertising research of Asian countries

This section critically reviews the mobile advertising studies of Asian countries that applied Anglo American Models as its basic framework. There are 27 mobile advertising studies culled out from the Peer reviewed Journals published from 2004 to 2013 that are specific to Asian context. Among them a number of 18 studies were chosen for the final scrutiny that met the criterion of using Anglo American models. All these 18 studies were conducted in 11 different Asian countries; India, Malaysia, Jordan, Turkey, China, South Korea, Iran, Thailand, Pakistan, Taiwan and Japan. Except Japan which is one of the major developed economies all other 10 nations are developing economies. There is only one cross cultural study and 17 country specific studies. The critical review aims to investigate how Anglo American models used in the mobile advertising literature of Asian countries and to
check out whether cultural value dimensions adopted as means of explanation for country specific behaviour.

Sultan et al (2009) investigated the youth market’s acceptance of m-marketing between two countries the U.S and Pakistan by framing a conceptual model derived from Technology Acceptance model and Uses and Gratifications. The study has found that several antecedents and mediating factors related to m-marketing acceptance were similar across two markets. However the influence of cultural values on acceptance behaviour of m-marketing in these two markets hasn’t been dealt in the study. The countries such as the U.S. and Pakistan are so culturally distinctive. But surprisingly, the study yielded some unexpected similarities. Some authors predict that new technologies will make societies more and more similar. Technological modernization is an important force toward cultural change and it leads to partly similar developments in different societies (support). Especially Youth who are the largest adopters of new technologies has the probability of exhibiting similar beliefs attitude and behaviours. However this needs to be substantiated with a much carefully designed study. Future studies might examine these differences and similarities in much greater depth by employing cross-cultural design.

Koo et al (2012) cross-culturally examined Generation Y consumer’s attitude toward Mobile advertising in two cultures the U.S and South Korea. Generation Y consumers were born between the years from 1977 to 1997, have widely been studied for the mobile technology because this consumer cohort who has never had a chance without modern electronic devices is highly sophisticated in technology. Using Theory of Reasoned Action the study investigated Gen Y consumer’s different value perception toward apparel mobile advertising according to cultures and modalities (SMS and MMS). The values of entertainment, informativeness, irritation, credibility were perceived differently by two cultures (U.S and Korea). The Study has given adequate explanation for these occurring variances between two countries by pulling out conceptual insights from Hofstede and Hall’s Dimensions. As American and Koreans were culturally different, their individualistic and collectivistic cultural values, and Low context and high context communication styles were attributed to the occurring variances in the results.

Unal et al (2011) conducted a research to determine the differences between the attitudes of youth and adults in Turkey. Using theory of reasoned Action, the study has recorded perceptual differences between youth and adults for attitude, intentions, behaviour, personalization and irritation. In conclusion the authors suggested that psychographical characteristics such as personality and life styles can also be investigated in future studies. If cultural values and its moderating role are studied in Turkey’s context, it is expected that might amplify the relevance of these results.

Saadeghvaziri and Hosseini (2010) studied factors creating positive attitude among Iranian customers. The study drawing out tenets from fishbein’s attitude theory showcased some inconsistencies with the results of previous studies. Especially, there is no specific difference found in male and female attitude, while it is found to be significantly different in previous studies. The authors attributed national culture as a reason for such inconsistencies. Nonetheless, how Iran’s native cultural values affect attitude hasn’t been dealt in the study.

Later, a much comprehensive study was conducted among Iranian Users by Kestgary and khajehpour (2011) on adoption of mobile advertising. Theories of reasoned Action, planned Behaviour and Technology Acceptance Model used as theoretical bases. The results also show that among the four aspects of advertising (Entertainment, Informativeness, Irritation
and Credibility), Entertainment has the most important role in consumer's attitudes toward mobile advertising. Where as in Western world as in the case of the U.S, informativeness is the most important factor that affects consumer attitude. The study ignored the significance of ‘culture’ which was suggested to be instrumental in the adoption behaviour.

Following Kestgary and khajehpour, in a much recent study, Rabiei et al (2012) studied mobile advertising acceptance in Iran using TAM model as a basic framework. Findings show that perceived usefulness, perceived control and attitude toward using mobile advertising are recognized as the most important factors affecting mobile advertising acceptance in Iran. Significant perceptual difference is reported in male and female, youngsters and elders for perceived ease of use. The study presented a novel model, in that Subjective norm is not included and the significance of cultural value is overlooked.

In another recent study, Javid et al (2012) investigated factors affecting consumer’s attitudes toward Mobile advertising in Iran. Using Fishbein attitude theory, the study found that entertainment, informativeness, irritation and credibility of mobile ads affected the attitude of the consumers toward m-advertising. Entertainment has the most impact among the others. However cultural value dimensions were left out. The study in its future research direction suggested that attitude is mostly cultural; it is probable that cultural differences among respondents can make any difference in their attitudes toward m-advertising. Iran has a multi-cultural society so that a study that highlights differences in consumer attitudes toward Mobile advertising based on cultural differences could be possible. It is suggested that future studies may look into these aspects.

Tsang et al (2004) studied Taiwanese attitude toward Mobile advertising using TRA as a backdrop. The study results reveal that entertainment is the most important factors among Taiwanese. And informativeness and irritation accounts for marginal contribution. The study does not provide any cultural explanation for that. In another study conducted in Taiwan, Yang (2008) explored factors affecting consumer intention to use mobile advertising using Extended Technology acceptance model (TAM2). The study examined how ‘Social influence’ and ‘Past adoption behaviour’ influence consumer intention to use m-advertising. Using social influence which is similar to Individualism and collectivism the study has brought insight into consumer intention. But other cultural dimensions were left out.

Jayasingh and Eze (2009) studied the consumer behavioural intention toward mobile coupons in Malayasia. The study used TAM as the base to analyze the attitude and behavioural intentions of consumer toward m-coupons. The study extended TAM model with perceived credibility and social norms and proposed a model of m-coupon behavioural intentions. The study result confirmed that the model has high ‘predictive power’ and it is suggested that in mobile advertising context traditional adoption models such as TAM could be applied, but they need to be modified and extended in order to increase their robustness and relevance to the context. However the study didn’t take into account the interplay of cultural values.

In another study, Ismail and Razak (2011) investigated young consumer’s acceptance of m-marketing in Malaysia. The study used Decomposed theory of reasoned Action as underpinning theory in explaining intention to use. Results show that attitude and subjective norm have a direct response relationship with intention to use m-marketing. It is suggested that future research can be tested in other countries whether the culture differences will give impact on the m-marketing acceptance. No cultural insights are given apart from subjective norms being used.
In a latest study, Noor et al (2013) studied the Malaysian consumer’s attitude towards mobile advertising, the role of permission and its impact on purchase intention. The conceptual framework for this study is derived from the abstract ideas of TPB and theory of permission marketing. The study investigated the influence of Subjective norm, which is regarded as an important element in many innovation diffusion literatures. The study lacks cultural perspective and suggests that further analysis can also be done in the other Asian Countries to discover differences and similarities concerning the consumer’s perception toward m-advertising. Assessment in this area will be valuable for further development of Mobile advertising in Asian countries.

Okazaki (2007) explored gender effects in mobile advertising context. The study used TAM and TRA as its basic framework and examined how gender affects mobile advertising acceptance in Japan. The study used Hofstede and GLOBE model, has shown gender effects and confirmed the relevance of Gender egalitarianism (Masculinity and Femininity) dimension. Later, Okazaki et al (2012) studied the mobile advertising avoidance behaviour in perceived ubiquity context. Theory of Reasoned Action was used to examine the effects of perceive ubiquity on trust, risk, attitude and intention. The study conceptualizes that due to unethical information practices and privacy concerns ubiquity can be perceived positively and negatively. The results confirm that Japanese consumers tend to have positive notions toward ubiquity of m-advertising. Critics say that though the usage of mobile device is high among Japanese consumers the results might have been influenced by country-specific factors. Cultural differences may account for that and future studies should investigate these elements.

Zhang and Mao (2008) examined the acceptance of SMS advertising among young Chinese consumers using a modified Technology acceptance model. With the inclusion of subjective norm (individualism and collectivism) the study validated TAM model in Chinese setting.

In Indian setting, Bamoriya and Singh (2012) applied TAM model to examine mobile user’s intentions to receive SMS advertising. The original TAM model is extended to suit Mobile advertising setting. The study results indicates that perceived utility was a better predictor of attitude towards SMS advertising than perceived ease of use and trust. Subjective norm which is one of the important predictors of intention to use has not been included in the new model. Cultural values of India, which is a multi-cultural society, are not taken into consideration in the study.

Al-alak and Alnawas (2010) examined the impact of trust, privacy concern and consumers attitude on intention to purchase in Jordan. Drawing out some basic tenets from TRA and TPB models excluding subjective norm, the study investigated the phenomenon. This is serious inadequacy of the new model and cultural influences have not also been looked into.

Srisawatsakul and Papasaratorn (2013) studied factors affecting consumer acceptance of mobile broadband services with Add-on Advertising in Thailand. The study proposed extended TRA by including 6 factors for testing adoption of m-broadband services with add-on advertising: Perceived value, contextual awareness, trust, solidarity, familiarity and effect. The results show that there are slightly positive relationships between intentions to accept m-broadband advertising and two attributes; attitude toward m-broadband advertising and subjective norms. The results reveal that TRA is not likely to give accurate prediction of user
acceptance of m-broadband services with add-on advertising. However, no cultural insight is given in the study.

5. Discussion

This section discusses and summarizes the results from the critical review.

- The critical review of the mobile advertising studies of Asian countries reveal that most of the studies used Anglo American models as a basic framework by modifying or extending it to suit mobile advertising context. However, it is evident that in 5 of the 18 studies (Koo et al of Korea, Saadeghvaziri and Hosseini of Iran, Javid et al of Iran, Tsang et al of Taiwan and Unal et al of Turkey), the application of Anglo American models was limited as the study objective attempts to explore only attitude of the consumers.

- Studies of Jayasingh and Eze of Malaysia, Bamoriya and Singh of India, and Rabiei et al of Iran used TAM as basic framework, but didn’t consider the inclusion of subjective norm as a factor. In Collectivistic culture it is evidenced that subjective norm has a significant role in the behavioural process. Few studies using TRA and TPB models established this belief.

- Studies of Koo et al (S. Korea), Zhang and Mao (China), Okazaki (Japan) explored the influence of culture, only few dimensions were dealt with, however it’s not in-depth in nature. As advertising content and appeals are varying from culture to culture it is more thoughtful to study cultural influences to design advertising that appeals most to the consumers of a specific culture.

- As far as the review is concerned there is a greater need to conduct cross-cultural study between the developing and developed nations and also between developing nations. In developing nations the growth of Mobile advertising is at the state of infancy, it is imperative for the marketers to conduct studies related to developing nations’ context while considering culture as an important component.

- Sultan et al’s (2009) cross cultural study between U.S and Pakistan state that youth consumer in both market tend to have similar perceptions. That should be demonstrated with further study as advertising content and appeals differs in these settings.

- It is also necessary to locate relevant cultural dimension among the six dimensions of Hofstede. Sometimes, it is meaningful to converge two different cultural models like Hofstede and Hall. As these in combination explains the influence of cultural values well as evidenced by few studies.

- As mobile phones are considered to be personal devices, the privacy concerns related to Mobile advertising is proven to be high among consumer especially when they are targeted by unsolicited spam messages. It is suggested that future studies should look into this phenomenon through cultural lens with Personalisation and permission based advertising as solutions to privacy invasive practices across cultures.

- Apart from culture, Countries regulatory framework and technological infrastructure may also play a key role in the adoption of m-advertising. Future studies may look into these matters in much greater depth. And there is an emerging demand to find out which model among the Anglo American behavioural model has got more explanatory power among the other. It demands further exploration.

- There used to be some criticisms on validity of Hofstede’s country dimensions as its databases were considered outdated by many critics. Though the databases were dated 1970’s, studies correlating the old country scores with related variables available on a
year-by-year basis in many cases find no weakening of the correlations (Hofstede, 2010). A good reason for this is that the country scores on the dimensions do not provide absolute country positions but only their positions relative to the other countries in the set. The influences like those of new technologies tend to affect all countries without necessarily changing their relative position or ranking if their cultures change they change together. Though Hofstede metric is stable at the country level, it is proven to have weak psychometrically properties when it is applied directly to measure cultural values for individual consumers. These inadequacies can be overcome when adopting psychometrically sound scales which are developed from Hofstede Metric and validated for having satisfactory psychometric properties when cultural values are studied at the individual level (Yoo et al, 2011).

6. Conclusion

This paper, by performing a critical review of the mobile advertising adoption research of Asian countries, has found that majority of the mobile advertising studies applied Anglo American models without considering moderating influence of the native cultural values of the consumers and there is also a lack of comprehensive cross-cultural study in the mobile advertising adoption literature. Studies that used TAM model as a basic framework didn’t consider subjective norm as a factor, which is one of influential component in the collectivistic traditions of Asian countries.

As evidenced in the literature, the Anglo American models are culturally sensitive and may not predict adoption behaviour across all cultures. Hence, adopting these models to Asian setting may not result in the prediction of antecedents of mobile advertising adoption behaviour. This problem can be nullified if Hofstede’s cultural dimension used as an explanation for the occurring variance between the results of diverse cultures. Though the Hofstede’s country scores for national culture were criticized as obsolete, the studies that replicate his work demonstrated that its validity is still viable. However the use of GLOBE study, which a major adaptation of Hofstede’s classical work is recommended by the researchers due to its suitability to the current cultural scenario. When applying various cultural dimensions like Hofstede, GLOBE and Hall, it is advisable to locate and use relevant dimensions to mobile advertising context and future studies can undertake investigations in this area. In conclusion the paper suggests that future studies can investigate mobile advertising adoption by integrating culture as an integral component in the Anglo American behavioural theories. Studies need to be conducted between developing countries and also between developing and developed countries to get more insights into consumer behaviour in diverse cultural context. This will render useful implications as to expanding mobile advertising business across cultures.
REFERENCES


Choi, Y.K., Hwang, J.S., & McMillan, J.S.(2008), Gearing up for mobile advertising: A cross cultural examination of key factors that drive mobile messages home to consumers, psychology & Marketing, Vol.25(8), 756-768.


Straub, D., Keil, Mark., and Brenner, W. (year), Testing Technology Acceptance model across cultures: A three country study


United Nations (2012), Country classification, Data sources, Country classifications and aggregation methodology, World Economic situation and


Venkatesh, V., and Davis, F.D. 2000. A theoretical extension of the technology acceptance model: Four longitudinal field studies, Management Science.46(2), 186-204.


Wei, R., Xiaoming, H., and Pan, J.(2010). Examining user behavioural response to SMS ads; Implications for the evolution of the mobile phone as a bona-fide medium, Telematics and Informatics, 27, 32-41

[www.geert-hofstede.com/countries.html](www.geert-hofstede.com/countries.html)


Analyzing university students’ intercultural sensitivity

Amia Luthfia
Marketing Communication Department
Bina Nusantara University
Jakarta, Indonesia

In this global era, communication, interaction and intercultural encounters happen every second. Technology expands the ability of people throughout the world to connect to each other for vacation or for business purpose. Intercultural communication skills will be critical necessity. The ability to work in multicultural workforce and interact with people from other culture, often in other languages, is inherent to be able to succeed as a multicultural individual. Intercultural awareness, intercultural sensitivity and intercultural communication competence are very important for every member in any organization.

According to Chen and Starosta (1996), the three are closely related but separate concepts. Intercultural communication competence is an umbrella concept which is comprised of cognitive, affective, and behavioral ability of interactants in the process of intercultural communication. The affective aspect of intercultural communication competence is represented by the concept of intercultural sensitivity that refers to the subjects' "active desire to motivate themselves to understand, appreciate, and accept differences among cultures" (Chen & Starosta, 1998).

Nowadays, every university must prepare its students to become multicultural individual. Especially for the university which has commitment becomes a global - world class university. This research is aimed to gain a general picture of university students intercultural sensitivity. Author will conduct a survey of a leading university in Indonesia using Chen and Starosta's Intercultural Sensitivity Scale. Chen and Starosta suggested future research to examine the usefulness of the ISS in an expanded population. Because the samples used in the present studies were mainly white college students in a public university in USA (Chen & Starosta, 2000).

The questionnaire will be spread to sample of senior students from 8 departments at the Bina Nusantara University in Jakarta Indonesia. This research will show the usefulness of the ISS in different population and cultural setting.
ABSTRACT

Third party endorsements of nature-based claims: Influence on consumers’ perceptions of food products

May O. Lwin
&
Jack Ho Young

Wee Kim Wee School of Communication and Information
31 Nanyang Link, WKWSCI Bldg,
Nanyang Technological University,
Singapore 637718
tmaylwin@ntu.edu.sg

A new marketing trend has emerged worldwide with marketers promoting foods and beverages as being nature-based (Demetrakakes, 2007). Despite the potential misuse of natural claims, most food regulatory bodies in Asian countries have little or no guidelines for the use of this claim. In Singapore for instance, the use of natural claims is vaguely defined by the Agri-Food and Veterinary Authority of Singapore (2005).

Our study investigates the consumer responses (such as healthfulness perceptions and attitude towards the product) to natural claims amongst food products in an Asian context and the consumer responses when this claim is presented together with a third-party seal of endorsement.

Literature Review and Concept

From a consumers' standpoint, many related natural foods, organic foods and foods that are not processed or contain additives are viewed as healthy (Roininen, Lahteenmaki & Tuorila, 1999). The various positive associations regarding natural claims may be explained by how consumers may over-generalize certain claims (Garretson & Burton, 2000). In the Andrews, Netemeyer and Burton (1998) study, consumers were shown to over-generalize the word “no cholesterol” into thinking that the product with such a claim is perceived to be considerably “healthier”. The Activation Theory (Collins and Loffus, 1975) gives a framework of how this generalization may work, where the more similar the properties of two concepts are, the more links there are between the two; hence if one node is primed, it will activate and spread to another node related to it and the further it travels down the network, the weaker is.

One way in which consumers seek to lower the sense of perceived risk is through the use of both extrinsic and intrinsic cues to form perceptions about a particular product, and this includes extrinsic cues such as packaging and labels (Miyazaki, Grewal & Goodstein, 2005). Based on these theoretical perspectives, we propose two hypotheses on the effects of nature-based claims and third-party seals.

Methodology: Experiment

We conducted an experiment where subjects were placed in a mock supermarket shopping context. The study was designed to investigate whether displaying the natural claim on food products with or without a fictitious seal will affect perceptions of the
product’s attributes of healthiness and health benefits. A 2-by-2 factorial design between-subjects design was employed where a claim (natural claim vs. no claim) was crossed with seal labelling (Seal vs. no Seal) on 200 subjects. A mock-up of a packet of snacks was created for all four conditions. Each group was assigned randomly to one of the four conditions using the same mock-ups picture with only the front labelling manipulated. Subjects were then asked a set of questions about perceived taste, healthfulness perceptions and attitude towards the product.

Findings

Results showed that the nature-based claim does strongly influence consumers’ perception of the healthfulness of the product and that the claim also interacts with the external seal of endorsement found on the same packaging. This suggests that consumers commonly use a combination of extrinsic cues for healthful decision-making. We discuss implications for food marketing and policy.

REFERENCES


A sophistic rhetorical approach to public relations

Steve Mackey
Deakin University, Australia
mackey@deakin.edu.au

(A longer version of this paper is due for prior publication in PRism Online Journal - ISSN 1448-4404)

This article introduces a thesis that understanding rhetoric properly will lead to the best way of understanding public relations properly. It acknowledges but then critiques Robert Heath’s advocacy of the rhetorical paradigm. It also acknowledges the more critical contributions to the rhetorical theory of public relations of Jacquie L’Etang, Oyvind Ihlen, Andrej Skerlap and Lee Edwards. However in declining to favour the approaches of any of these authors it argues that no writers have so far revealed the true significance of a proper application of the notion ‘rhetoric’ to the field of public relations. The claim will be that if the true relevance of the fields of public relations and rhetoric to each other is fully recognised the stature of public relations would be raised to a considerable extent beyond current thinking. The approach of this paper is premised on the observation of classicist Werner Jaeger:

Before them [the sophists] we never hear of grammar, rhetoric, and dialectic: they must therefore have invented them. The new techne is clearly the systematic expression of the principle of shaping the intellect, because it begins by instruction in the form of language, the form of oratory and the form of thought. This educational technique is one of the greatest discoveries which the mind of man has ever made: it was not until it explored these three of its activities that the mind apprehended the hidden law of its own structure. (Jaeger, 1947:314)

What Jaeger is saying here, and what scholars of discourse, let alone scholars of public relations seems to miss, or to muddle with obscure postmodern-speak is that: we are rhetoric! What in common parlance is called ‘civilisation’, or contemporary culture, consists of rhetoric and the companions of rhetoric. What we might call post-literate culture as opposed to pre-literate culture is rhetoric and the counterparts to rhetoric. Culture is not influenced by rhetoric. It simply is rhetoric. The failure to recognise this simple fact is at the heart of the subjectivist muddle which so many theorists get themselves into when they try to write in this area. Clear sighted writers such as Jaeger and people like Stephen Toulmin, Chaim Perelman and Alasdair MacIntyre understand this. However modernist hubris, that is post-Enlightenment intellectual hubris tends to blind many others to this fact of how we exist intellectually. Mainstream theorists fail to see that every person in every nook and cranny of what is generally regarded as civilisation exists as a combination into one substance of how language is codified, how persuasive communication operates, and how ‘logic’ operates. I am using the term ‘logic’ here in the common, everyday sense of that word, i.e. what we think to be ‘logical’ in our everyday existence. I am not pursuing ‘logic’ in some rarefied specific philosophical sense. In the common sense of how we operate in the world our ‘logic’ is received, seen and conveyed in the context of the other two aspects of the ‘techne triumvirate’ or trivium – codified language (grammar) and persuasive communication (rhetoric). The main cause of the inadequacy of the understanding of this phenomenon: i.e. the main inadequacy in the understandings of us, is the modern, as well as the postmodern habit of always trying to separate things into their components and then reifying these bits as if they were real things themselves. Just as you can’t properly study living human beings by
chopping them up, you can’t properly understand thought by seeing it as separate pieces. Contemporary thought is a holistic techne invented and constructed over millennia with regard to will, memory and forgetting, and the range of emotions from love to hate; amusement to anxiety. This construction was particularly boosted in the era of the very astute ancients who are referred to above. But it is no secret. Everyone who tries to manage ‘how we see things’ such as business leaders, trade unionists, politicians of every stripe, campaigners of every motivation know this, if only intuitively. But this ‘knowing’ of people, this knowing of who us and them are fundamentally and how we can be influenced fundamentally is the meat and drink of the contemporary rhetorician - today’s public relations practitioner. The implication of this paper is that none-the-less the fundamentality of this ‘getting people to see things in a particular way’ - of influencing their common sense ‘logic’ is generally missed when public relations theorists try to conceptualise their practice. I suggest contemporary practitioners need to take a leaf out of the book of what the original sophists rather than the later academicians and politicians meant by rhetoric. My thesis is that after the sophists, thought or ‘we’ were ‘established’ as it were in our techne – our modus operandi of the fundamental aspects of human being – that is of intellectual being in the world, the realisation of how we had been constructed in that way diminished. Instead human intellectual construction was assumed. It was the less philosophical, more vocationally oriented rhetoricians who came after the sophists – the speech-smiths, the orators and crafters of oratory who Plato attacks – those who predominantly only tinkered with the phenomena Jaeger refers to above, who now claim the title. My suggestion is that theories which inherit that partiality – that reification of bits of how we think – need to be transcended.

The ‘Introduction’ section written by Robert Heath in Heath et al., (2009) is perhaps currently the most widely read explanation of the importance of rhetoric to public relations. Heath (2006) also contains a detailed discussion of the theoretical approaches which fit in with the rhetorical. Both of these sections of writing share the imperative to produce a viable, ethically defensible intellectual perspective on public relations. This imperative is the raison d’etre of all serious attempts at theorising public relations. It is the imperative to provide a basis upon which public relations can be seen as both a genuine profession and as a legitimate academic subject. To this end Heath uses the rhetorical approach to show how public relations has a vital role as the ethical persuasive communication which is necessary for the maintenance of a healthy society and democracy. Heath’s work is widely respected. However this paper is a critique which might be called: the fundamental alignment of public relations properly understood with rhetoric properly understood. That is, it is a critique with the ambition of identifying rhetoric as such with public relations as such. It is a critique which identifies ethical persuasive discourse as intrinsically pre-requisite to any conceivable form of what might be referred to as civilised society rather than as pre-requisite only to the more agreeable forms of civilisation. It is a critique about the organisation of perspectives on reasoning which are in line with Aristotle’s suggestion that: “Rhetoric is the counterpart of Dialectic.” (Aristotle, 2001:179) In other words: in any process of understanding, facts cannot be separated from how facts are put. Facts and how they are expressed are an inseparable unit when it comes to understanding. Of course one can apply all sorts of scientific analyses and exegeses to facts… but … doesn’t that just prove the point? Facts only mean things in context. The way facts, particularly social facts, are put, or in the reverse, the way facts can be analysed as having been put, that is the linguistic codes and the persuasive settings in which they are delivered, ‘colours’ or perspectives how they are received, how they are understood.
Heath separates public relations from rhetoric. For Heath rhetoric is an activity in society which has a tradition which provides a theory. This is a theory which is applicable both to rhetoric *per se* and to public relations. The thesis here however is that while it may initially be useful to separate notions of how ethical persuasive communication works for analytical purposes, it is a mistake to enshrine or reify this separation. Such separation objectifies ‘rhetoric’ as theory and ‘public relations’ as what is to be theorised. I suggest that the realisation that they are the same thing is a more productive way of getting nearer to the reality of both. In my view all that public relations is – is a major contemporary form of rhetoric just as oratory was a major form of rhetoric in the past. I say this in full recognition of all the complexities of contemporary public relations practice – its planning, its research base, its multiple digital channels, its ethical and legal codes and so on. Making a good speech is not simple either! My argument will imply that much of what other authorities on the public relations/rhetoric nexus write about is clouded by lack of historical perspectives. For instance I suggest that passages such as this one from Jacquie L’Etang suffer from the bias by which rhetoric was stripped of its status of rhetoric *per se* and instead turned into a set of overwhelmingly dialectical notions:

Rhetoric, however it is defined, is important to public relations at both technical and theoretical levels and impacts upon both the practice and the interpretation of public relations. (L'Etang, 1996:117)

In the chapter from which this quote is taken titled: ‘Public relations and rhetoric’ L’Etang explains post-modern theoretical approaches within the umbrella of rhetorical theory. I suggest this has the unfortunate side-effect of continuing to confuse what rhetoric actually is. Such theorisation militates against rhetoric’s correct identification as a practice synonymous with public relations practice. Public relations is separated out as the ‘thing’ with rhetoric made the way of conceptualising the thing. I suggest that an unclouded understanding of rhetoric reveals how public relations – that is public relations properly revealed as a key expression of contemporary rhetoric – is one of the essential components of any sort of civilisation. It is a component of the contemporary apprehension and consequent manifestation of ‘the hidden law of the structure of the mind’ – as Jaeger might put it. In cooperation with grammar, public relations marshals contemporary ‘logic’. As such it is an inescapable essential component of contemporary culture, whether for good or for bad.

Similarly to L’Etang, Skerlap in an article which admittedly more gives an overview of rhetorical approaches rather than critiques them suggests:

[When]...different genres of public relations discourse have to be deployed. Rhetoric and discourse analysis can elaborate further on these crucial aspects of public relations. (Skerlep, 2001)

Again there is an avoidance of the perspective that it is the public relations activity as rhetoric – which *is* the genre of persuasive communication. Somehow the way perspectives on logic – logic in the sense suggested above – are formed can be analysed through the prism of some sort of external exegesis. This approach de-emphasises that it is the public relations activity itself which needs to be examined for its effect on perspective. It is public relations as the mode of persuasive communication working with language codes and dialectic which influence understanding in terms of a triumvirate *techne*. There is no need to acquit public relations of responsibility in the sense of reifying it as a separated component of a body on a
slab which can be examined forensically for any signs of life as it were ‘after the fact’ of dialectic!

Here is Ihlen in similar mood:

Although much public relations research has been devoted to instrumental purposes…studies have also illustrated how public relations rhetoric works to promote particular ideologies. (Ihlen, 2011)

For the purposes of the present perspective this is like talking in kind of oxymoronic manner of the sort: the flying flight of a plane keeps it in the air; eating things which one eats is very satisfying; writing produces things to read.

Here is Edwards’s also separating rhetoric from public relations:

One of the reasons for advocating a rhetoric approach is that…it provides a valuable, functional argument for public relations’ boundary spanning role. (Edwards, 2011)

By contrast to the above separatist analytical approaches Heath can be said to see public relations as rhetoric. But Heath’s approach seems to only borrow the notion that public relations can be seen as rhetoric (rather than be rhetoric) in order to conjure up a special status where public relations becomes a sort of universal salve which enhances society. That is Heath applies a kind of gloss of rhetoric to public relations activity which somehow converts and promotes, or perhaps decorates public relations so that it joins the rank of a benign activity. The main problem with this application I suggest is that Heath sees rhetoric as only the top strata of civilisation. Figuratively speaking he sees rhetoric as the first so many hundred kilometres of the Earth’s crust. He does not see rhetoric as going all the way down to civilisation’s core. Quoting Kenneth Burke, Heath writes:

Rhetoric’s role in unsettled matters, Burke noted, rests on the fact that society is a marketplace of ideas, facts, values and policies: “the Scramble, the Wrangle of the Marketplace, the flurries and flare-ups of the Human Barnyard, Give and Take, the wavering line of pressure and counter pressure, the Logomarchy [battle of words], the onus of ownership, the War of Nerves, the War.” For this reason Burke concluded that democracy institutionalises “the dialectic process, by setting up a political structure that gives full opportunity for the use of competition to a cooperative end.” (R. L. Heath, Toth, & Waymer, 2009:24)

In his earlier chapter: ‘Rhetorical enactment rational’ (R. Heath, 2000) Heath celebrates the way individuals are able to live in liberated communities because of rhetoric:

Rhetorical enactment meets that requirement. It is the “communal” or “communitarian” aspect of discourse. Through communication, people form communities that liberate individuals through mutually beneficial interests and shared meaning. (R. Heath, 2000:50)

So in other words the use of persuasive communication enables individuals and groups to organise and win better political and economic circumstances. They are able to do this by creating and channelling discourse into negotiations which are powerful enough to subsume materially based authoritarianism. But surely the presumption here is that separate from
rhetoric there is already a ‘marketplace’ which pre-exists. Separate from and before rhetoric there is already an established sphere where compelling ideas are brought to contest against other seductive notions. Similarly there are unexplained pre-existing circumstances in some sort of sphere of life which people need to be liberated from. In both instances for Burke and for Heath rhetoric stands outside this pre-existence. In the first extract notions which have been presented persuasively – that is rhetoric – are brought to the market to battle and win discursive wars. In the second extract rhetorical enactment – that is, an external technique is applied to a pre-existing sphere in order to bring about liberation. What is not explained is how the marketplace itself and its rules, as well as the original non-liberation of individuals, have been pre-existingly brought about and maintained. Are not these prior elements of social organisation also largely rhetorical constructs? Could they not already be the results of multiple elements of culture and ideology which have crystallised as social process through some sort of fundamental management which ordains what it is correct to think – or in the terms of this paper: what is commonsensically ‘logical’? For instance even today some people are loyal monarchists, i.e. staunch subscribers to, and believers in, inequality. Similarly, often contrary to critical, rational perspectives, hundreds of millions, maybe billions of people subscribe to a range of religions for their perspective on what the world is. In the USA it appears that millions, certainly a large number, are convinced of the right and advisability of ordinary citizens to own and carry lethal weapons – weapons which sometimes possess mind-boggling levels of firepower. For many legally owning an arsenal which could wipe out a small town is apparently ‘logical’. Even more worrying some strands of apparent ‘logic’ allow hundreds of millions to ignore or even deny arguments that the environment, and thus the social world as we know it, is on a path to destruction through climate change. Are not these pre-existing circumstances – these ‘logics’, these spheres in which Heath’s notion of rhetoric is purported to trade and work its liberating magic – already rhetorically constructed? Does not rhetoric already pervade everything human including whether people or organisations relate symmetrically or not; how people perceive and manage their relationships; how gender is thought about; how communities are imagined and structured? Even Heath’s use of Burke points to this glaring contradiction, this lacuna in his argument. The anomaly is in the implication that there is rhetoric on the one hand and that on the other hand there is an unproblematic social world which is bereft of, or antecedent to, the constant tensions of persuasive communication. This prerequisite problem with Heath’s argument is hinted at when Heath quotes from a personal letter which Kenneth Burke wrote to novelist Malcolm Cowley: ‘As Burke asked, “How can a world with rhetoric stay decent, how can a world without it exist at all?”’ (R. L. Heath et al., 2009:10). This quote points to the totalising notion of rhetoric as a vital part of the techne which, as the sophists knew, forms us. What Burke implies, but what Heath and other theorists fail to grasp is that there can be no civilisation good or bad without rhetoric. This contrasts with Heath’s implication that there can be civilisation without rhetoric. For Heath it is just that civilisation without rhetoric will not be a very civilised civilisation. The implication which I am drawing for our diverging views of public relations here is that Heath suggests public relations – qua rhetoric aids and improves society. I on the other hand suggest that rhetoric qua 21st century persuasive practices, including public relations, just like the work of rhetors in other eras, creates society.

I suggest that the above thesis is supported by the work of Walter Ong (1912 – 2003) in his important book on early Enlightenment figure Peter Ramus. Ong’s book is entitled *Ramus, method and the decay of dialogue: From the art of discourse to the art of reason*. Peter Ramus (1515 – 1572) was a major opponent of rhetoric. He rose to prominence at a juncture
in the history of thought when there was a lionising of science and reason at the expense of
discursive ways of agreeing truths. Ong explains:

Dialectic and rhetoric have been intertwined at least from the time of the Greek
Sophists till our present day, and when Ramus decrees that they must be disengaged
from one another...he engages some of the most powerful and obscure forces in
intellectual history. (Ong, 2004:270)

Ong explains that the Ramist tendency stripped rhetoric of substance. The pre-Ramist
rhetorical curriculum which Bacon, Hobbes and Condillac would have recognised understood
rhetoric to include:

- **Inventio**: Invention or discovery of innovative expression – that is the manufacture,
  the creation of discourse. This is tantamount to the production of culture and thus the
  facilitation of ways in which it is possible to think.
- **Dispositio**: Disposition, that is judgement about the arrangement of elements of the
discourse so that it has the most, or certain types of discursive meaning and effect.
- **Elocutio**: Style of persuasion e.g. argumentative, emotive, or poetic.
- **Pronuntiatio**: Oratorical delivery – performance in terms of voice and gesture. Like
  Elocutio, Pronuntiatio contextualises how the invented and arranged discourse is
  emitted and received. These latter two elements thus contribute to the discourse. They
  play a part in how the mind is invited to think.
- **Memoria**: Memory including understanding how memories dim and how they can be
  rekindled as well as mnemonic devices. This element is to do with the art or science
  of how to play on people’s memories.

Ong (p. 4) argues that Ramus distorted the work of Cicero (106-43 BCE), as well as
Renaissance humanist Rudolph Agricola (1444 - 1485) and others, to privilege dialectic, that
is logical reasoning, or what we might now call the scientific approach, over rhetoric.
Aristotle (circa 384 - 322 BCE) had previously decreed them counterparts to the conveyance
of understanding:

Rhetoric is the counterpart of dialectic...all men engage in them both after a fashion.
For all men attempt in some measure to conduct investigations and to furnish

Ong tells the story about how Ramus moved inventio and dispositio out of the procedures of
rhetoric into those of dialectic. This meant that judgement of how facts were to be put—
disposition—now became an abstract logical process rather than an admittedly fallible but
many-faceted and highly regarded human argumentative process. Similarly actual, concrete,
uninvented facts – the kind of presumed real facts that Heath might be argued to rely on for
his pre-existing marketised world - had to be found instead of discursively created (inventio).
Abstract, detached, notionally scientific procedure was privileged over the more discursive as
the producer of inter and intra human depictions of reality. So, for example the notion of a
‘market’ was allowed to attract stature as a harder to dispel concrete reality. It was a ‘more-
real’ thing, not a ‘less-real’ ephemeral figure of speech which would be much easier to
challenge and discourse about. At the same time the essential human characteristic of
remembering, which is an omnipresent dimension of the ways we think and fail to think
every day, was forgotten and largely remains forgotten. It was subsumed by privileging
written and other forms of recording which now largely stand in for human memory. The
Enlightenment saw the vast expansion of vernacular and scholarly scientific writing. This startling revolution in communication technology was allowed to overwhelm the importance of the ways humans organically record and organically forget. Ong (1982) remarks on the downgrading of this element of rhetoric which involves a failure to acknowledge that the mind does not operate like a congealed text. The implication again is that scientific, or as critiques might call them: scientistic advances have made redundant or superseded traditional, human discursive practices. The downgrading of memoria is perhaps one of the least understood and most important aspects of the dismantling of rhetoric proper. Its removal from the field of discussion obscures the point that whatever the external-to-the-mind recording of facts, the mind’s comprehension of all facts remains an active organic process of decay, rejuvenation, conjugation and evolution on a second-by-second and year-by-year basis. The disappearance of memoria detracts from and tends to makes two-dimensional philosophical discussion about the will and habit. Charles Sanders Peirce writes extensively on the role habit plays in forming and maintaining our logics (Peirce, Weiss, & Hartshorne, 1974). With the Ramusian revolution these formerly obviously discursive, pliable, tangible human qualities become reified into theoretically solid entities. It is as if butterflies have been captured, pinned and exhibited as frozen artefacts alienated from their ever-moving nature.

Ong explains that Ramus and his tradition collapsed rhetoric into Elocutio (style) and Pronuntiatio (performance) only. These are epiphenomena which rely on inventio and dispositio for their substance. This is the usually dismissed and often despised or ridiculed style and performance… the ‘spin’, which is contrasted to the dialectical facts of the case. Three centuries ago rhetoric lost status as the element which advocated the best case for how the facts could be. It fled the field in the face of the advance of sure and unchallengeable Enlightenment factuality. We became the products of a culture where truth was delivered ideoscopically, that is by specially equipped scientific and social scientific experts rather than cenoscopically, that is in balance to discourses which might make science bow to other ways of deciding what was right (Deely, 2008), (Peirce, 1955). It is this eviscerated, impotent version of rhetoric which sits scorned in the back seat while sure factual science drives a world which is an antonym of egalitarianism towards its non-environmental future. We are all passengers of the current version of rhetoric, the current style in which facts are presented, the style and presentation with which popular notions of public relations are synonymous.

It is beyond the scope of this paper to expand much further about how rhetoric properly understood might be appropriately repatriated into mainstream academia. However we can point to those working in that direction. Some of the most important authorities for what is being claimed about rhetoric in this article are: (Bizzell & Herzberg, 2001); (Jarratt, 1991); (Herrick, 2005); (Skinner, 1996); (Chaîm Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969); (Chaim Perelman, 1982) and of course (Ong, 2004) and (Ong, 2002). There are also Alasdair MacIntyre’s critique of post-Enlightenment ethics (MacIntyre, 1984) and Stephen Toulmin’s imperative to: ‘…counter the current widespread disillusion with the agenda of Modernity, and salvage what is still humanly important in its projects,’ (Toulmin, 1992:xi). However glimpses of the remains of the pillaging of rhetoric can be seen out of the corner of the eye as it were in 19th and 20th century authorities of the post-modern. For instance Nietzsche’s Friedrich Nietzsche on rhetoric and language (Nietzsche, Gilman, Blair, & Parent, 1989); Eagleton’s ‘A small history of rhetoric’ (Eagleton, 1981); Barthe’s ‘The Old Rhetoric: an aide memoire’ (Barthes, 1994) as well as in Derrida’s occasional references to rhetoric (Derrida & Kamuf, 1991). These are all postmodern writers, or in Nietzsche’s case a forerunner of the postmodern, who seem to be involved in some sort of intellectual immune response to the pathogenic effect of the Ramist legacy.
These latter studies, I suggest, point in the direction of a reclamation of the original sophistic notion of rhetoric. This is a notion which, as discussed above in relation to Heath, foregrounds the ethical. Debates about what is ethical must always accompany rhetoric properly understood as they must always accompany public relations properly understood. This moral aspect of rhetoric is particularly underlined by St Augustine of Hippo (354-430) who was a professor of rhetoric besides being a main pillar of Western Christianity (Augustine, 1952). The example of Augustine underlines the point that for many centuries truth as perceived by the church was sacred. I.e. the ‘Word’ was tied to particular ethical conventions. But the inseparability of rhetoric from moral practice goes back much further than that. Two and a half millennia ago Isocrates (BCE 436–338) a famed rhetorician contemporary of Plato wrote:

…there is no institution devised by man which the power of speech has not helped us to establish. For this it is which has laid down laws concerning things just and unjust and things base and honourable; and if it were not for these ordinances we should not be able to live with one another. It is by this also that we confute the bad and extol the good. (Isocrates, Norlin, & Van Hook, 1928: 6-7)

Isocrates’ wisdom is reflected down the centuries in the words of other famous rhetoricians such as Cicero (BCE 106–43) and Quintilian (ca. 35–96). The link between sound morals and oratory – a major vehicle of rhetoric is remarked by Quintilian:

…he who would answer my idea of an orator must be a good man…no man, unless he be good, can ever be an orator… It is of importance that an orator should be good because, should the power of speaking be to support an evil, nothing would be more pernicious than eloquence alike to public concerns and private, and I myself, who as far as it is in my power, strive to contribute something to the faculty of the orator, should deserve very ill of the world, since I would furnish arms not for soldiers, but for robbers. (Quintilian, 2001:413)

The lesson of the ancient rhetoricians is that we are not persuaded by people if they have poor character even if they speak with the utmost rationality and instil deep emotion in us. Morality is intrinsic to how communication helps us to form our thought. I join with others who have written in the same vein in respect of public relations. But I extend the point to say that this confluence is another piece of evidence that rhetoric and public relations both understood properly are identical.

Conclusion

This paper has argued that public relations would benefit from the restoration of the prestige and understanding of the millennia-old art of rhetoric. But it explains that a considerable effort is required if rhetoric and thus public relations is to be understood properly. It warns against adoption of the modernist approach to rhetoric such as that exhibited by Heath and the post-modernist approach of others. The paper has explained rhetoric’s original misinterpretation at the time of Plato and its further dismantling by Enlightenment ideas. It argues that a theoretical approach towards rhetoric by public relations scholars must be holistic; it cannot be partial and selective. There needs to be recognition that all of discourse—that is all of the codes by which people think—is what differentiates civilisation from animal existence. There needs to be recognition that all of the ideas in people’s heads
are what humanity is and that rhetoric is an inseparable part of what puts all of these ideas into people’s heads. It is a mistake to attribute the ideas in people’s heads to logical processes alone. It needs to be recognised that rhetoric, whatever it has been called down the centuries, is a vital part of anything that can be called ‘culture’ or ‘civilisation’. Rhetoric never went away. But Ramusian and Enlightenment thinking eviscerated and distorted the intellectual base of the last significant understanding of this integral facet of how we are. This is the devastated intellectual situation which contemporary persuasive communication inherits today. Public relations and related activities as the most important vehicles of contemporary rhetoric are in urgent need of a reclamation of this understanding. The reclamation is needed to inform and better understand the work of the hundreds of thousands, maybe millions of women and men who presently engage in the largely opaque, but vitally important counterpart to dialectic. These people work in: public relations, public affairs, media advice, opinion editorial production, corporate communication, think tanks, advertising, opinion research, customer relations, event management and so on. These knowledge workers, and our attitude to them, albeit unconsciously, subscribe to a post-sophist, post-Enlightenment ideology. This ideology marginalises the status as well as the understanding of their work. Neither these practitioners nor the more culpable related academics sufficiently recognise the civilisation-affecting consequences of the persuasive communication work being carried out. This ‘professional’ work is ‘accredited’ by ethical codes aligned to the pathological assumptions of Ramus and to varieties of the subsequent post-Enlightenment rationalist strains of thought. It is time that intellectuals woke up to this industrial-scale amoralising of contemporary putatively ‘civilised’ thought.

REFERENCES


Bacon, Francis. (2010). The Advancement of Learning Mobi Classics. (pp. 1 online resource (294 p.).)


Corporate Social Responsibility strategy and implementation evaluation based on Game and Negotiation theories

Yoseo Maya P. M
yoseomaya@gmail.com

Dorien Kartikawangi PhD
tarkikawangi@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This research discusses the evaluation of the CSR strategy and implementation about of PT Toarco Jaya. Strategies used by PT Toarco Jaya are an approach to social and cultural conflict. The strategy then implemented into several CSR programs such as the construction and improvement of infrastructure, coffee cultivation training, educational development and restoration of traditional houses.

The purpose of this research was to evaluate the effectiveness of the CSR strategy and implementation of PT Toarco Jaya based on the Game Theory and Negotiation Theory.

The research method used is qualitative (case study) with an interpretive approach. Data retrieval techniques were through structured interviews and focus group discussions (FGD) of the interviewees.

The results indicated that PT Toarco Jaya CSR programs proved to be effective based on the concept of game theory and negotiation theory associated with the information given by all interviewees. CSR activities implemented by PT Toarco Jaya proved applying game theory through efforts to minimize the risk of loss and maximize chances of victory are visible through the implementation of corporate strategies. Based on the theory of negotiation, the effectiveness of CSR strategies implemented by PT Toarco Jaya is evident in achieving a win-win solution for any negotiation process which implemented by the company.

Keywords: CSR, Effectiveness, Game Theory, Negotiation Theory

1. Introduction

CSR has become a very important part and cannot be separated from the company / organization activities. Companies competes to create a wide range of CSR programs that are expected to improve the company's image in the public, but sometimes not all of the program could be successful and well received by the public. For those, we need a specific strategy in CSR by corporate procurement program. Many things need to be taken to ensure that CSR programs are effectively held by the company. As is the case with CSR programs conducted by PT Toarco Jaya in North Toraja. In the process of planning and implementation, PT Toarco Jaya attention is to the most basic needs of the community. Improvement of facilities and highway bridges around the location of the plantation is one of the company's CSR programs are considered very beneficial not only for society but also for the company. Proved since its establishment until today, it can be said that the company still gets the trust of the public (especially around) as a company that has a social responsibility.

In Indonesia, CSR has become a must for companies to show they are not only of concern to the progress of the company but also for the welfare of the community. The
government established written rules concerning the obligations of Limited’s CSR. In addition to state-owned enterprises, the current Limited Liability Company (PT) who manage or operations related to Natural Resources (SDA) required to implement CSR programs, as has been stipulated in Limited Liability Company Law No. 40 of 2007. In chapter 74 described four specific regulations that require companies to run a program of corporate social responsibility or CSR, namely:

1. The Company that conducting its business activities in the field and / or related to the natural resources required to implement the Social and Environmental Responsibility,

2. Social and Environmental Responsibility as referred to paragraph (1) an obligation of the Company and calculated as the cost of the Company's implementation is done with regard to the appropriateness and reasonableness,

3. The Company did not carry out the obligations referred to in paragraph (1) be sanctioned in accordance with the provisions of the legislation,

4. Further provisions on Social and Environmental Responsibility is regulated by the Government.

Companies in Indonesia have CSR policies that getting better over time. Currently, many aspects are considered by the company in the implementation of CSR programs such as education, health, natural disasters, infrastructure, economic independence, etc. For certain purposes, of the company's CSR can help to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) quickly. One form of CSR held company is oriented activities in building the competitiveness of society. This form is expected to have positive impacts on the community and of course the company specifically.

Theories: Communication, Public Relations (PR) and Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)

"Communication is the process by which we understand others and in turn endeavor to be understood by them. It is dynamic, constantly changing and shifting in response to the total situation"(Anderson, 2002: p.20). In this research, Public Relations as a part of the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) is apparent from how companies build a good relationship with the local community especially governments and other parties who have their own role in supporting the success of the company's CSR program. Therefore Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) is a form of corporate responsibility to the community especially to those affected by the company's operations directly.

Game Theory (for Social Conflict)

Game theory shows the position of CSR as a 'trade' between the costs incurred at the beginning (nowdays) and the benefits to be gained in the future (Raharjo 2011). Funds are needed to manage a sustainable of CSR program. Through game theory, we shown that the company is attentive to the needs of employees and the public in earnest to find interest / profit and maximize long-term value of the company. Companies are required to create a value added of products and services for companies and stakeholders must be able to maintain the added value that it has created. The company will always be confronted with a social conflict. Conflict here is not limited to talking about the issues that may give harm to the company, but also to include the how to embed these values into the company so that the company could be well received.
Negotiation theory

Gerard I. Nierenberg (1972, p. 89) explained that basically, there are three approaches used in negotiation theory that is motivation, management functions and behaviors in negotiations with a multi-disciplinary approach between aspects of social psychology, culture, communication and sociology. In this thesis, the focus will be directed to approach the study of behavior in a negotiation by looking at aspects of social psychology, culture, communication and sociology.

Effectiveness of the implementation of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)

Basically, the general understanding of the effectiveness applies to the effectiveness of the implementation of CSR. Effectiveness of the implementation of CSR emphasizes the success of the entire CSR program in accordance with a predetermined plan. To achieve effectiveness, companies must pay attention to some aspects that support the effectiveness of the program aspects of CSR such as individuals, groups and organizations. The concept of CSR in a company should incorporate or at least composed of 3 main aspects: the understanding of the condition and needs of the surrounding community, the perspective that promotes balanced development company, as well as how to implement the company's CSR program. CSR program that was conceptualized properly will minimize the obstacles that can be encountered in the implementation process so as to facilitate the achievement of the initial goal of the establishment of the program in question. When the elements of effective implementation of CSR have been fulfilled, it can be said that the company was leading up to the achievement of organizational objectives of effectiveness, in this case the effectiveness of the implementation of CSR programs.

Research Methodology

Qualitative methods which used in this study is expected to produce an in-depth description of the writing, speech and behavior were observed from an individual, group, community, or organization specified in a context specific settings that were examined from the standpoint of complete, comprehensive and holistic. Therefore, the researchers used a case study method is appropriate for the case studies in this research given the object under study is the CSR program of PT Toarco Jaya which is still running to this day. The paradigm used in this study is interpretive because it focuses on the subjective nature of the social environment and tries to understand it from the frame of the object being studied.

I. CSR Strategy and Implementation PT Toarco Jaya

In summary, it can be concluded that the strategy used by PT Toarco Jaya in its CSR activities is the approach to the social and cultural conflict with the implementation and development through the improvement of infrastructure, development of education, training, and coffee cultivation custom home renovation. Based on the data obtained, the researchers concluded that the implementation of the entire program CSR PT Jaya Toarco held in district located in the vicinity of the plantation. It is intended as a form of corporate responsibility to the environment / location of their operations.

Implementation Effectiveness of PT Toarco Jaya CSR Strategy

In simple terms the effectiveness of CSR programs conducted by PT Toarco Jaya can be seen through the image below:
The following explanation leads us to the understanding of CSR activities in PT Jaya Toarco associated with effectiveness in the diagram above. The concept of CSR:

- Noting the apparent condition of the surrounding community through CSR activities of PT Toarco Jaya itself.
- PT Toarco Jaya saw that through CSR, it can instill the values of the company through the help of local community welfare.
- Corporate perspective looked by the strategies of CSR implementation which implemented by PT Toarco Jaya.

Those CSR’s concept influential on the effectiveness of its own CSR implementation. This can be seen in the description below. Effectiveness of CSR Implementation PT Toarco Jaya:

- Evaluation and monitoring conducted by PT Toarco Jaya each year to the company's CSR activities.
- The responsiveness of the main needs of the community regarding the company around. In this case PT Toarco Jaya will see people's desire to earn income. Therefore PT Toarco Jaya utilizes training programs provided to the community as a place to apply their acquired knowledge as well as the source of income of the people around.
- Concern PT Toarco Jaya to continue building neighborhood communities through the development and improvement of infrastructure facilities, coffee cultivation, support the development of education and attention to cultural heritage is visible through the help of custom home renovation proved very help governments and major surrounding communities.
- Consistency of the CSR program of PT Toarco Jaya towards CSR programs implemented have an impact on the effectiveness of CSR activities of the company during this time. Training programs that consistently held twice a year, routinely implemented infrastructure improvements and other assistance provided by PT Toarco Jaya to the community demonstrates the effectiveness of the implementation.
The CSR concept of PT Toarco Jaya which has been implemented into the company's CSR activities has been proven appropriate with the goals and expectations of the company itself. In addition to providing benefits to the community, government and community leaders themselves, this CSR program also helped Toarco in instilling the values of the company. In the process of development and improvement the infrastructure, PT Toarco Jaya creating a CSR program that is two-way in which the company provides public funding while providing energy assistance in the development process. On educational development assistance and custom home renovation, CSR activities undertaken by the company over a one-way where PT Toarco Jaya limited to providing funds and managed by the beneficiaries, in this case by the school and the family grove (Tongkonan) receiving assistance. While on coffee cultivation training, social assistance is in addition to the two-way nature also helped create the economic dependence (coffee farmers) to PT Toarco Jaya. Therefore, based on the translation of the effectiveness of each CSR activities undertaken by PT Toarco Jaya above, it can be concluded that the company's CSR programs are implemented very effectively although each situation and the program is in a different form but very touching existing social conflicts experienced by the surrounding community.

Corporate Social Responsibility Program Evaluation based on Game Theory as explained by Thomas Steinfatt and Gerald Miller that game theory is the idea of how to win a game, with the order of strategies that maximize opportunities for players to win and minimize the loss. Similarly, in a CSR program implementation, it takes careful strategy to achieve effectiveness against these programs. In CSR program that was built by PT Toarco Jaya, implicit understanding of how game theory (for social conflict) is applied in it. Social conflict here is not simply referring to the negative / bad that could cause harm to the company, but rather to how or what to do to instill company values in order to be accepted in society. When planning this CSR program, PT Toarco Jaya first have to make sure that there was indeed a problem / social conflict in it, which can be known through the following approaches:

- In the implementation of the CSR program, involving PT Toarco Jaya, the government and of course the people themselves.
- People and Toarco equally want improved infrastructure but knock on financial capability. This is then used by Toarco Jaya to act as a bidget provider.
- Among each part, have common goals to be achieved, which is implemented CSR program aims to end a social problem, the CSR program is expected to open wider communication, especially between the company and the community.
- Between PT Toarco Jaya and communities have different values and perceptions.
- PT Toarco Jaya has different resources with people, which can put together on this CSR program.

It is undeniable that there is always hope of any work done by the company, as well as on the implementation of CSR programs by PT Toarco Jaya. The company wants to gain the trust of the people especially communities around the factory and plantation. In his journal, Zhaoliang Sun describes the CSR and firm value using game theory consisting of the reduction of funding, human resources cost reduction, operating cost reductions, special provisions of the government and the promotion of the competitiveness of enterprises. In CSR programs conducted by PT Toarco Jaya, it would also be a consideration that can be seen through:
• Reduce Funding Costs (CSR Program)
• Reduce HR Cost
• Reduce Operating Costs
• Enjoy the Special Provisions of the Government
• Promotion of Competitiveness Company

It is true that in a CSR program that was held by PT Jaya Toarco encountered various strategies related to game theory as researchers have described before. Some important points above explains how PT Toarco Jaya position CSR as a 'trade' between the costs and benefits at the beginning of what would be obtained by the company in the future. Positions the company uses to convince the investors (Key Coffee) to fund CSR programs implemented by PT Toarco Jaya. The company believes that by taking into account, it will provide stimulus to the company's interest in the future as well as to maximize its value.

Corporate Social Responsibility Program Evaluation based on the Negotiation Theory

PT Toarco Jaya is a company that was originally founded by several Japanese coffee lovers. To build a business in a different place, it takes more effort to understand the culture of the surrounding community first. Similarly in the implementation of CSR programs by PT Toarco Jaya requires good communication between the parties involved. Negotiations became one of the company's business is carried out in the implementation process. As described by Fowler and Robinson that negotiation is a tool / process interactions between two or more parties to achieve mutual benefit using the strategies, techniques and communication in accordance with the rights, ethics and law. Similarly, in the negotiation process by PT Toarco Jaya, there is the desired goal, which is profit for each party. As it is known that in the negotiation strategy consists of three types, namely win-win, win-lose and lose-lose solution. Based on the evaluation conducted by the researchers, it can be said that in implementing the CSR program, PT Toarco Jaya more inclined to win-win solutions in the implementation of the negotiations.

In an effort to launch a CSR program that was held by the company, then Toarco carry negotiations out with several parties required. There are some things that are used to identify the presence of negotiations in several CSR programs of PT Toarco Jaya. The following researchers will describe what kind of negotiation process that found associated with negotiation theory itself:

• Involve more than one party, be it between PT Toarco Jaya to the government or between PT Toarco Jaya with community leaders.

• The objectives to be achieved by each party.

• During the negotiation process, PT Toarco Jaya takes time to specifically negotiate with the Department of Plantation, especially when having to negotiate to discuss the company's CSR programs related to the restoration of traditional houses.

• Involve the variable: Time, Information, Power

Based on the explanation, we could be seen that the approach used by PT Toarco Jaya in carrying out negotiation among others through social psychology, culture, communication and sociology. In the implementing process of negotiation, communication styles used by the company more toward collaborators, where the company is oriented to the end result to be achieved through an understanding of the other side. The desire for companies to implement
effective CSR requires companies to take advantage of the negotiation process as well as possible so as to produce the best decision for all parties.

II. CONCLUSION

1. PT Jaya Toarco has actually been carrying out CSR activities that divided into several sections. Toarco CSR program selection based on community needs and problems that exist in the vicinity of the company. The strategy of the company in carrying out its CSR activities is through the approach to the social and cultural conflict. Strategy chosen by company is based on the company's desire to create a social support appropriate and well targeted. Once through careful planning, strategy is then implemented into the improvement and infrastructure development, community training, education and development of custom home renovation. So far, PT Toarco Jaya has performed some dent repair roads in the vicinity of the plantation and the construction of several bridges that connect multiple locations township. Training on cultivation techniques of coffee given to local communities to improve skills and raise public sectors of the economy around by purchasing quality coffee crop by Toarco. Company also participated in the development of educational assistance with providing cash to some schools in the vicinity of the plantations that still need help. To demonstrate the company's concern for the preservation of local culture, the company donated to the restoration of an old traditional house (Tongkonan).

2. Basically, CSR activities undertaken by PT Toarco Jaya considered effective by stakeholders who are involved in. On infrastructure development, company assists the government in accelerating the development of the North Toraja as a new district. Coffee cultivation technique training to the local community provides the opportunity for people to develop their skills, as a follow-up the company bought the plant results in accordance with company standards. Through that, Toarco also helped drive the economic sectors in the communities surrounding the plantation. Help PT Toarco Jaya to schools located in the vicinity of the plantation is very helpful in the development of children's education in the area. While the restoration of PT Toarco Jaya against some old Tongkonan regarded as a form of traditional leaders Toarco attention to the preservation of culture is considered very important in Toraja.

3. CSR evaluation of PT Toarco Jaya based on game theory was considered effective due to the major concepts developed in game theory is how to win a game with a sequence of strategies that can maximize the chance of winning and minimize losses. Same with concept of CSR programs conducted by company, strategies and approaches that have been implemented through careful thought and understanding about the condition of the surrounding community. It had a positive impact on the company in which the purpose of any CSR activity undertaken can be achieved so as to minimize the possibility of loss that can be generated.

4. CSR programs of the company are considered effective based on the theory of negotiation. In negotiating, win-win solution is known which as the best culmination in a negotiation. In the CSR activities, we can be found some negotiations with government and community leaders about the CSR program held by the company. Through interviews with government and community leaders, found that creating a win-win solution between each party. In addition, both the government and community leaders interviewed acknowledged the effectiveness of CSR programs conducted by PT Toarco Jaya.
REFERENCES


www.ccsenet.org/journal/index.../ijbm/.../569
ABSTRACT

“Inter-agency liaison in crisis decision-making: Exploring public relations’ intervention in crisis decision-making in Australia”

Kate A. Mirandilla PhD
Lecturer, Public Communication
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
University of Technology, Sydney
PO Box 123 Broadway, NSW 2007 Australia
kate.mirandilla@uts.edu.au

This paper examines how public relations practitioners participate in crisis decision-making in selected organisations in Australia. The aim of this researcher is to analyze how practitioners enact their role as crisis communication experts in an environment where there are multiple actors working together in developing decisions in crisis response. In particular, this paper emphasizes how practitioners liaise with other sectors, institutions or organisations that play key roles in managing crises.

Findings presented in this paper is drawn from a wider doctoral study conducted by the researcher that focused on the strategic role, if at all, played by public relations practitioners once they gain access to and inclusion in (Bowen 2009) crisis decision-making teams. One of the significant findings suggested by the doctoral study is the shifting composition of a crisis decision-making team. When crises occur, crisis response is a function of the participation of different crisis actors that are internal and/or external to the organization (Coombs 2010). The composition of the crisis decision-making team depends on the severity of the crisis aftermath. This paper sheds light on this shifting membership in crisis decision-making teams.

Unpacking how public relations practitioners liaise with different crisis actors in varied crisis scenarios contributes to an understanding of what constrains or encourages public relations’ strategic intervention in crisis decision-making. It contributes to a need for better research and appreciation of public relations practice in crisis contexts when there are varying interests that are at play in the decision-making process.

Drawing from Karl Weick’s (1995) notion on retrospective sensemaking, narratives of three groups of crisis actors are used in this paper to examine how practitioners provide crisis communication counsel in managing crises. In addition, it is interesting to examine how the decision-making counterparts of practitioners during crises take on board public relations counsel. The three crisis actor groups included in this study are: 1) members of senior management in selected Australian organisations, 2) public relations practitioners, both in-house and external consultants, and 3) police authorities who represent the government’s perspective in crisis response. Representatives of each actor group were interviewed in Australia. The crisis actors used their experiences in managing past organisational crises in Australia such as product recalls, health scare, and an airline crash, among others, in their retrospection of their participation in crisis management.
Narratives and lived experiences of these crisis actors provide a rich exploration of the inter-agency decision-making environment that is at play in managing crises. First-hand accounts of individuals who worked with public relations practitioners are important sources of information in analyzing what goes on in crisis decision-making rooms once the different crisis actors deliberate and debate on the crisis response strategies to use. Analysis presented in this paper, therefore, gives relevant insights on how crisis actors managed actual crisis scenarios and not normative accounts of how crisis should be managed.

The researcher is currently exploring the possibility of extending the findings of the study by using the same methodological and theoretical underpinnings in conducting a cross-comparative study of public relations’ intervention in crisis response between Australia and the Philippines, the native country of the researcher. Crisis public relations, as a research field in the Philippines, lacks in-depth scholarly investigation. Utilizing the same qualitative approach used in the Australian study serves as a strong starting point in assessing contemporary crisis management practices in different cultural contexts.

References


ABSTRACT

The Development and Validation of the Corporate Communication Management (CCM) Construct using Exploratory Factor Analysis

Bahtiar Mohamad PhD
School of Multimedia Technology and Communication
Universiti Utara Malaysia
Sintok, Kedah, Malaysia
mbahtiar@uum.edu.my

Ahmed Rageh Ismail
School of Business Management
Universiti Utara Malaysia
Sintok, Kedah Malaysia
a.rageh@rocketmail.com

Hassan Abu Bakar
School of Multimedia Technology and Communication
Universiti Utara Malaysia
Sintok, Kedah, Malaysia
abhassan@uum.edu.my

Purpose – Academic and practitioner interest has focused on corporate communication as a method of competitive advantage and as a way to communicate with various stakeholders. However, much less attention has been paid to develop and validating a measure of corporate communication management (CCM) construct. The purpose of this paper is to develop an empirically-based comprehensive instrument for measuring a CCM.

Design/methodology – This paper describes procedures which explicates the CCM construct, and propose a multi-item measure of CCM predicated on exploratory factor analysis. These descriptors were derived through an extensive literature review, key informant interview, expert opinion and a survey of over 223 corporate communication practitioners from the public listed companies in Malaysia.

Findings – Findings suggest that a CCM scale may best be represented through a structure that consists of six factors identified as corporate advertising, public affairs, public relations, media relations, investor relations and employee communication.

Practical implications – The six-factor model can be used both descriptively and prescriptively. In addition, it presents a practical way to measure an organization's CCM, and could initially be used to establish a baseline level of CCM. Consequently, it could be used as a metric to chart the organization's efforts as it moves to promote corporate communication programme.

Originality/value – More work should be dedicated to developing measures to assess CCM specifically. This model presents a CCM construct that is complimentary to early work that has developed by corporate communication scholar. The findings combined with the suggestions provide an alternative perspective as a measure of corporate communication and extends a basic framework for further exploration.
Celebrity Entrepreneurs: Perceived credibility and impact on advertising effectiveness

Mazzini Muda &
Rosidah Musa
Centre of Marketing and Retailing
Faculty of Business Management,
Universiti Teknologi MARA,
40450 Shah Alam,
Selangor, Malaysia

ABSTRACT

Popular celebrities often lend their name to endorse product in advertisements to supplement their income. Companies hire them because celebrities can add value to their product. Celebrity’s perceived credibility has proven to increase advertising effectiveness. A new phenomenon has emerged where celebrities appear in advertisements, endorsing their own brand of product. The purpose of this study is to assess the impact of celebrity entrepreneur-endorser credibility on three traditional advertising effectiveness constructs using source credibility theory. Source credibility refers to the believability of the endorser, spokesperson or model in the advertisement. 542 female respondents completed a questionnaire based on a stimulus advertisement featuring Malaysia’s singer and entrepreneur, Dato’ Siti Nurhaliza (Siti) endorsing SimplySiti, her own brand of skincare products. Using structural equation modeling (SEM), this study shows that celebrity entrepreneur credibility has four underlying structures: attractiveness, trustworthiness, expertise and decorum. Only expertise and decorum are significant predictors of both, attitude toward the advertisement and attitude toward the brand. These findings are important because they provide the first insights on Malaysian consumer behavior with regards to products owned and promoted by celebrities.

Keywords: celebrity endorser, celebrity entrepreneur, source credibility, advertising effectiveness, Dato’ Siti Nurhaliza, SimplySiti

1.0 Introduction

Advertising is a popular, yet challenging form of marketing communications. With increasing rivalry for consumer attention and new product introduction, advertisers are forced to use attention-grabbing media stars. These celebrities can help advertisements stand out from the surrounding media clutter, thus improving communicative ability by cutting through excess noise in the communication process. Celebrity endorsements have also been found to produce better recall or recognition of a brand name (Friedman & Friedman, 1979; Petty, Cacioppo & Schumann, 1983). Many studies have also shown that celebrity endorsers favorably influenced important advertising effectiveness measures such as attitudes toward the ad (AAD), attitude toward the brand (ABR) and purchase intention (PIN) (Atkin & Block, 1983; Frieden, 1984; La Ferle & Choi, 2005; Petty et al., 1983). Furthermore, celebrity endorsement strategy has the ability to create an image for a product through meaning transfer (Debevec & Iyer, 1986; McCracken, 1989). For these advantages, companies are willing to pay handsomely to have celebrities endorse their brands in the advertisement.
From the perspective of the celebrities, endorsement presents a lucrative supplemental income, which for some celebrities means income far above what they actually made in their original field of work. The allure of multiple endorsement contracts, for instance, brings unwelcomed consequences to the celebrities as well as the companies who hire them. Celebrities who endorsed too many products will lose credibility with consumers who will question the real motive of the endorsement (Tripp et al., 1994), which is more for the money than real testimony for the product. As a result, multiple endorsements will limit the effectiveness and appeal of celebrity endorsement (Silvera & Austad, 2004). With limited opportunity to endorse, some celebrities started to open up their own company and promote their own products by appearing as the endorser or spokesperson. The phenomenon of ‘celebrity entrepreneur-cum-endorser’ is relatively new thus little literature is available. However, celebrity entrepreneurship does share many similarities with celebrity endorsement (Hunter, 2010).

Our knowledge on the effects of celebrity endorsement has been largely informed by researches and models developed in Western countries in which the society has an unhealthy obsession with celebrity culture especially among the younger generations (Douglas, 2003; McCutcheon, Lange & Houran, 2002; Swami, Taylor & Carvalho, 2009). This led the authors to be concerned about the application of those models in Eastern cultures especially cultures dominated by Islamic values that prohibit excessive worshipping of celebrities. Given the recent escalation of celebrity endorsement advertisements in Malaysia, this study may provide some evidence of Eastern values in interpreting the meanings of credibility of celebrity endorsers in developing countries that have similar characteristics with Malaysia.

In order to fill the gap, this study aims to develop a theoretical framework to understand the importance of celebrity credibility in influencing the effectiveness of the advertisement when the celebrity is both, the endorser and the owner of the brand advertised. Advertising effectiveness is conceptualized as consisting of three traditional measures – attitude toward the advertisement, attitude toward the brand and purchase intention. By proposing and subsequently testing the structural relationships among the seven constructs, this study intends to achieve the following objectives: (1) to explore the underlying structures of celebrity entrepreneur-endorser credibility and (2) to investigate the effect of celebrity entrepreneur-endorser credibility constructs (comprising of attractiveness, trustworthiness, expertise and decorum) on advertising effectiveness.

2.0 Theoretical Background and Hypothesis

2.1 Celebrity Endorser and Celebrity Entrepreneur

Celebrities are individuals who are well-known to the public due to their accomplishments in areas such as sports, entertainment, politics, broadcasting, business and many others (Speck, Schumann & Thompson, 1988). In many societies, celebrities are perceived as a model of success. Many consumers aspire to share their values and lifestyles (Alsmadi, 2006). Consumers frequently imitate the ways celebrities dress, communicate, and most importantly, the brands of products celebrities choose and use. Capitalizing on their image, celebrities are used as endorsers of brands in advertisement. A celebrity endorser is an individual who enjoys public recognition and who uses this recognition on behalf of a consumer good by appearing with it in an advertisement (McGuire, 1985). Celebrity endorsement is a heavily employed strategy in advertising because it is more effective than
celebrity-less endorsement in terms of producing desirable outcomes for the sponsor. Celebrities are seen as more likeable by consumers (McGuire, 1985) and therefore more readily identifiable (Kelman, 1961). Celebrities are also looked upon as more expert and trustworthy than non-celebrities (Ohanian, 1990). As a result, consumers connect with celebrities and internalize the ‘things’ they say about the endorsed products (Kelman, 1961).

Increasingly, celebrities engage in business not just as endorsers but also with a financial stake and decision-making role in the business. Hunter (2010) defines celebrity entrepreneurs as individuals who are known for their well known-ness and take part both in owning or running a venture (or are portrayed as doing so) (p. 2). The launching of their new products is usually reported by the media; hence, creating publicity to the celebrity and the venture. The association with the company makes the celebrity an endorser of the company and product. It is understood that by default all celebrity entrepreneurs are celebrity endorsers but not all celebrity endorsers are celebrity entrepreneurs. Since celebrity entrepreneurs are also endorsers, a reasonable way of researching celebrity entrepreneurship is through a celebrity endorsement framework.

2.2 Celebrity Endorser Credibility

Source credibility has been studied by many social scientists in the past several decades in order to understand its effect on message persuasiveness (Ohanian, 1990; Pornpitakpan, 2003). In a review of the source credibility literature over the past five decades, Pornpitakpan (2004) discovers that the majority of studies undertaken indicate that perceived source credibility has some degree of influence on communication effectiveness. In advertising context, such credibility is often associated with a model or an endorser (Friedman & Friedman, 1979; Patzer, 1985; Ohanian, 1990, 1991), the advertiser (MacKenzie & Lutz, 1989), the advertisement (MacKenzie & Lutz, 1989), corporate credibility (Lafferty & Goldsmith, 1999; Goldsmith, Lafferty & Newell, 2000; Newell & Goldsmith, 2001), or web credibility (Choi & Rifon, 2002).

The Source Credibility Model derived from seminal work of Hovland, Janis & Kelley (1953), contend that expertise and trustworthiness are the essential factors leading to the perceived credibility of a message. Expertise is defined as the extent to which a communicator is perceived to be a source of valid assertions about the object or issue, and trustworthiness was referred to as the degree of consumer’s confidence in the communicator’s intent to communicate the assertions she or he considers most valid (Hovland et al., 1953).

On the other hand, the Source Attractiveness Model originates from McGuire’s Source Valence Model (McGuire, 1985). It has attractiveness as the third component of source credibility. Attractiveness refers to the perceived attractiveness of the source (Joseph, 1982; Kahle & Homer, 1985; Ohanian, 1991; Patzer, 1985). Source attractiveness in the context of message effectiveness (and communication) is said to depend on source’s familiarity, likability, similarity and overall attractiveness to the receivers (McGuire, 1985; Ohanian, 1991). Familiarity is considered knowledge of the source through exposure, whereas likeability is affection for the source as a result of the source’s physical appearance and behavior; and similarity is the supposed resemblance between the source and the receiver of the message (McGuire, 1985).
Given the pervasiveness of the usage of celebrities in advertising, a valid instrument for measuring celebrity endorser’s credibility was deemed important for assessing the possible impact of using such individuals. Ohanian (1990) synthesizes previous literature on source effects and proposes three components of celebrity endorser credibility: trustworthiness, expertise and attractiveness. Endorsers who are perceived to be knowledgeable, honest and physically attractive are considered credible and in turn, induce positive attitudinal and behavioral responses from consumers (Ohanian, 1991).

2.2.1 Celebrity Attractiveness

Ohanian (1990) conceptualizes attractiveness as the perceived attractiveness of the endorser. Physical attractiveness is one of the most visible and accessible characteristics of a person (Cabalerro & Solomon, 1984; Patzer, 1983), and as such, people may develop positive attitudes because of this. One of the reasons why a celebrity may do better than a non-celebrity in generating higher communication effectiveness is his/her attractiveness to consumer (Chao et al., 2005). Furthermore, research demonstrates that physical attractiveness has a significant effect on judgment and behavior (Patzer, 1985). Therefore, based on previous studies (Baker & Churchill, 1977; Kahle & Homer, 1985), it is expected that an attractive celebrity endorser has a positive effect on consumers’ attitude toward the advertisement and attitude toward the brand endorsed.

H1: Celebrity attractiveness has a positive influence on attitude toward the advertisement.
H2: Celebrity attractiveness has a positive influence on attitude toward the brand.

2.2.2 Celebrity Trustworthiness

Trustworthiness is conceptualized as the degree of consumer’s confidence in the communicator’s intent to communicate the assertions she/he considers most valid (Hovland et al., 1953, p. 21). Research repeatedly indicates that an endorser associated with high trustworthiness provokes greater message acceptance than an endorser associated with moderate and low trustworthiness. The seminal report of Hovland et al. (1953) reveals findings from several studies about the positive influence of trustworthiness on attitude and intention. In this study, it is also expected that a trustworthy endorser has a positive effect on the consumers’ attitudes toward advertisement and brand endorsed.

H3: Celebrity trustworthiness has a positive influence on attitude toward the ad.
H4: Celebrity trustworthiness has a positive influence on attitude toward the brand.

2.2.3 Celebrity Expertise

Expertise is “the extent to which a communicator is perceived to be a source of valid assertions about the object or issue” (Hovland et al., 1953, p. 21). Research investigating source expertise in persuasive communication generally indicates that the source’s perceived expertise has a positive impact on attitude change (Maddux & Rogers, 1980). Crano (1970) experimentally manipulated the dimensions of expertise and found that subjects exposed to an expert source exhibited more agreement with the advocated position than did those exposed to a low-expertise source. Moreover, in a selling context, an expert salesperson induced a significantly higher number of customers to purchase a product than did the non-expert salesperson (Woodside & Davenport, Jr. 1974). Therefore, it can be expected that an expert endorser has a positive effect on attitudes of consumers.

H5: Celebrity expertise has a positive influence on attitude toward the ad.
H6: Celebrity expertise has a positive influence on attitude toward the brand.
2.2.4 Celebrity Decorum

The literature on celebrity endorsement focuses more on its positive effects and potential benefits for advertisers, while research on negative effects is scant and mostly from a western perspective. Scholars and practitioners report that the greatest fear in hiring a celebrity is when the celebrity’s image becomes “tarnish by allegations of illicit, unethical, unusual, or even slightly unconventional behavior” (Miciak & Shanklin, 1994, p. 53), thus instantly create problems for the endorsement contract (Charbonneau & Garland, 2005; Erdogan, Baker & Tagg, 2001; Louie, Kulik & Johnson, 2001; Money, Shimp & Sakano, 2006). The problem arises as to how negative publicity about the celebrity endorser is associated with the brand being endorsed. There is the possibility that celebrity endorsers who are entwined in destructive scandal transfer the negative repercussion to the endorsed product and company, just like positive information about their performance and achievements create their value or equity as endorser. The negative publicity might affect their credibility as endorsers in the eyes of the consumers to certain degree.

Celebrities, though popular, are mere mortals with tendencies toward good and bad. The few studies on negative celebrity effects (e.g. Hunter & Davidsson, 2008; Louie & Obermiller, 2002; Money et al, 2006; Till & Shimp, 1998) use the term negative information to describe celebrity’s involvement in undesirable events such as incurring injuries, dealing with substance abuse or getting caught engaging in unlawful behaviors (Louie et al., 2001). As even the most mundane information about the celebrity is newsworthy (Pringle, 2004) and researchers have long known that negative is more attention grabbing than positive information (Fiske, 1980; Klebba & Unger, 1982), the effects of negative celebrity information on the endorsement contract is of interest to both, theory and practice.

The effect of negative publicity on a company is dependent on how personally responsible its spokesperson was. Louie et al. (2001) report that a company’s stock performance is affected based on whether the celebrity is blameworthy or blameless. The more culpable a celebrity was the more likely the company will experience losses in stock market value. Furthermore, Klebba and Unger (1982) find that indirectly, negative information may affect attitudes towards the advertisement and brand by lowering the credibility of the endorser. Till and Shimp’s (1998) study reveal that negative information resulted in unfavorable attitudes toward the brand, only in the case where a fictitious celebrity was used to promote a fictitious brand. Interestingly, when a real celebrity is used to promote a fictitious brand and negative information given, there was no significant negative effect to the brand. In a recent study comparing the influence of two types of negative information – self- oriented and other-oriented, between the U.S. and Japan, Money et al. (2006) reveal that negative celebrity information did not necessarily produce less favorable evaluation of a brand.

Based on the literature on the effects of negative publicity on celebrity credibility, we propose that it is important that the reputation of a celebrity in terms of his/her decorum be included as part of his/her credibility assessment. A celebrity’s past behavior should indicate that he/she would be an ongoing asset to the product campaign he or she endorses. Proper decorum or deportment in potential product endorsers should be part of the ‘base criteria’ to find an effective spokesperson and limit the risk of advertising backfires (Miciak & Shanklin, 1994; Swerdlow & Swerdlow, 2003). Based on the review of negative publicity literature, we propose the next two research hypotheses.
H7: Celebrity decorum has a positive influence on attitude toward the ad.  
H8: Celebrity decorum has a positive influence on attitude toward the brand.

2.3 Advertising Effectiveness

In advertising studies, three traditional measures of effectiveness are commonly used: attitude toward the ad (AAD), attitude toward the brand (ABR), and purchase intention (PIN). As such, this study will adopt the above measures as representing consumers’ responses to advertisement endorsed by the celebrity entrepreneur-cum-endorser. In general, findings from previous studies strongly indicate that these constructs are related and impact consumer purchase behavior. Thus, they serve as useful measures of advertising efficacy. Illustrations of sequential path of influence from AAD to ABR, which subsequently impact PIN can be found in many studies (e.g. Lafferty, Goldsmith & Newell, 2002; MacKenzie, Lutz & Belch, 1986; MacKenzie & Lutz, 1989). Shimp (1981) was among the first to suggest that AAD is a mediator of consumer brand choice and empirically examine the AAD-ABR linkage and found that advertising content significantly impacts ABR, PIN and the act of buying. As more companies hire celebrities to represent their brand, it is imperative that they understand the factors that influence consumers’ attitude toward celebrity endorsed advertisements. Therefore, the following three hypotheses are proposed.

H9: Attitude toward the ad has a positive influence on attitude toward the brand.  
H10: Attitude toward the ad has a positive influence on purchase intention.  
H11: Attitude toward the brand has a positive influence on purchase intention.

With the above hypotheses, this study proposes a conceptual model (Figure 1). The model displays the relationships among perceived celebrity credibility constructs and advertising effectiveness constructs. Celebrity attractiveness, trustworthiness, expertise and decorum are treated as exogenous variables, whereas ad attitude, brand attitude and purchase intention are considered as endogenous variables.

Figure 1: Proposed Conceptual Model

3.0 Methodology

3.1 Measurement items and stimulus advertisement
To empirically test the hypotheses, multi-item scales used in previous studies were identified and modified to suit with the study setting. A questionnaire with seven constructs was designed to capture the respondents’ evaluation of celebrity entrepreneur endorsed advertisement. The perceived celebrity endorser credibility was operationalized as consisting of four constructs. The first three constructs of attractiveness, trustworthiness and expertise were measured using Ohanian’s (1990) established scales. Meanwhile the items to measure the new decorum construct were constructed by the authors, based on inputs from two focus group discussions.

Advertising effectiveness was operationalized as consisting of three constructs: attitude toward the advertisement (Bruner & Hensel, 1992), attitude toward the brand (MacKenzie & Lutz 1989) and purchase intention (Yi, 1990). Each of the seven constructs was measured using a 7-point scale: “How much do you agree or disagree with these statements?” (1 = strongly disagree and 7 = strongly agree). Consistent with previous advertising studies in this area, Malaysian popular singer and entrepreneur Dato’ Siti Nurhaliza Taruddin (Siti) and her brand of skincare product, SimplySiti was chosen as a suitable stimulus for the research based on a pretest with 100 respondents. Permission from her company was secured to use the latest SimplySiti’s magazine advertisement to accompany the questionnaire.

3.2 Data Collection and Analyses

A pilot test using 50 undergraduate students from a public university in Malaysia, who were familiar with Siti and never used SimplySiti skincare products, was conducted to ensure the reliability of the scales. Several modifications were made based on the feedback received. Before the questionnaire was finalized, two faculty members familiar with the topic and two marketing communications managers from beauty care companies further reviewed the questionnaire and stimulus advertisement. Consequently, slight revisions in wording and formatting were made based on their suggestions.

The population of the study consisted of females 18 to 55 years old, who resides or works in the Klang Valley, Malaysia. Females were targeted because they are the main users of skincare products. As no sampling frame was readily available, quota sampling approach was used based on ethnic and age factors. 900 questionnaires were distributed via drop-and-collect method at various organizations in several stages. A total of 542 usable questionnaires were collected, yielding a 60.2% response rate. Majority of the respondents were Malays (71.8%), in 24 to 34 age group (41.5%), single (50.2%) and had diploma and below education level (57.2%).

The data were analyzed following Anderson and Gerbing’s (1988) two-step approach: a measurement model and a subsequent structural model. The multiple-item scales of seven constructs were subjected to a confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) to determine whether the manifest variables reflected the hypothesized latent variables. The adequacy of the individual items was assessed by composite reliability, convergent validity and discriminant validity. Once the measures were validated, structural equation modeling (SEM) was used to test the validity of the proposed model and the hypotheses.

4.0 Results
CFA with a maximum likelihood was first conducted in order to estimate the measurement model by verifying the underlying structure of constructs. This study also checked unidimensionality, reliabilities and validities of the constructs in the measurement model before testing the structural model (Table 1). The level of internal consistency in each dimension and construct was acceptable, with Cronbach’s alpha estimates ranging from .78 to .97 (Nunnaly, 1978). All of the composite reliabilities of the constructs were over the cutoff value of .70, ensuring adequate internal consistency of multiple items for each construct (Hair et al., 1988). Convergent validity was satisfied in that all confirmatory factor loadings exceeded the cutoff value of .50 and was significant at .01 (Anderson & Gerbing, 1988). In addition, the average variance extracted (AVE) of all constructs exceeded the minimum criterion of .50, except for celebrity decorum (.47), indicating a large portion of the variance was explained by the constructs (Fornell & Larcker, 1981; Hair et al., 1998).

Discriminant validity was determined by comparing the average variance extracted (AVE) with the squared correlation between constructs (Fornell & Larcker, 1981). The AVEs were substantially greater than the squared correlations between any pair of constructs, suggesting discriminant validity. Discriminant validity signifies that a construct does not significantly share information with the other constructs. In other words, the seven-factor confirmatory measurement model demonstrated the soundness of its measurement properties. The $\chi^2$ value with 329 degrees of freedom was 884.027 (p<0.001). Given the known sensitivity of the $\chi^2$ statistics test to sample size, several widely used goodness-of-fit indices demonstrated that the confirmatory factor model fit the data well ($\chi^2 / df = 2.687$, NFI = 0.96, CFI = 0.97, IFI = 0.97, RMSEA = 0.056).

**Table 1: Reliabilities and confirmatory factor analysis properties**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Cronbach’s alpha</th>
<th>Composite reliabilities</th>
<th>Standardized factor loadings</th>
<th>Item reliabilities</th>
<th>AVE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity attractiveness</td>
<td>.95</td>
<td>.89</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1/C2/C3/C4</td>
<td></td>
<td>.90/.89/.94/.90</td>
<td>.87/.87/.91/.86</td>
<td></td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity trustworthiness</td>
<td>.96</td>
<td>.89</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C5/C6/C7/C8</td>
<td></td>
<td>.89/.91/.95/.94</td>
<td>.87/.88/.91/.90</td>
<td></td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity expertise</td>
<td>.95</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity decorum</td>
<td>.93</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C14/C19/C20/C21/C22</td>
<td></td>
<td>.77/.89/.86/.91/.87</td>
<td>.73/.85/.82/.87/.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad attitude</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A1/A2/A3</td>
<td></td>
<td>.92/.95/.95</td>
<td>.73/.54/.74</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand attitude</td>
<td>.97</td>
<td>.93</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase intention</td>
<td>.97</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P1/P2/P3</td>
<td></td>
<td>.94/.98/.96</td>
<td>.92/.95/.94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The final step involved the estimation of the proposed structural model (Figure 2, Table 2). The estimation produced the following statistics: $\chi^2 (333) = 891.522 (p<0.001)$, $\chi^2 / df = 2.677$, NFI = .96, CFI = .97, IFI = .97, RMSEA = .056. The model’s fit as indicated by these indexes was deemed satisfactory; thus, it provides a good basis for testing the hypothesized paths.

**Figure 2: The structural model with parameter estimates**

![Diagram](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesized path</th>
<th>Standardized path coefficients</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1: Celebrity attractiveness → Ad attitude</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>2.33*</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2: Celebrity attractiveness → Brand attitude</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3: Celebrity trustworthiness → Ad attitude</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>2.25*</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4: Celebrity trustworthiness → Brand attitude</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H5: Celebrity expertise → Ad attitude</td>
<td>.29</td>
<td>5.49***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H6: Celebrity expertise → Brand attitude</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>4.09***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H7: Celebrity decorum → Ad attitude</td>
<td>.26</td>
<td>3.45**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H8: Celebrity decorum → Brand attitude</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>2.19*</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H9: Ad attitude → Brand attitude</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>18.12***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H10: Ad attitude → Purchase</td>
<td>.30</td>
<td>4.68***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Hypothesis 1, which hypothesized a positive relationship between celebrity entrepreneur endorser attractiveness and attitude toward the ad, was supported. Hypothesis 2 for predicting a positive relationship between celebrity entrepreneur endorser attractiveness and attitude toward the brand was not supported. The results of these two hypotheses suggested that just having an attractive celebrity endorsing a product in an advertisement may not be good enough for the consumers to have positive attitude toward the brand endorsed. Similarly, for hypothesis 3 and 4, having a trustworthy celebrity endorser in the advertisement may be good to induce positive attitude toward the ad but not for the brand endorsed. On the contrary, hypothesis 5 and 6 for predicting positive relationship between celebrity expertise and attitude toward the ad and attitude toward the brand respectively, were supported. Same goes for hypothesis 7 and 8, which proposed a positive relationship between celebrity decorum and attitude toward the ad and attitude toward brand respectively, were also supported. The results suggest that by putting celebrity endorser who were perceived as an expert and possessed decorum, consumers would have positive attitude toward both, the advertisement and the brand endorsed.

Hypothesis 9, which predicted a positive relationship between attitude toward the ad and attitude toward the brand, was supported. Likewise, hypothesis 10 for a positive relationship between attitude toward ad and purchase intention was supported. Hypothesis 11 for predicting a positive relationship between attitude toward the brand and purchase intention was supported as well. These findings suggest that having a positive attitude toward the advertisement endorsed by a celebrity entrepreneur may possibly lead to a positive attitude toward the brand he or she owned and endorsed in the advertisement. Interestingly, the results suggest that purchase intention may be triggered directly by positive attitude toward the ad as well as positive attitude toward the brand. Additionally, purchase intention may be activated by positive attitude toward the advertisement, mediated by positive attitude toward the brand. However, attitude toward the brand is a stronger predictor to purchase intention compared to attitude toward the ad (standardized coefficient of 0.64 versus 0.30).

5.0 Discussion

The importance of marketing communications and its strategic role in marketing mix has increased dramatically in recent decades (Shimp, 2008). Indeed, it has been claimed that marketing and communications are virtually inseparable (Schultz, Tannenbaum & Lauterborn, 1993). Advertising is a popular component of marketing communications and takes up a large portion of companies’ promotion budget. Thus, striving for advertising effectiveness has been a major concern for companies for decades as the industry is very competitive and cluttered. To break through the advertising clutter, advertisers turn to credible celebrities to become ‘attention getters’, forge a brand’s image, aid in branding and rebranding, generate public relations and increase high recall rates. In fact, Erdogan (1999) argues that celebrity endorsers are more effective than non celebrity endorsers in generating ‘all’ desirable advertising outcome. However, claiming celebrity endorsers are more effective in general is very different from claiming they are more effective in specific situation.
This study sought to understand the effects that celebrity credibility have on advertising effectiveness when the celebrity who endorses the product in the advertisement is also a celebrity entrepreneur who owns the product as well as the company. The scanty literature on celebrity entrepreneurship argues that from the perspective of the consumers, there are more similarities than differences between a celebrity entrepreneur and a celebrity endorser (Hunter, 2010). However, with increasing reports of notorious celebrities and the pending damage on their endorsement contracts, celebrity decorum is proposed to be among the main characteristics to determine celebrity credibility. Findings from this study revealed that indeed celebrity decorum is one of the main attributes influencing celebrity endorser credibility, after celebrity expertise, followed by trustworthiness and attractiveness.

Most empirical evidence of consumers’ attitudinal and behavioral responses to advertisements endorsed by celebrities found that attractiveness (Horai, Naccari & Fatoullah, 1974; Shavitt, Swan, Lowrey & Waenke, 1994) and trustworthiness (Despande & Stayman, 1994; McGinnies & Ward, 1980; Pornpitakpan, 1998, 2002, 2003) positively influences persuasion. However, in this study, attractiveness, though significant, was found to be the least predictor to celebrity credibility. This is surprising considering that the product endorsed in the advertisement was attractiveness related.

The results also showed that attractiveness and trustworthiness only had a positive association with AAD but not with ABR. These results imply that in the case of celebrity entrepreneur endorsed advertisements, a pretty face is just as good as attracting consumers to take a look at the advertisement. Same goes with trustworthiness. However, there are indirect effects of attractiveness and trustworthiness on ABR, mediated by AAD. In addition, AAD and ABR serve as mediators to the relationship between celebrity credibility constructs and purchase intention. Whereas some very early research indicated the link between attitudes and behavior as not highly correlated, more recent research has indicated that attitudes substantially mediate behavioral intentions (Fishbein & Ajzen, 1975; Mitchell & Olson, 1981).

6. Limitation and future research

The results of the study should be interpreted with caution because of the limitations of the study. Firstly, with regard to the stimuli, the findings are limited to the celebrity, medium and product tested. For instance, a different celebrity entrepreneur, of different gender or of different race may produce different results. Furthermore, results may be different if respondents were exposed to the stimulus advertisement across a longer period of time and more repeatedly. This is because repeated exposures to advertisements have been found to strengthen attitudes over time (Grossman & Till, 1998).

Regarding the measurements of the constructs, the hypothesized framework for this study was not designed to include all possible aspects of credibility related to advertisements and advertising effectiveness. The focus of the study was limited to the identified variables: attractiveness, trustworthiness, expertise, decorum, attitude toward the advertisement, attitude toward the brand and purchase intention. Whilst these variables were able to explain certain percentages of the variance in attitudes and behavior, they left certain percentages of the variance unexplained. For instance, credibility aspects of advertising may not only related to the endorser and message in the advertisement, but also include products and media.
(Prendergast, Liu & Poon, 2009). Future studies can examine the relevance of these other credibility constructs of advertising in the context of celebrity entrepreneur endorsement.
REFERENCES


Message framing and message orientation in energy conservation ads: Relative effect on Asian audiences

Ratanasuda Punnahitanond PhD
School of Communication Arts,
Bangkok University

Banphot Chomngam
School of Humanities
Bangkok University

ABSTRACT

This study aims to evaluate message framing (gain-framed vs. loss-frame) versus message orientation (other-oriented vs. self-oriented) used in energy conservation advertisements for influencing Asian audiences’ intention to conserve energy. Survey was conducted with 565 college students of Asian nationalities recruited from both public and private universities in Bangkok. After exposing to one of the four test advertisements created with different combinations of message framing and orientation, samples responded to a self-administered questionnaire. The Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB) integrating a combination of message framing and orientation together with cultural variable, self-construal, provides a conceptual framework for developing research hypotheses. Multiple Regression analyses reveal that among all four messages, gain-framed and other-oriented advertisement was the most effective message strategy. Partial support was found for the influences of interdependent self-construal and attitude toward energy conservation on intention to conserve energy. Results confirm the significant impact of perceived behavioral control, but not subjective norm, on behavioral intention, as proposed by the TPB. Findings suggest that the combination of message framing and message orientation deserves further examination as potential tools for stimulating energy conservation among Asian audiences. The findings also allow message designers to be aware of relative effects of different message strategies on audiences with different type of self-construal so that they select the most effective message strategy in order to successfully stimulate energy conservation or other preventive behaviors among Asian audiences.

Introduction

Conserving natural resources (e.g., water, air, forest) which are sources of non-renewable energy (e.g., petroleum, electricity) requires a consistent collaboration from all groups of people in the society. Due to globalization, many local problems are transformed into international issues. As such few countries are being left untouched by major environmental problems such as energy problem. Similar to several Asian countries, Thailand is currently facing the energy problem due to the insufficient natural resources for both manufacturing and service sectors and dependence on several types of energy from aboard, especially petroleum (Ministry of Energy, 2012). As petroleum is the most common source of energy used in industrial and agricultural production, commerce, transportation, and residential facilities, governments of each country aim
to alleviate this problem by enhancing effectiveness of domestic energy utilization and by searching for alternative energy. Along the same line, several social marketing attempts in the form of advertising campaigns have been made to promote energy conservation during the past decades. In Thailand, for example “Synergy Divided by 2,” one of the most memorable TV campaigns created by Leo Burnett, encouraged the Thai audiences to conserve a variety of energy such as electricity and gasoline (The Advertising Book, 1995). This campaign was highly successful in creating an awareness of energy crisis and stimulating behavioral change among the Thai public in the past decade.

Our examination of energy conservation advertising campaigns in Thailand in 2012 reveals a lack of theoretical grounding in terms of message design and inconsistency of message strategy. For example, the latest television advertising campaign entitled “Acknowledge and then Change,” produced by Ministry of Energy, tried to convince the Thai audiences to reduce energy usage by using the compact fluorescent bulb (CFB) in their daily life. Its focus is a mix of both personal and social benefit. On another hand, a television commercial entitled “The Land of Ours,” produced by the Metropolitan Electricity Authority emphasized the availability of renewable energy in Thailand. Albeit the effectiveness evaluation of these campaigns, the relative effect of different types of message strategy has been hardly examined in consideration with audiences’ cultural factor.

In terms of message framing, research evidences show that gain-framed message is more persuasive in promoting prevention of health problems whereas loss-framed message is more persuasive in promoting detection of illness (Salovey, Schneider, & Apanovitch, 2002). As for message orientation, messages that are consistent with consumers’ self-construal are persuasive (Agrawal & Maheswaran, 2005). Self-oriented message should be more persuasive among individuals with independent-self construal while other-oriented message should be more persuasive among individuals with interdependent-self construal. Accordingly, this study intends to investigate whether message framing and message orientation have different impact on the audiences in the context of energy conservation. The findings would allow message designers to be aware of relative effects of different message strategies so that they select the appropriate and most effective message strategy in order to successfully stimulate energy conservation or other preventive behaviors among Asian audiences.

**Literature Review and Hypotheses**

**Message Framing**

Among three aspects of persuasive communication – source, recipient, and message, message framing has been quite systematically examined by communication researchers especially in the context of health and illness (Salovey et al., 2002). Rothman and Salovey (1997) described message framing as the emphasis in the message on the positive or negative outcomes of adopting or not adopting a particular health-related behavior. Gain-framed message presents the benefits gained through adopting the requested behavior while loss-framed message presents the costs of not adopting the requested behavior.

Based on the value function of prospect theory (Tversky & Kahneman, 1981), when behavioral options involve some risks, individuals tend to take these risks when information is framed in terms of the relative disadvantages or costs of the behavioral choices. On the contrary,
when information is framed in terms of the relative benefits or gains, individuals are likely to take the requested action in order to avoid those risks. Based on empirical evidences, Gain-framed messages are more persuasive with disease prevention behaviors such as smoking cessation whereas loss-framed messages are more persuasive with disease detection behaviors such as breast cancer screening (O’Keefe & Jensen, 2009; Salovey et al., 2002). As energy conservation is considered a kind of prevention behavior, it is beneficial to find out in the context of environmental protection whether a match between a message frame and the type of behavior targeted for change effectively motivates behavioral change.

**Message Orientation**

In addition to message framing, another aspect of message called message orientation involves different target focus of the persuasive message. Generally there are two types of message orientation – self versus others. They are presumed to have different influence on different groups of message recipient. In an advertising context, past research shows that self-oriented appeal is more persuasive among men whereas other-oriented appeal is more persuasive among women (Brunel & Nelson, 2000; Brunel & Nelson, 2003). These differences in advertising response were explained through gendered variations, which are resulted from cultural values held by individuals. However, this message strategy was not examined with different groups of message recipients holding different cultural values. This study aims to investigate whether effects of message orientation vary depending on the type of self-construal an individual holds.

**Self-Construal**

Culture such as individualism-collectivism affects the development and accessibility of one aspect of the self, which is called self-construal (Singelis & Brown, 1995). Defined by Markus and Kitayama (1991), this construct describes the relationship between the self and others and the degree to which one sees oneself as disconnected or connected with others. There are two fundamental and relatively stable types of self-construal – independent and interdependent self-construal. According to Singelis and Brown (1995), an independent self-construal is defined as a ‘restricted, unitary, steady’ self that is separated from social context. Four core aspects include: (1) internal attributes such as cognitions and emotions; (2) being distinctive and expressive; (3) realizing internal attributes and supporting one’s own goals; and (4) communicating in straightforward manners. The self is conceived of as an ‘autonomous’ person. Representations of the inner self are the most activated in one’s memory and highly accessible while one is thinking of self.

In contrast, an interdependent self-construal is conceptualized as an ‘elastic, variant’ self that is connected with social context. Four major aspects involve: (1) external attributes such as status, duties, and relationships; (2) belonging and according; (3) taking up one’s right place and properly act; and (4) communicating in oblique manners and interpreting others’ thoughts (Singelis & Brown, 1995). The self is conceived of as an ‘individual-in-relation-to-others.’ Behavior that involves significant others is unlikely to be shaped by internal attributes. Representations of one’s relations to others are the most activated in one’s memory and highly accessible when one is viewing self.

Two major phenomena resulted from holding an interdependent view of the self are: 1) individuals’ cognitive elaboration of the other or of the self-in-relation-to-other tends to expand; and 2) their information on self or others corresponds to the focal context to which the self or
others are attached (Markus & Kitayama, 1991). Research reveals that contextual factors influenced the behavior of individuals with interdependent selves to a greater extent than those with independent selves (Singelis & Brown, 1995; Trafimow & Finlay, 1996). These factors include relations or interactions with others, obligations, responsibilities, or commitments to others. As a consequence, restricted by the obligations determining the particular kind of relationship with that particular person, actions toward others tend to be inconsistent (Smith & Bond, 1998). Interpersonal relations allow one to effectively comprehend behaviors of those with interdependent selves. Markus and Kitayama (1991) also proposed that holding an interdependent self-construal leads to significant motivational consequences. Other-serving motives become salient due to interdependent view of the self. Therefore, individuals with interdependent selves are likely to be driven by other-serving motives, and value the maintenance of harmonious relations with significant others.

In addition, functional matching theory suggests that messages that are congruent with individuals’ values should be more effective than messages that are irrelevant or incongruent (Han & Shavitt, 1994). Based on logical reasoning and empirical evidences regarding the varying persuasiveness of message framing depending on different type of behavior (prevention vs. detection), together with the effects of message orientation in terms of other-oriented, and interdependent self-construal on individuals’ cognition and social behaviors described above, the first hypothesis postulates that:

**H1**: Among four message strategies, gain-framed and other-oriented message has the strongest influence on the Asian audiences’ intention to conserve energy.

According to Bond (1986), individuals with interdependent selves continue to live up to significant others, typically the family. Triandis, McCusker, & Hui (1990) suggest that the self in collectivist societies is defined in in-group terms, which results in personal sacrifice for the benefits of one’s in-group. Similarly, it was found that social behavior is determined by in-group norms to a larger extent among those with interdependent self-construal than those with independent one (Davidson, Jaccard, Triandis, Morales, & Diaz-Guerrero, 1976). Therefore, the second hypothesis proposes that:

**H2**: Asian audiences’ interdependent self-construal positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.

Among various in-group norms, subjective norm (the perceived social pressure to perform or not perform the behavior) is one of the three key predictors of behavioral intention proposed by the Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB). Therefore, this study applies the TPB to provide a conceptual framework that describes the hypothesized relationships between message strategies, interdependent self-construal, and other three determinants of behavioral intention (see the conceptual model in Figure 1).

**The Theory of Planned Behavior**

The Theory of Planned Behavior is a theory designed to predict and explain human behavior in specific contexts. It is an extension of the Theory of Reasoned Action, by adding the perceived behavioral control. The original theory has limitations in dealing with behavior over with people have incomplete volitional control. Based on Ajzen (1991), the theory postulates three conceptually independent determinants of behavioral intention. The first is the attitude toward the behavior (the degree to which a person has a favorable or unfavorable evaluation of
the behavior in question). The second predictor is a subjective norm. The third is the degree of perceived behavioral control (the perceived ease or difficulty of performing the behavior). This last determinant is assumed to reflect the past experience as well as anticipated obstacles.

With respect to the first determinant indicated by the TPB, the more favorable the attitude toward the behavior, the stronger should be an individual’s intention to perform the behavior under consideration. As a result, the third hypothesis proposes that:

**H3: Asian audiences’ attitude toward energy conservation positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.**

In terms of the second determinant, the more favorable subjective norm with respect to the behavior, the stronger should be an individual’s intention to perform the behavior under consideration. As a result, the fourth hypothesis postulates that:

**H4: Asian audiences’ subjective norm positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.**

In term of the third determinant, the greater the perceived behavioral control, the stronger should be an individual’s intention to perform the behavior under consideration. Therefore, the fifth hypothesis proposes that:

**H5: Asian audiences’ perceived behavioral control positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.**

Figure 1 illustrates the conceptual framework used to develop the research hypotheses of this study.

**Figure 1: Conceptual Model**

![Conceptual Model Diagram](image-url)
Method

Study Design

To investigate how message framing and orientation may influence the way samples respond to energy conservation advertisements, a survey in the form of a self-administered questionnaire was conducted within a two-week period (September 2011) in Bangkok, Thailand with 565 respondents.

Sample

The target population is college students of Asian nationalities in Bangkok. The samples were recruited with the use of purposive sampling in terms of ethnicity as the data collection was a part of a class research project assigned to graduate students who enrolled for a communication research class (international program). A total of 565 students participated in the survey. The ages range from 17 to 39 years, with a mean age of 21.43 years old. The sample composed of slightly less males (42.8 %) than females (57.2 %). Almost all of the samples are undergraduate students (93.4%) while the rest (6.6%) are graduate students. The samples had a variety of academic majors such as Business Administration/Accounting/Economics (26.4%), Communication/Journalism (20.2%), Computer/IT/Engineering (11.2%), Language (11.0%), and Arts and Design (7.3%). The samples were almost equally divided between private institutions (51.7%) and public institutions (48.3%). As for individual income, more than half of the samples earn less than 10,000 Baht/month (56.0%), while 28.8% of them earn 10,000 – 19,999 Baht/month, followed by 20,000 – 29,999 Baht/month (7.2%), 40,000 Baht/month and higher (4.9%), and 30,000 – 39,999 Baht/month (3.1%) respectively. The majority of them were Buddhist (75.8%) while the rest were Christian (8.3%), Others (6.7%), Muslim (4.3%), Hindu (2.8%), and Sikh (1.1%).

Stimulus

Four print advertisements promoting energy conservation were used as the stimuli in this study. The stimuli ask the audience to conserve energy with different message framing and orientation. Each stimulus was the same size (one A4 page) with the same layout in four colors, containing both text and visual elements (one sentence copy and one picture). There are two versions of the stimuli, one in Thai and another one in English. The four stimuli are briefly described in Table 1.

Table 1: Advertising Stimuli

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Framing and Orientation</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Picture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 1: Gain-framed &amp; Other-oriented</td>
<td>Save the energy, save the earth</td>
<td>Earth surrounded by green leaves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 2: Gain-framed &amp; Self-oriented</td>
<td>Save the energy, save your money</td>
<td>Cash bag</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 3: Loss-framed &amp; Other-oriented</td>
<td>Abuse the energy, burn the earth</td>
<td>Earth burned by fire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 4: Loss-framed &amp; Self-oriented</td>
<td>Abuse the energy, burn your money</td>
<td>Bank notes got fire</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Procedure

Prior to the data collection, three senior scholars in Advertising reviewed the four test advertisements unanimously and confirmed that the stimuli contain self-oriented versus other-oriented, and gain versus loss frame. The test advertisements were created by the investigator in both Thai and English version. At the beginning of the survey, the research assistants introduced themselves and objectives of the research project to the samples, and then requested for their cooperation. After the respondents agreed to participate in the study, a questionnaire was distributed to each respondent, who was asked to carefully read only one of the four test advertisements. All respondents were then asked to determine their thoughts and feelings and indicate their attitude toward the test advertisement. A series of questions related to self-construal, attitude toward energy conservation, subjective norms, and intention to save energy were also asked. Finally, the respondents were asked a few more questions regarding demographic information in terms of age, gender, ethnicity, religion, individual income, current year of study, academic major, and type of academic institution.

The questionnaires were administered by research assistants. All respondents were instructed to truthfully fill out the questionnaire. The survey took approximately 15 minutes to complete. The data were gathered anonymously and were used to characterize individuals’ reactions to the energy conservation advertisements.

Measures

The survey questionnaire consisted of 11 sections, each of which was in a scale or a multiple-choice format. The first section of the questionnaire asked general demographic questions. The second section asked four questions regarding the audience’s reactions to one of the four test advertisements. The third section contained 24 items assessing participants’ self-construal. The fourth section measured the respondents’ past engagement in energy conservation. The fifth section asked the respondents to determine their intention to conserve energy. The sixth and seventh section measured attitude toward energy conservation. Questions on respondents’ subjective norm were included in the eighth and ninth section. The last two sections of the questionnaire contained questions regarding perceived behavioral control.

Demographics: Eight items measuring respondents’ demographic characteristics included gender, age, individual income, religion, year of current study, academic major, and type of academic institution.

Attitudes toward energy conservation advertisement: Respondents were asked to indicate their attitudes toward the selected test advertisement. Items used semantic differential scales with a value of one associated with the more negative word and a value of four associated with the more positive word – not trustworthy/trustworthy, boring/interesting, not persuasive/persuasive, and bad/good. This scale is adapted from an attitude toward the advertisement scale developed by Silvera and Austad (2004). The average score of four items determined each respondent’s attitudes toward particular test advertisement. High scores represent favorable attitudes whereas low scores represent non-favorable attitudes. The Cronbach’s Alpha of these scales ranges from .64 to .84.
Self-construal: This study adapted the Self-construal Scale (24 items) developed by Singelis (1994). Based on a 4-point scale ranging from 1 (not at all reflect) to 4 (highly reflect), respondents indicated the degree to which each of the statements (e.g., I respect decisions made by my group) reflects his/her personal view on various situations. As 12 of 24 items represent independent self-construal, their scores were reversed to make them accurate scoring for interdependent self-construal. The total score determines what kind of self-construal (independent versus interdependent) participants possessed. The higher the score, the more interdependent self-construal one holds. Using a mid-level (48 points) of the total score (96 points) as a cut-off point, those who scored higher than 48 points are considered to primarily hold an interdependent self-construal whereas those who scored 48 points and lower are considered to primarily hold an independent self. Only 0.9% of the respondents (n = 5) hold an independent self-construal whereas 99.1% of them (n = 537) hold an interdependent self-construal (α = .79).

Past energy conservation: This measure examines samples’ energy conservation behavior during the past six months. There are nine items -- three on electricity, three on fuel, and the other three on water. The total scores indicate the extent to which the respondents engaged in energy conservation in the past (α = .72).

Behavioral intention: This measure examines samples’ degree of intention to conserve energy within one month after reading one of the four energy conservation advertisements. Three items were on a 4-point scale ranging from 1 (very unlikely) to 4 (very likely). Scores for three types of energy (electricity, fuel, and water) were combined to compute the behavioral intention for a particular message framing and orientation. High score signifies high intention while low score signifies low intention (α = .82).

Outcome evaluations: Four positive outcomes of conserving energy, based on a 4-point scale ranging from -2 (strongly disagree) to 2 (strongly agree) were evaluated. Positive score shows that participants have positive evaluation of energy conservation whereas negative score shows that they have negative evaluation (α = .81).

Belief strength of outcome: Possibility regarding the consequences of each of the four behavioral outcomes is measured. The score, ranging from 0 (not at all certain) to 3 (extremely certain), determined each participant’s belief strength such that positive score represents strong belief whereas negative score represents weak belief (α = .83).

Attitude toward the behavior: To compute this variable, score on outcome evaluation of each conservation behavior was multiplied with its relevant belief strength. The products of four pairs were then added. High score indicates positive attitude while low score indicates negative attitude toward energy conservation.

Normative belief: The degree to which parent/caretaker(s) and close friend(s) support or oppose the energy conservation was investigated. The score ranges from -2 (strongly oppose) to 2 (strongly support). Negative score means negative belief whereas positive score means positive belief (α = .55).

Motivation to comply: Samples’ level of motivation to comply with parent/caretaker(s) and close friend(s) in general was measured. The score ranges from 0 (not at all) to 3 (strongly).
Positive score signifies high motivation whereas negative score signifies low motivation ($\alpha = .65$).

**Subjective norm**: To compute this variable, scores on normative belief of parent/caretaker(s) and of close friend(s) were multiplied with relevant score on motivation to comply. The products of both pairs were then added. High score indicates positive norm while low score indicates negative norm.

**Efficacy belief**: Respondents were asked to determine the degree of their perceived ability to conserve three types of energy. The score ranges from -2 (very low) to 2 (very high). Positive score signifies high efficacy belief whereas negative score represents low efficacy belief ($\alpha = .69$).

**Belief strength of efficacy**: The strength of belief in samples’ ability to conserve energy is measured. The score ranges from 0 (not at all certain) to 3 (extremely certain). Positive score represents strong belief while negative score represents weak belief ($\alpha = .73$).

**Perceived behavioral control**: To compute this variable, score on efficacy belief in conserving energy was multiplied with relevant belief strength score. High score indicates high perceived control whereas low score indicates low perceived control.

**Results**

The analyses of descriptive statistics reveal the scores of six independent variables – attitude toward energy conservation advertisements using different message framing and orientation, self-construal, attitude toward energy conservation, subjective norm, and perceived behavioral control – and one dependent variable, intention to conserve energy (see details in Table 2).

In terms of self-construal, almost all of the samples are considered primarily holding *interdependent* self as its mean score is 69.78, which is higher than the cut-off point (48). The average scores of the attitudes toward the energy conservation advertisement using different message framing and orientation range from 2.71 to 2.77 (on a 4-point Likert scale). As the scores exceed the mid-level (2.00), this can be interpreted that respondents have slightly positive attitudes toward all test advertisements. The number of respondents who were exposed to each test advertisement is reported in Table 3.

**Table 2: Means and Standard Deviation of Variables**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Total Scores</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self-construal</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>69.78</td>
<td>7.80</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Att. toward Ad # 1: Gain &amp; other</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Att. toward Ad # 2: Gain &amp; self</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.77</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Att. toward Ad # 3: Loss &amp; other</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.74</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Multiple Regression Analyses were used to test the proposed hypotheses (see Table 8 for the summary of the hypothesis testing). The data analyses yield that the first predictor, interdependent self-construal, accounts for a significant amount of intention to conserve energy, R² ranges from .112 to .042, p values range from .05 to .000. The second set of predictor -- message framing and orientation together with three determinants of behavioral intention -- also accounts for a significant proportion of intention to conserve energy, after controlling for the effect of self-construal, R² change ranges from .169 to .453, p values range from .05 to .000 (see Multiple Regression statistics in Table 4 – 7 for further details).

**Hypothesis 1** suggested that gain-framed and other-oriented message (Ad # 1) has the strongest influence on behavioral intention among all four message strategies. Multiple Regression analyses of behavioral intention used message strategy and orientation as one of the predictors support this hypothesis, with the significant highest beta-values for intention to conserve energy, β = .145, t(133) = 2.22, p > .05 (see Multiple Regression statistics of message framing and orientation in Table 4 – 7 for further details). Among four advertisements, the gain-framed and other-oriented advertisement was found to be the most appealing strategy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Number of Respondents for Each Test Advertisement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Test Advertisements</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 1: Save energy, save the earth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 2: Save energy, save your money</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 3: Abuse energy, burn the earth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad # 4: Abuse energy, burn your money</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| | Att. toward Ad # 4: Loss & self | 4 | 2.71 | .62 | 170 |
| Past energy conservation | 4 | 2.99 | .48 | 559 |
| Attitude toward energy conservation | 24 | 11.87 | 7.76 | 562 |
| Subjective norm | 12 | 4.72 | 3.70 | 564 |
| Perceived behavioral control | 18 | 6.12 | 5.80 | 562 |
| Behavioral intention – Ad # 1 | 4 | 3.00 | .65 | 149 |
| Behavioral intention – Ad # 2 | 4 | 2.89 | .58 | 120 |
| Behavioral intention – Ad # 3 | 4 | 2.93 | .63 | 121 |
| Behavioral intention – Ad # 4 | 4 | 3.01 | .58 | 172 |
Hypothesis 2 suggested that interdependent self-construal positively contribute to intention to conserve energy. Multiple Regression analyses of behavioral intention used self-construal as one of the predictors partially support this hypothesis. All message strategies, except the gain-framed and self-oriented advertisement (Ad # 2) have significant beta-values for intention to conserve energy (see Multiple Regression statistics of interdependent self-construal in Table 4 – 7 for further details). The more interdependent self-construal, the higher intention to conserve energy an individual has.

Hypothesis 3 suggested that attitude toward energy conservation positively contributes to behavioral intention. Multiple Regression analysis of intention to conserve energy used attitude toward energy conservation as one of the predictors. The analysis results partially support this hypothesis. Scores of attitude toward energy conservation for all test advertisements, except the gain-framed and self-oriented advertisement (Ad # 2) have significant beta-values for intention to conserve energy (see Multiple Regression statistics of attitude toward energy conservation in Table 4 – 7 for further details). The more positive attitude toward energy conservation, the higher intention to conserve energy one has.

Hypothesis 4 proposed that subjective norm positively contributes to behavioral intention. Multiple Regression analysis of intention to conserve energy used subjective norm as one of the predictors. The analysis results did not support this hypothesis, with non-significant beta-values for intention to conserve energy for all message strategies (see Multiple Regression statistics of subjective norm in Table 4 – 7 for further details).

Hypothesis 5 proposed that perceived behavioral control positively contributes to behavioral intention. Multiple Regression analyses of intention to conserve energy used perceived behavioral control as one of the predictors. The analysis results support this hypothesis, with significant beta-values for intention to conserve energy for all test advertisements (see Multiple Regression statistics of perceived behavioral control in Table 4 – 7 for further details). The higher perceived behavioral control, the higher intention to conserve energy one has.

Table 4: Summary of Statistics Indicating Predictors of Intention to Conserve Energy Ad # 1: Gain-Framed & Other-Oriented Advertisement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictors</th>
<th>Multiple Regression Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 1: Self-construal</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 2: Message Framing &amp; Orientation</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjective norm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Att. toward energy conservation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived behavioral control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5: Summary of Statistics Indicating Predictors of Intention to Conserve Energy Ad # 2: Gain-Framed & Self-Oriented Advertisement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictors</th>
<th>Multiple Regression Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Step 1:</strong> Self-construal</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Step 2:</strong> Message Framing &amp; Orientation</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjective norm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Att. toward energy conservation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived behavioral control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6: Summary of Statistics Indicating Predictors of Intention to Conserve Energy Ad # 3: Loss-Framed & Other-Oriented Advertisement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictors</th>
<th>Multiple Regression Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Step 1:</strong> Self-construal</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Step 2:</strong> Message Framing &amp; Orientation</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjective norm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Att. toward energy conservation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived behavioral control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7: Summary of Statistics Indicating Predictors of Intention to Conserve Energy Ad # 4: Loss-Framed & Self-Oriented Advertisement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictors</th>
<th>Multiple Regression Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Step 1:</strong> Self-construal</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Step 2:</strong> Message Framing &amp; Orientation</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjective norm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Att. toward energy conservation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived behavioral control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

p = .000***
Table 8: Summary of Hypothesis Testing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HP1: Among four message strategies, gain-framed and other-oriented message has the strongest influence on Asian audiences’ intention to conserve energy.</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HP2: Asian audiences’ interdependent self-construal positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.</td>
<td>Partially supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HP3: Asian audiences’ attitude toward energy conservation positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.</td>
<td>Partially supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HP4: Asian audiences’ subjective norm positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HP5: Asian audiences’ perceived behavioral control positively contributes to their intention to conserve energy.</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

Combining both gain-framed and other-oriented message in one advertisement is considered an interactive effect of message strategy and message orientation. Firstly, it is the match between the message framing and type of targeted behavior. The findings confirm that different types of message framing (gain-framed versus loss-framed) have different effect on audiences. Its relative effect is dependent on the type of behavior being promoted. Although previous research findings in the context of health and illness (Salovey et al., 2002) reveal that gain-framed messages were more persuasive with prevention behaviors than loss-framed ones, the interactive effect of message framing and orientation was found in this study such that gain-framed message significantly influenced behavioral intention only when used with other-oriented message (test ad # 1).

Secondly, it is the match between audiences’ sense of self and cultural values embedded in the message. The finding adds to empirical evidences on the relative effects of two different message orientations (self-oriented versus other-oriented) on viewers. Although past research found that cultural values reflected in a message that matches an individuals’ sense of self or values can influence persuasion effects (e.g., Han & Shavitt, 1994; Zhang & Gelb, 1996), another interactive effect of message framing and orientation was also found in this study such that self-oriented message significantly influenced behavioral intention when used with loss-framed message (test ad # 4).

Energy conservation is considered prevention behavior. In addition, conserving energy enables individuals to fulfill their in-group norms or duties, which is highly valued by those with interdependent self. Both matches sufficiently explain why the first advertisement (gain-framed and other-oriented) was found to be the most persuasive message among Asian samples.

The study reported high levels of interdependent self-construal among the respondents. This is consistent with the study conducted by Punnahitanond and Nelson (2011) showing that individuals from the collectivist society like Thailand hold the interdependent self. This may be
influenced by the predominance of collectivism in the respondents’ country of origin. Holding a more interdependent self-construal is, in turn, related to observing others’ reactions, greater sensitivity, and responsiveness to others’ feelings (Markus & Kitayama, 1991). This kind of self regards the preservation of harmonious relations with significant others in one’s lives as the major goal. Due to a very small number of samples with independent self, conclusion cannot be made that individuals with interdependent self would have higher intention than those with independent self to adopt the behaviors that benefit significant others in their lives. Result of positive correlation between interdependent self and subjective norm (r range between .16 and .50, p range between < .05 - .000) points to the possibility of manipulating subjective norm in persuasive messages directed to audiences in the collectivist societies.

It should be noted that samples had a moderate engagement in past energy conservation (mean score of 2.99 from 4.00). As a result, it is possible that samples’ past behavior moderated the influence of other predictors on their behavioral intention. Controlling for its effect may yield more accurate findings.

Findings from the investigation of the relative effect of two different message strategies on individuals’ intention to engage in energy conservation benefit to some extent the advertising researchers and public communication administrators in terms of message design. This paper is also beneficial to examine whether interdependent self-construal positively contributes to behavioral intention. Unexpectedly, findings reveal that subjective norm is not a strong predictor of behavioral intention, as proposed by the Theory of Planned Behavior, in an environmental communication context. Further research is required to confirm this finding.

**Limitations and Implications**

This study employed only college students enrolled at higher education institutions in Bangkok. Therefore, the findings are limited in terms of generalization to other groups of Asian populations. In the future, this study should be replicated using an equal proportion of samples with interdependent self and those with independent self. Indeed, by sampling from individuals with different sense of self, the relative influence of self-construal on behavioral intention may be more clearly detected. Their varying levels of self-construal may allow the investigators to discover interesting findings regarding the different responses by people with different cultural values.

In terms of the stimuli, the respondents were exposed to only one test advertisement. It is unknown whether different findings may be found should the respondents are exposed to all four test advertisements. All four stimuli were not actual energy conservation advertisements promoted by the government office through actual mass media. The impact of advertisement may be mediated by respondents’ perceived quality of creative execution and production. Collaborating with the government office in the production and promotion of energy conservation will prevent their potential mediating effects. In addition, these stimuli were in a form of print media, which currently have reducing viewership among young generation. Other types of communication channel such as digital media that are heavily consumed by the target population should be also examined in future research.

Regression statistics show that among all predictors, perceived behavioral control exerted the highest influence on respondents’ behavioral intention. Accordingly, another potential way to effectively persuade audiences’ intention to conserve energy is to enhance their perceived behavioral control by encouraging them that they have an ability to engage in the target behavior.
In the context of non-renewable energy such as petroleum, conserving some groups of natural resources which are sources of this type of energy requires a consistent collaboration from all groups of people in the society. They include non-exhausting natural resources (e.g., water, air) and renewable natural resources (e.g., forest and fishery). An individual act cannot lead to success in energy conservation. Therefore, findings indicate that other-oriented and gain-framed message is the effective strategy for promoting the conservation of non-renewable energy.

REFERENCES


Customer Relationship Management (CRM) is both a strategy and a tool used by organizations to build and strengthen sustainable relationships with customers, having a database as a key instrument in managing relationships and designing the communication approach that best suits each customer. It is a relationship-building tactic used for obtaining and retaining good customers, the process of which maximizes profitability from each customer which includes retaining the current customers, obtaining new customers, and growing together with the customers with good relationship. In a Harvard Business Review, “Selecting Management Tools Wisely”, an article by Rigby and Bilodeau (2007) reports the results of a survey of 8,504 executives from the world’s leading organizations concerning the most effective and satisfactory management tools, a finding of which states that Customer Relationship Management (CRM) is one of the top three business management tools favored by worldwide business organizations.

Despite being a relatively new concept to Thailand, CRM has been employed as a major strategy by a number of businesses and organizations in the country for a decade, especially in times of economic crisis where creating customer satisfaction alone is no longer sufficient to catch up with the rapid changes in customers’ demand and behavior. Considered a vital survival resource, the concept of customer relationship management has been adopted by more and more organizations as a marketing tool for retaining the existing customers, resulting in the domestic emergence of many articles, books and textbooks on different aspects of CRM for the past several years. However such publications are mostly the translations or references presenting case studies from the businesses or organizations in foreign countries. Therefore, we are still in need of the body of knowledge of CRM in Thailand contexts, the sources of which would add more significant information to what is written in the available textbooks. Such knowledge is obtainable from the research studies, particularly those conducted by graduate students on the situations relevant to Customer Relationship Management that occur in real-life operations by the organizations in Thailand.

The Faculty of Information and Communication Technology (ICT), Silpakorn University, being the first institution in Thailand to offer the Customer Relationship Management program for undergraduate students majoring in Communication Arts since it launched the B.A. program in Communication Arts in 2007, was aware of its role in initiating the compilation, codification and combination of knowledge of Customer Relationship Management, hence the motive for this particular research titled “Status of Knowledge of Customer Relationship Management in Thai Graduate Research”.
Objective

This research project aims to create and fulfill a knowledge database on the Customer Relationship Management in Thailand contexts. The research was carried out through the compilation of knowledge obtained from graduate research studies within the 4 main scopes, namely the topics studied, the concepts and theories applied, the research methodologies used, and the findings in the results of the graduate research studies on Customer Relationship Management.

Methodology

This is a documentary research conducted through the employment of both quantitative and qualitative content analysis. The exploration was specifically focused on the theses, minor theses, and independent study reports carried out in Thailand on the subjects related to CRM, such as Communication Arts, Journalism, Marketing, Business Administration, etc., which were completed in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree (Master’s or doctorate) in a Thai program, accessible only through ThaiLIS Digital Collection or the library database of an academic institution.

Data recording forms were used as a data collecting tool to assist the researcher with the recording and analysis of the data grouped by selected topics and research objectives, consisting of the studied topics, the applied concepts and theories, the employed research methodologies, and the findings of the research studies. The data were then classified by topics and sorted according to frequency distributions the content of which was analyzed and synthesized.

Results

The results reveal that from 2002 to 2010, a total of 61 research studies were carried out by the researchers from 15 public and private educational institutions altogether, one of which is a piece of doctoral research. 19 research studies were conducted in 2007, the highest number in the course of 9 years. Mahasarakham University has got the highest number of research studies on Customer Relationship Management, totaling 17 titles from five majors.

The most popular topic of study was “a study of customers’ views and opinions towards the business’ or organization’s CRM”, followed by “a study of the employees’ plan and readiness for and opinions about the usage of CRM in the organization or business”, “a study of the effectiveness of using CRM in the organization or business”, and “a study of the CRM strategies used in the organization or business” respectively.

Most of the existing research studies on CRM only referred to the concepts and theories of Customer Relationship Management in general, stating the meaning, concepts, objectives, elements and other attributes of CRM without expounding on any specific concept or theory being used in a particular situation. However, the concept most frequently used as a reference and research framework is the DEAR Model invented by Thai scholars, Pipop Udorn and Witaya Danthamrongkul (2004). The DEAR Model is composed of 4 significant elements, namely creating a Database, using proper Electronic technology, putting a relationship-building program into Action, and customer Retention, which completely covers the key principles of CRM. In addition, some other concepts invented by foreign CRM
scholars which are in line with the DEAR Model were found in the studied pieces of research. Those include the 4 Steps of CRM Process by Parvatiyar and Sheth (2001), the 4 Models of CRM by Rapp and Collins (1996), and the 8 Model Concepts by Gartner Group (Buttle, 2009). These concepts were mainly taken into account while discussing the issues on the study of the effectiveness of using CRM in the organization or business, and the study of the CRM strategies used in the organization or business.

Concerning the other concepts and theories used in the study of Customer Relationship Management, the customer satisfaction concepts were used the most, followed by the consumer behavior concepts and theories, which is in line with the research’s finding about the studied topics stating that the most popular topic of study was the study of the customers’ views on the business’ or organization’s CRM.

The formats and tools used are the evidence that most research studies on Customer Relationship Management were quantitative research using a questionnaire as the primary data collecting tool. Therefore, it could be stated that the majority of CRM research were conducted using Survey Research Methodology where the main sources of information are service businesses, such as customer services centers, call service centers, hotels, hospitals, mobile phone networks, and so on.

The findings from the results of the study on the four topics consist of customer satisfaction, corporate communication, communication between a company and its customers, and integrated marketing communication.

A different customer relationship management policy may impact the customer satisfaction of an organization differently from another regardless of being in the same area of business. Several research studies suggested that corporate internal communication should be employed in order to achieve successful customer relationship management. Two-way communication is the most efficient approach in communication between a company and its customers, especially, as stated in several research studies that staff members are the most influential element in building relationship with customers. The proper selection of integrated marketing communication tools is significant in CRM strategic planning. The more explicable and understandable the message used in communication to enhance customer satisfaction is, the more loyalty the organization receives from the customers.

Discussion

As shown in the results, in the course of nine consecutive years, from 2002 to 2010, there have been 61 pieces of research on Customer Relationship Management conducted by researchers from 15 academic institutions in Thailand, both public and private. Such substantial number of studies proving that CRM has constantly been a popular topic of study is reflecting the potential of CRM being used as a key instrument or strategy for operations by more and more Thai businesses and organizations. The research results can be discussed within the 3 main scopes, namely the topics studied, the concepts and theories applied, and the research methodologies used in the CRM research studies.

The development of research studies around the aforementioned 4 popular topics of on Customer Relationship Management could be viewed in a chronological comparison as follows:
Regarding the studies of the employees’ plan and readiness for and opinions about the usage of CRM in the organization or business, it is found that most studies were conducted in 2002 – 2006, such as “The Significance of Establishing a Customer Relationship Call Center System as Deemed by the Movie Theater Business Operators in Bangkok Metropolitan” by Suriya Suthiudom (2002), “Customer Relationship Management: Case Study for Bank of Ayudhya Public Company Limited by Ketsara Samuttanupap (2004), “Customer Relationship Management: A Case Study of Thai Life Insurance Company Limited, Marketing Department Region 5” by Chompunuch Boornungmee (2006). These topics of study were influenced by the start of using CRM by Thai organization as a strategy or tool in business operations, thus the conduction of research on the employees’ and stakeholders’ readiness for and opinions about the usage of CRM in the organization or business.

Regarding the studies of the effectiveness of using CRM in the organization or business, and the studies of the CRM strategies used in the organization or business, it is found that most studies were conducted in 2005 – 2009, the time when a number of organizations had been using CRM for a period of time, hence the initiation of research conduction on the effectiveness and efficiency of using CRM in organizations. The topics of study were, such as “The Effects of Integrated Marketing Communication and CRM on the Potential of Competition in the Car Industry in Thailand” by Rungnapa Deemak (2006), “Customer Relationship Management: A Case Study of TOT Public Company Limited” by Cherdpong Dansupa (2007). Moreover, after some organizations had succeeded in using CRM to some extent, some researchers were interested to carry out studies on the CRM strategies of those organizations. The relevant topics of study were, such as “Customer Relationship Management and Customer Loyalty in Service Business” by Wongsiya Prasertsilp (2006), which used the case studies of Krugthai Card Public Company Limited and Advanced Info Service Public Company Limited, the very first organizations in Thailand to use CRM with great success.

The customers’ Views towards the Organization’s CRM was considered the most popular topic of study, covering a period of nine years (2002 – 2010). Such phenomenon is in line with a model developed by Adrian Payne, a CRM scholar known as the Payne’s 5-Process Model, considered an essential strategic conceptual framework of CRM, one process of which is the Performance Assessment (Buttle, 2009). This studied topic was also in line with the CRM Procedure invented by Parvatiyar and Sheth (2001) on the aspect of CRM Performance Metrics, the step where Customer Relationship Management is assessed to measure whether or not the results have achieved the set objectives.

The usage of concepts and theories of CRM in the research without referring to a clear concept or theory used in a particular situation, but merely stating the meaning, concepts, objectives, elements and other attributes of CRM reflects the status of the researchers as not the students majoring in CRM, which rendered the inadequacy of using any of the CRM concepts or theories as a principle in the research.

However, the concept most frequently used as a reference and research framework is the DEAR Model invented by Thai scholars, Pipop Udorn and Witaya Danthamrongkul (2004), being composed of 4 important elements: Database, Electronic, Action and Retention, which fully covers the key principles of CRM. Furthermore, the reviewed pieces of research show other concepts created by foreign CRM scholars which are similar to the DEAR Model, such as the 4 Steps of CRM Process by Parvatiyar and Sheth (2001), the 4 Models of CRM by Rapp and Collins (1996), and the 8 Model Concepts by Gartner Group (Buttle, 2009). These concepts were mainly used as references where issues on the study of the effectiveness
of using CRM in the organization or business or the study of the CRM strategies used in the organization or business were being discussed.

It is found that there were other concepts and theories being used in the research studies on Customer Relationship Management. The most frequently used concept was the customer satisfaction, followed by the consumer behavior concept and theory, which is in line with the research’s finding about the studied topics stating that the most popular topic of study was the study of the customers’ views and opinions on the business’ or organization’s CRM. The main variable used in the studies was Customer Satisfaction, which is merely derived from the concepts of Satisfaction and Customer Satisfaction. However, according to the concept of CRM Performance Metrics, one of the 4 Steps of CRM Process by Parvatiyar and Sheth (2001), the most effective CRM assessment to be widely used should be able to measure Relationship Satisfaction which would be the assessment of both the customers’ and the service provider’s mutual satisfaction.

The nature of the majority of the reviewed research studies is that of Quantitative Research as confirmed by the format and tool, with the usage of a questionnaire as the primary data collecting tool in the research. It could, therefore, be stated that the majority of CRM research were conducted using survey research methodology, which are in accordance with the finding stating that the most popular topic of study was “a study of customers’ views and opinions towards the business’ or organization’s CRM”, where the methodology mainly used is that of Quantitative Survey Research, which may require hypothesis testing. Mass data collection, through which the studied population being presented is obtained, plays a significant role in such methodology of research (Szwarc, 2005).

10 research studies have been found using Mixed Methods Research, being ranked the second to that of the quantitative research, 9 of which used a questionnaire together with an in-depth interview. The questionnaires were used to collect data obtained from the customers’ views and opinions whereas the in-depth interviews were used to collect data from the organizations or people in charge of CRM strategic planning. Apparently, none of the studies was found using an in-depth interview to collect data obtained from the customers’ views and opinions or using an in-depth interview to clarify the results obtained through the quantitative survey research according to the marketing research approach in connection with CRM as suggested by Szwarc (2005).

The research finding reveals that the main sources of information are service businesses, such as customer services centers, call service centers, hotels, hospitals, mobile phone networks, and so on, which is in line with the statement by Phillip Kotler, a marketing guru, saying that the most proper organization for the employment of CRM is an organization where the creation of a database and mass storage of personal data are required, such as a bank business, a credit card business, an insurance business, or a telecommunication business. However, the cost of CRM is not worthwhile for the organizations whose products are sold at low prices or could be purchased for lifetime use (Thanyawat Chaitrakulchai, 2007). The said finding is also supported by the statement by Gronroos (2000), saying how important CRM is to service businesses because nowadays the customers are not attracted only by the product or service, but also by every piece that presents the service as a whole as well as the delivery made with friendship, reliability, punctuality. Such concept has proven that the product or service alone is no longer competitive.
Suggestion

For students and those interested in doing research on CRM in order to extend the knowledge of the Customer Relationship Management in Thailand, the researcher has made some essential suggestions as follows:

The variables found most often used in the reviewed research studies appear to be Demographic Variables, namely gender, age, education level, occupation and income, which reflect the human behavioral concept, saying that a difference in demography causes a difference in behavior. Such concept does not provide a complete explanation for a customer’s behavior in relation to Customer Relationship Management. Therefore, other variables such as buying and consuming behavior among others are the key element of CRM.

Furthermore, the topic on the customers’ views and opinions towards the organization’s CRM should be studied hand in hand with the topic on the CRM strategies used in the organization or business. Customer Insight should be set as a goal for the study of customers’ views and opinions towards the organization’s CRM. Also, the study of the CRM strategies used in the organization or business should be set around the key elements and main process of CRM. To serve the said purpose, the methodology should be that of Mixed Methods Research which is an integration of Quantitative Research and Qualitative Research. A combination of research tools consisting of a Questionnaire, an In-depth Interview, and a Focus Group should be used in the research design in order to achieve the research questions and objectives, which will lead to the research findings that better fulfill the Knowledge of Customer Relationship Management in Thailand.

REFERENCES


The influence of Australian local government approaches to communication on community approval, staff turnover and media coverage.

Peter Simmons
School of Communication and Creative Industries
Charles Sturt University,
Panorama Ave. Bathurst
NSW, 2795, Australia
psimmons@csu.edu.au

Purpose

The aim of the study was to explore outcomes associated with different approaches to communication in Australian local government (LGOV), and thus contribute evidence for practitioners and scholars.

Background

Communication is central to effective government, but studies of professional communicators and public relations in government, relative to studies of the private sector, have been scarce. There are special expectations of accountability and responsiveness in LGOVs, mostly due to their proximity to the people. Australia’s 562 local governments employ around 2000 people to specialize in communication, but there are no common standards or guidelines for practice. A national study of Australian local government (LGOV) communicators (n=330) reported that they are multi-skilled across a range of managerial and technical activities, have a strong commitment to making their organisations more accountable and participatory, and make important contributions to effective government (Simmons and Small, 2012). Little is otherwise known about influences on their activities and attitudes, or the consequences of different approaches to communication. This paper reports the next stage of that study.

Method

Exploratory factor analysis was used with 330 survey responses across 33 items to identify pattern characteristics (factor dimensions) of organizations, communication approaches, and contexts, including: organizational support for communication; procedural fairness; media management; advising top management; customer communication; accountable; internal communication and hostile media. Each factor was then treated as an independent variable. Correlation was used to identify relationships among the independent variables and three dependent variables, community approval, staff turnover and media coverage. Regression was used to identify predictors of the dependent variables.

Findings

A six factor model emerged accounting for 61.42% variance. Organizational commitment to planned communication and procedural fairness consistently loaded as a single factor (EqualVoice), and correlated significantly (p<0.01) with all the dependent variables, community approval (.416), staff turnover (-.427) and media coverage (.254). Media management and advice to top management (ManagePromote) also loaded as a single factor, but did not correlate significantly (p<0.05) with any of the dependent variables. Media antipathy towards the organization (MediaAlert) significantly correlated with all the
dependent variables, community approval (-.268), staff turnover (.111) and media coverage (-.563). Multiple linear regressions produced significant predictions for community approval ($R^2 = .244$), staff turnover ($R^2 = .187$) and media coverage ($R^2 = .366$). EqualVoice added statistically significantly to all predictions, and was the only significant predictor for staff turnover. MediaAlert contributed most to predicting media coverage but did not add statistically significantly to other predictions.

**Implications**

For local governments and their communicators the findings indicate that important organizational goals such as high community approval, favourable media coverage, and low staff turnover are more likely to be realised where all people are represented in decision-making, communication is planned and evaluated, and decisions are based on up to date information. LGOV organisations are better served where communication focuses on inclusion, participation, listening and transparency than message management and promotion.

Keywords: Local government, public relations, procedural fairness, justice, democracy, organisational justice
Introduction

Australians experience local government services and infrastructure in person each day, and they can access local government staff and elected officials face to face. Over the past century LGOV responsibilities have grown beyond roads, public buildings and infrastructure to include strategic development planning, environmental management, regional development and approximately 150 human and other services (ALGA, 2012). The close relationship between LGOV and communities enables LGOV to respond quickly to local issues, to build resilience in communities, and makes local councils best placed to make decisions on behalf of communities (ALGA, 2012). The closeness of this relationship also demands that councils respond quickly, listen to communities, and to be seen to provide value for taxes and charges.

Around 90% of Australian local governments have at least one full time communication employee. There are many similarities in the type of communication work performed ‘across traditional and online media, internal communication strategy advice, publications and dissemination, community liaison and issues monitoring’, however the communication practices and attitudes of individual LGOV organisations also differ (Simmons and Small, 2012: 12). So how should LGOV organisations use their communicators? Should LGOV communication focus on getting messages out, on listening, facilitating, relationships, service awareness, helping colleagues to understand the importance of transparency (Fairbanks et al., 2007), or some combination of roles and goals?

The early sections of the paper connect several ideas pertinent to the planning and practice of LGOV communication. First is that democracy demands communication, and that the State and Territory Acts that establish LGOV in Australia require LGOV to communicate – to involve, listen, represent and be accountable to their communities. Second is that these democratic requirements in the Acts closely resemble values intrinsic to procedural fairness (voice, consistency, and accuracy in information used to inform decisions [Leventhal, 1980]). Procedural fairness is known to positively influence important outcomes - such as satisfaction, acceptance and cooperation - independently of decisions and distributions arising from decisions. Third is that democratic and procedural fairness values closely align with conceptualizations of better practice in government public relations (Lee, 2012), and public relations emphasising reflection (Marsh, 2010) and symmetry (Grunig et al., 2002) as the best ways for public relations to contribute to organisational effectiveness (Grunig et al., 1995). It has been argued that public relations can learn from the large body of research conducted on the ways that people perceive fairness (Nel, 2001; Simmons and Walsh, 2012). Together these ideas suggest that public relations and communication, framed or guided by procedural fairness principles, should contribute to democracy advanced in the local government acts, and other positive outcomes for the organisation such as acceptance and cooperation.

The aim of this paper is to explore outcomes associated with different approaches to communication in Australian LGOV, and thus gather evidence for planning practice and developing theory. Data was gathered from 330 Australian LGOV communication practitioners. Factor analysis is used to identify the underlying variations in communication-related features of LGOV organisations (the independent variables). Correlation is used to identify associations among six independent variables and three important organisational outcomes, staff turnover, community approval, and media coverage (the dependent variables). Regression is used to identify the significant predictors of the dependent variables.
Democracy presents communication challenges

Democratic ideals provide constant communication challenges for individual councilors and LGOV organisations alike. Each LGOV serves a range of competing and often vocal interests in communities that are much larger and more complex than the ancient Greek communities where democracy developed and ‘communication was relatively easy’ (Held, 2006: 12). The 560 local governments across Australia (ALGA, 2013) are established by State and Territory laws and they differ in terms of structure, services (ALGA, 2012) and approach to managing communication (Simmons and Small, 2012). Although the State and Territory local government Acts do not specify the need for communication departments or specialists, the requirement to communicate well is embedded in the principles, preambles and charters intended to guide the execution of government. Each act refers to one or more principles such as encouraging participation in civic life, representing and responding to the needs and aspirations of individuals and different groups, social inclusion and meaningful community engagement. Most also call for processes to be effective, efficient, transparent, and accountable to the community’ (LGOV Act Tasmania, 1993, Section 20). In the cauldrons of competing community demands, these requirements for transparency, participation and responsiveness demand mechanisms and skills for listening to communities and interpreting viewpoints and needs. Councils need to manage processes that facilitate voice and promote service use, but ultimately lead to sound decisions that are acceptably balanced in the community’s interest. Often this requires communicating on behalf of the greater good in the longer term, explaining links between various costs and inconveniences, and benefits to the community in the long term.

Procedural fairness, government and communication

The values embedded in the LGOV Acts (participation, transparency, inclusion and accountability) align well with principles that Leventhal (1980) proffered as ‘rules’ for fairness in procedures used to make decisions and allocations, they include: representativeness or voice for those affected by decisions, the need for consistency in implementation, impartiality, accuracy in information used to inform decisions, the ability to appeal a decision, and ethical standards such as the absence of corruption (adapted from Colquitt et al., 2005; Jordan, Gillentine and Hunt, 2004; Leventhal et al., 1980; and Leventhal, 1980). The well tested ‘fair process effect’ says that people accept decisions more readily and react more positively when they perceive that they have experienced fair treatment, and more negatively when they perceive they have experienced unfair treatment (van den Bos et al., 2005).

Fairness has value for its own sake (Tankebe, 2009), but because it increases acceptance of decisions and improves cooperation it reduces resources required to implement decisions and improves organisational efficiency. Procedural fairness is an especially important concept for LGOV communicators and decision-makers to understand because organisations generally have control over their decision-making processes (Dai et al., 2011) and the way that those affected by decisions are treated (Simmons and Walsh, 2012). The values integral to procedural fairness and the LGOV Acts also accord well with contemporary conceptualizations of public relations practice that emphasise the importance of external influences on organisation decision-making (Simmons and Walsh, 2012), such as Marsh’s (2010) precepts of reflective public relations practice, dialogue (Kent and Taylor, 2002) and symmetry in external communication (Grunig et al., 2002).
Although PR practitioners might not use the language of ‘fairness’, they frequently exhibit awareness of its importance, for example when they recommend consultation in organisational processes, advise that management listen to stakeholder concerns or inform staff of organisational decisions before external publics (Simmons and Walsh, 2012, p5).

It is preferable for people to defer to a decision because they perceive a decision to be just, however the use of fairness to obtain cooperation ‘when decisions do not give the parties what they want is always a challenge’ (Tyler, 2011:367). On some matters, such as disputes between environmentalists and mining industries, it may be impossible to achieve common ground (Vainio, 2011).

**Local government, public relations communication and media**

Communication is integral to governing (Simmons and Small, 2012), and good communication is a tool for governing better (Lee, 2012). Lee (2012) used three labels to describe government communication; **mandatory** aims to increase accountability for public funds and promote participation in decision-making, and has a focus on democracy and communicating with the community as citizens. **Optional** relates to the community as customers, promoting awareness of services, regulations and safer lifestyle choices. Finally, he said **dangerous** communication is improper promotion of support for elected officials (Lee, 2012). An Australian study of LGOV communicator activities and attitudes to communication found a strong focus on **mandatory** communication, making organisations more accountable and participatory, and **optional** communication, making communities more aware of facilities and services (Simmons and Small, 2012). That study also suggested that LGOV communicators were more focused on internal communication than de Bussy and Wolf’s (2009) sample of mainstream Australian public relations practitioners.

Previous studies have reported that media relations dominates LGOV communication in Australia (Simmons and Small, 2012) and the US (Liu et al., 2010). It has been suggested that government communicators perform wider ranging duties than private sector communicators, and that this could restrict their ability to practice communication as strategic management (Liu et al., 2010). One study found that, compared with the private sector, Australian government communicators were less likely to evaluate outcomes than outputs (Simmons and Watson, 2006). Another Australian study found that 42% of LGOV communicators post in Twitter or Facebook for their organisations at least weekly but that the traditional media consume much of the work activity of LGOV communicators (Simmons and Small, 2012). Fifty-two per cent of Australian local government communicators monitor traditional media coverage of their organisation daily, 40% respond to media inquiries daily, and 39% write for the media daily (Simmons and Small, 2012). A US survey reported similarly that media relations dominates activity among both public and private sector communicators, and that public sector communicators perceive media coverage to be more negative than private sector communicators (Liu et al., 2010).

The media are important in several ways to local government. Public sector organisations can be a major source of conflict-oriented and other news (Hess and Waller, 2008), and media tend to scrutinise their decisions more closely than private (Liu and Horsley, 2007; Liu et al., 2010). Elected and other officials often perceive that the media keep LG accountable and help LGOV communicate effectively with communities (Hess and Waller, 2008), and that they are highly influential in attitude formation, setting agendas, and voting patterns. Hess
and Waller (2008) said that regional Australian LGOV and the media are mutually dependent, and that LGOV has most influence over media coverage when the communicators have experience in packaging information for the media and positive relationships with journalists. Literature from the USA suggests diversity in attitude and approach to government media relations. Lee (2012) presents media relations as a rather noble democratic obligation to be, and appear to be, accountable. “No comment” is not an acceptable answer from a civil servant whose salary is being paid by taxpayers’ (Lee, 2012:14). In contrast, Sadow (2012) provides a view of government media relations as a high stakes game played in an urban jungle. He says that communication success requires planned and agreed approaches to media opportunities and unforeseen crises, while adapting to each unique context. Although the work of government public affairs and media are entwined, he says the relationship is naturally adversarial due to the different imperatives of the government and the media (which need to sell advertising or increase ratings, and are thus prone to sensationalise and distort) (Sadow, 2012). Some LGOV organisations simultaneously experience both cooperative and combative relationships with the various news media that cover them.

**Guidelines or principles for LGOV communication?**

LGOV communication leaders feel that communication should be broader than media relations, but in Australia there are few guides available - beyond individual LGOV plans - to frame the role and responsibilities of communicators. According to national president of Government Communications Australia;

‘Local government communication goes by many names including community relations, media relations and community engagement. It is no longer enough to just be the voice of the council. A communicator who reports to a director can get good news out about the council, but to really influence decision-making and increase community participation communicators need to bring the voice of the community to the table. To achieve this communicators need to work in close cooperation with the major departments and have a seat at the executive table. Some more advanced council organisations have recognized this and are benefiting, but there is a long way to go’ (Deb Ganderton, 2013, personal communication).

In the UK the Local Government Association (LGA UK) argues that expectations of communication in LGOV have expanded way beyond media responsibilities.

‘Our councils no longer look to communications to simply react to press coverage but to be agents of change, advising on the delivery of services, spending of resource, development of policy and the shaping of the culture of our organisations’ (LGA UK, 2013: p19).

The LGA UK says that formerly the main role of LGOV communication leaders was to maintain relations with the local newspaper, write speeches and manage internal events. Then between 1995 and 2009 the communication role became much more proactive as ‘Strategic planner of council reputation’ (p.19), driving media coverage, and influencing change, culture, strategy and policy (LGA UK, 2013). Reputation management has been advanced as a model for local government communication management in Australia (Ryan, 2007) but despite increasing professional networking activity among Australian LGOV communicators
(Megan Graham, 2013, personal communication) there is limited empirical evidence to aid comparison of the consequences of different approaches to managing LG communication.

**Research questions**

The main aims for this study were to identify differences in local government approaches to communication (activity emphasis, intentions, organisational support for communication, procedural fairness) and then explore relationships between these differences and three important organisation outcomes, approval of communities, staff turnover, and media coverage. The research questions were:

1. What factors differentiate LG approaches to communication?
2. How do different approaches to local government communication correlate with and predict approval of communities, staff turnover, and media coverage?

**Method**

**Procedure**

A self-report online questionnaire was used to collect data between June 1 and June 26, 2012. A link to the survey was repeatedly distributed to email lists held by Government Communications Australia and by senior communicators in state local government coordinating bodies (in NSW, Queensland, South Australia, Tasmania, Victoria, and Western Australia). The link was posted in local government public relations network newsletters, and emailed to each LGOV three times marked “Attention: Communication and media staff”. Using email this way means that we do not know how many emails were received by our target, or blocked by spam or other filters.

Exploratory factor analysis was used to identify the latent dimensions among 35 independent variable items. Correlation and regression were then used to explore and compare the interrelationships between the independent and the dependent variables. SPSS 20 was used to analyse the data.

**Sample**

There were 406 responses, after incomplete surveys were removed the reported sample is 330. Just 10.3% of LGOV employers had no full-time professional communicator. Assuming the sample is representative, and using mid point scale estimates (and 15 as the value for ‘11 or more’), the findings indicate there are just under 2000 full time LGOV communication employees in Australia. The 330 completed responses represent 17% of all full time LGOV communicators. Females comprised 78.5%, almost identical to de Bussy and Wolf’s (2009) sample of all Australian public relations practitioners. There was a spread of rural, urban, larger and smaller councils, a spread of age groups, and a mix of experienced and inexperienced practitioners (for a more detailed breakdown of the sample see Simmons and Small, 2012).

**Measurement instrument**

Respondents were not asked at any time to associate the dependent and independent variables reported and connected through statistical analysis below. Unless otherwise stated, respondents answered a five point Likert scale (1=strongly disagree agree to 5 = strongly agree).
Dependent variables

**Staff turnover**
High staff turnover is often used as a negative indicator of the health of organisation climate and human resource practices, including local government (Gould-Williams and Mohamed, 2010). This study used a single item measure of respondent perception of staff turnover (My organisation .. has a high turnover of staff generally).

**Approval of the community**
A single item measure of the perception of community approval was used. (My organisation .. has the approval of most of the communities we serve.)

**Media coverage**
Interviews were conducted with LGOV communicators during the development of the survey instrument. Most interviewees said that traditional media occupied much of their focus and work time. However there were differences in the extent to which they perceived they could influence the media coverage. An urban LG communicator described a very adversarial media with a constant stream of media requests and a need to be vigilant at all times. One regional communicator suggested the organisation had a much higher level of influence over the local media. A seven item scale was developed to measure attitudes to media coverage. (My organisation gets its views heard in news media coverage; News coverage of my organisation is accurate; I am generally satisfied with the way our local media organisations deal with complaints; The news media coverage of my organisation is positive; News coverage of my organisation gives a balance of views; The coverage of my organisation is fair).

Independent variables
Independent variables were developed to measure different characteristics of communication activity, communication intent, support for communication, and context for communication.

**Media attitude**
Two items were used to assess the media environment. The wording of the items was influenced by Sadow’s (2012) picture of the media as very adversarial to government. (My organisation has to be very careful with the media because they would love to catch us out. My organisation responds to more than it influences news media coverage).

**Communication commitment**
Interviews were conducted with LGOV communicators during the development of the survey. They revealed very different levels of management commitment to communication in different organisations. Some interviewees said that their organisational leaders viewed communication as integral to governing, while others saw it as a ‘necessary evil’ at best. A three item scale was created to measure commitment to planned organisational communication (My organisation … values good communication; … evaluates its communication well; … is committed to communication planning).

**Procedural fairness**
A six item scale was used to measure respondent perceptions of the procedural fairness of their employer organisations. The scale was adapted from Vainio’s (2011) study, which in turn was based on Leventhal et al., (1980). Items were: My organisation … upholds high ethical and moral standards in its processes; … bases decisions on all the up to date
knowledge; … encourages everyone to participate in decision-making; … ensures all interests are represented in decision-making; … treats all parties equally in decision-making; … ensures that people who are dissatisfied with decisions can appeal them.

**Communication work activity**
Simmons and Small (2012) reported that Australian LGOV communicators perform routines of numerous different activities, that a majority give strategic communication advice to the top management team at least daily or weekly, and that some are doing more with social media than others.

Thirteen items were included to represent different types of communication activities and thus reveal different emphases across internal communication, traditional media response and management, social media and traditional messaging vehicles. The activity questions asked how often they ‘.. engage in the following communication activities .. Mail outs; Create newsletters; Manage the organisation intranet; Internal communication; Advise staff on communication-related matters; Liaise with stakeholders in relation to media coverage; Write for the media (eg news releases, alerts, fact sheets); Hold news conferences; Prepare staff for media interviews; Respond to media inquiries; Contribute to blog(s) on behalf of your organisation; Post in online media site Twitter for your organisation; Post in online media site Facebook for your organisation). Respondents answered and were scored using a five point Likert style scale (1= never; 2 = less than monthly; 3 = monthly; 4 = weekly; 5 = daily).

**Strategic communication advice to top management**
A single item was used to measure frequency of the provision of strategic communication advice to top management (In the past year, how often would you have provided advice on communication strategy directly to these levels of management? … The top management team). Respondents answered and were scored using a five point Likert style scale (1= never; 2 = less than monthly; 3 = monthly; 4 = weekly; 5 = daily).

**Purposes of communication**
Ten statements were extrapolated from Lee’s (2012) *Mandatory and Optional* frames for describing the purpose of public sector communication. (The intention of our communication is to ... be accountable to the community through the media; … report to the community on the spending of ratepayer funds; gauge community opinion through listening; Increase community participation in organisation decision-making; ... increase community awareness of organisation facilities and services available for their use; … increase voluntary community compliance with regulations; … increase community feedback about the organisation [including complaints about services or policy]; … raise community awareness of lifestyle choices [including health and safety]).

**Results**
**RQ1. What factors differentiate LG approaches to communication?**
Exploratory factor analysis was used to identify the underlying factor structure of responses. Factorability of the items was considered and found to be generally acceptable, but nine (mostly activity) items were removed for low correlations or for not loading on to factor solutions. Thirty-one of the initial 35 items correlated at least .3 with at least one other item. ‘Internal communication’ (with just two correlations above .22) was retained because it had a communality of .498, an assumed relationship with one of the dependent variables (staff’
turnover), and because it has been suggested that Australian LGOV communicators may place a stronger emphasis on internal communication than mainstream communicators (Simmons and Small, 2012).

A six factor solution for 26 items was finally preferred with 61.42% of variance explained. At .35 there were three items cross loading on factors, at .45 all items loaded onto factors with no cross loading. There was intuitive and theoretical support for the 6 factor solution, and a scree plot graph leveled off after 6 factors. The extracted communality for all items was above .41. The Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin measure of sampling adequacy was 0.872 with a significant Bartlett’s sphericity. All eigenvalues for the six factors were above 1.0 (see table 1).

The factor loadings included some surprises. Procedural fairness and communication commitment loaded together as a single factor (labeled ‘EqualVoice’). Similarly, the traditional media and promotion-related activity items, and frequency of advice to top management, loaded together as a single factor (labeled ‘ManagePromote’). The items extrapolated from Lee’s (2012) Mandatory and Optional purposes of public sector public relations separated, but not exactly as expected with the accountability-related items emerging as a single factor. They have been labeled ‘CitizenCustomer’ and ‘Accountable’. There were two single-item factors that emerged, ‘Internal communication’ and ‘MediaAlert’.

The multiple item factor dimensions and the dependent variable ‘Media coverage’ scale were tested for internal consistency using Cronbach’s alpha. Table 2 shows the internal consistency ranges and descriptive statistics for the independent and dependent variables. Internal consistency for the scales ranges from adequate to high. Removal of any items would not have a substantial effect on alpha scores. Composite scores were created for each of the factors.

Table 1:
Factor loadings and communalities based on a principal components analysis with varimax rotation for 26 items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EqualVoice</th>
<th>ManagePromote</th>
<th>CitizenCustomer</th>
<th>Accountable</th>
<th>Internal</th>
<th>MediaAlert</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My organisation ensures all interests are represented in decision-making.</td>
<td>.836</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation treats all parties equally in decision-making.</td>
<td>.821</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation is committed to communication planning.</td>
<td>.773</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation bases decisions on all the up to date knowledge.</td>
<td>.759</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation evaluates its communication well.</td>
<td>.709</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation upholds high ethical and moral standards in its processes.</td>
<td>.661</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation values good communication</td>
<td>.645</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation encourages everyone to participate in decision-making.</td>
<td>.618</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My organisation ensures that people who are dissatisfied with decisions can appeal them.</td>
<td>.548</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respond to media inquiries</td>
<td>.879</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Write for the media (eg news releases, alerts, fact sheets)</td>
<td>.853</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N = 330
Liaise with stakeholders in relation to media coverage .824 4.087
Prepare staff for media interviews .789
Advise staff on communication-related matters .687
Frequently give strategic communication advice to . The top management team .673
Work with council staff to promote positive activities .608
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … increase community participation in organisation decision-making. .714
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … increase community awareness of organisation facilities and services available for their use. .713
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … raise community awareness of lifestyle choices (including health and safety). .703
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … increase community feedback about organisation (including complaints about services / policy). .652
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … increase voluntary community compliance with regulations. .615
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … gauge community opinion through listening. .605
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … be accountable to the community through the media. .728
The intention of our organisation’s communication is to … report to the community on the spending of ratepayer funds. .658 1.279
Internal communication .735 1.129
My organisation has to be very careful with the media because they would love to catch us out. .945 1.003

Note. Factor loadings <.45 are suppressed

Table 2:
Descriptive statistics and internal consistency for variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. items</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Cronbach’s alpha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. EqualVoice</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>30.35</td>
<td>6.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. ManagePromote</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>25.49</td>
<td>6.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. CitizenCustomer</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24.51</td>
<td>3.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Accountable</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.22</td>
<td>1.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Internal</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. MediaAlert</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. CommunityApproval</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.28</td>
<td>.875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. MediaCoverage</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>4.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. StaffTurnover</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.93</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

RQ2. How do different approaches to local government communication correlate with and predict approval of communities, staff turnover, and media coverage?

The main purpose of the study was to explore relationships between communication-related variables and organisation outcome variables. Bivariate relationships were examined for the independent and dependent variables using Pearson’s correlation. Correlation does not demonstrate causation, but it is useful for identifying relationships, developing theory before further research, and as a precursor to methods that do test for causation. Table 3. shows one large and numerous small and medium significant relationships (Cohen, 1988).
Starting with correlations between dependent and independent predictor variables of main interest, Community Approval significantly correlated with EqualVoice (r = .416, n = 327, p<0.01), CitizenCustomer (r = .239, n = 325, p<0.01) and MediaAlert (r = -.268, n = 328, p<0.01). Media Coverage significantly correlated with EqualVoice (r = .254, n = 329, p<0.01), CitizenCustomer (r = .149, n = 327, p<0.01), MediaAlert (r = -.563, n = 330, p<0.01) and Accountable (r = .112, n = 330, p<0.05). Staff Turnover significantly and negatively correlated with EqualVoice (r = -.427, n = 329, p<0.01) and CitizenCustomer (r = -.142, n = 327, p<0.05). MediaAlert (r = .111, n = 330, p<0.05) correlated positively with Staff turnover. The largest correlation was negative (-.563, p<0.01) between MediaAlert (‘My organisation has to be very careful with the media because they would love to catch us out’) and Media Coverage. Otherwise EqualVoice had the strongest relationships with Community approval, Media Coverage and Staff Turnover. EqualVoice, MediaAlert and CitizenCustomer each had significant correlations with all the dependent variables. ManagePromote and Internal communication had no significant correlations with any of the dependent variables.

Table 3:
Correlations among communication approaches and organisation outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>Community approval</th>
<th>Media Coverage</th>
<th>Staff Turnover</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. EqualVoice</td>
<td></td>
<td>.091</td>
<td>.334*</td>
<td>.194**</td>
<td>.074</td>
<td>-.155**</td>
<td>.416**</td>
<td>.254**</td>
<td>-.427**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. ManagePromote</td>
<td>.148**</td>
<td></td>
<td>.251**</td>
<td>.129*</td>
<td>.076</td>
<td>-.065</td>
<td>.084</td>
<td>.046</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. CitizenCustomer</td>
<td>.461**</td>
<td>.089</td>
<td></td>
<td>-.062</td>
<td>.239**</td>
<td>.149**</td>
<td>.142**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Accountable</td>
<td>.036</td>
<td>.012</td>
<td>.101</td>
<td></td>
<td>.112**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Internal communication</td>
<td>-.021</td>
<td>.070</td>
<td></td>
<td>.035</td>
<td></td>
<td>.377**</td>
<td>.180**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. MediaAlert</td>
<td>.268**</td>
<td>-.563**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Community approval</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-.111**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. MediaCoverage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.377**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. StaffTurnover</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-.144**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p < 0.05 (2 tailed) **p<0.01 (2 tailed)

The dependent variables were all interrelated insofar as they each correlated significantly with the others. Community Approval correlated positively with Media Coverage (r = .377, n = 328, p<0.01) and negatively with Staff Turnover (r = -.180, n = 328, p<0.01). Media Coverage correlated negatively with Staff Turnover (r = -.144, n = 330, p<0.01). Among the independent variables the largest correlations were between CitizenCustomer and Accountable (r = .461, n = 327, p<0.01), CitizenCustomer and EqualVoice (r = .334, n = 326, p<0.01), and Accountable and ManagePromote (r = .245, n = 330, p<0.01). ManagePromote also correlated significantly with CitizenCustomer (r = .148, n = 327, p<0.01) and Internal communication (r = .129, n = 330, p<0.05).

Multiple linear regressions were run to identify predictors of each of the dependent variables, Community Approval, Media Coverage and Staff Turnover, see Table 4.

The factor variables statistically significantly predicted Community Approval, F(6,317) = 16.912, p < .001, R² = .242. EqualVoice, ManagePromote, CitizenCustomer and MediaAlert
all contributed statistically significantly to the prediction, \( p < .05 \). EqualVoice and CitizenCustomer contributed positively, ManagePromote and MediaAlert contributed negatively. The factor variables statistically significantly predicted Media Coverage, \( F(6, 319) = 31.001, p \leq .0001, R^2 = .368 \). EqualVoice and ManagePromote contributed positively, and MediaAlert negatively to the prediction, \( p < or = .05 \). Only EqualVoice helped statistically significantly predict Staff Turnover, \( F(6,319) = 12.233, p \leq .001, R^2 = .187 \). The relationship was negative.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple linear regressions for Community Approval, Media Coverage and Staff Turnover</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Approval</th>
<th>Media Coverage</th>
<th>Staff Turnover</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( R^2 = .242 )</td>
<td>( R^2 = .368 )</td>
<td>( R^2 = .187 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. ( \beta )</td>
<td>Std. ( \beta )</td>
<td>Std. ( \beta )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(.354**) .008</td>
<td>(.147**) .039</td>
<td>(-.416**) .010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-.106*) .007</td>
<td>(.105*) .034</td>
<td>(-.010) .008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(.120*) .016</td>
<td>(.035) .083</td>
<td>(.004) .021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(.004) .035</td>
<td>(.051) .181</td>
<td>(.004) .045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(.028) .040</td>
<td>(-.079) .209</td>
<td>(-.055) .052</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-.204**) .041</td>
<td>(-.548**) .211</td>
<td>(.047) .053</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*\( p < 0.05 \) **\( p < 0.01 \)

**Limitations**

We need to be careful generalising the findings to the Australian LGOV population as the population is not known, but the spread of respondents across states, urban and regional locations, and organisation sizes, and the similarity of the gender balance with De Bussy and Wolf’s (2009) sample, indicate a good cross-section of LGOV communication. Perhaps the main limitation of the study is that the measures of the dependent and independent variables were obtained from the same source within the same exposure to the instrument (Podsakoff et al., 2003).

The item formats within the factors with the largest number of items are generally similar, and thus suggestive of a form of common method bias (Podsakoff et al., 2003) but there is mixed evidence for this. On one hand, two apparently similar items (‘My organisation encourages everyone to participate in decision-making’ and ‘The intention of our organisation’s communication is to .. Increase community participation in organisation decision-making’) loaded onto different factors (Cronbach’s alpha .417) alongside scale items statements with similar format, but with different content concerning organisation actuality (eg ‘my organisation ensures’) and communication intention. Also, two scales (procedural fairness and commitment to communication) with the same statement format (‘My organisation ..’) loaded unexpectedly together. Were respondents responding to format or content? If item format was an influence it was limited. Some scale items beginning with ‘The intention of our organisation’s communication is to ..’ loaded unexpectedly as the different ‘Acccountable’ and ‘CitizenCustomer’ factors.

**Discussion**

This study helps local government to plan communication because it links organisations and their communication practice with important outcomes. The findings challenge the common LGOV practice of focusing communication on media and promotion activities. They indicate that LGOV organisations using communication to advance community voice and
participation in decision making - principles embedded in the State and Territory LGOV Acts - are more likely to benefit from approval of their communities, favourable media coverage and low staff turnover. Previous studies of local government (Simmons and Small, 2012) and public sector (Liu et al., 2010) communication have reported activity emphasising traditional media and promotion activities. These activities were not associated with approval of communities, favourable media coverage or lower staff turnover. The findings here support calls for organisations – in this case local government organisations - to use justice principles to conceptualise and plan their communication efforts (Simmons and Walsh, 2012; Nel, 2001).

Another important finding is that organisation commitment to good communication (including planning and evaluation) and procedural fairness are closely related, and loaded as a single factor, EqualVoice. EqualVoice explained the largest variance and correlated significantly with each dependent variable outcome - community approval, favourability of media coverage and lower staff turnover. Regression analysis found EqualVoice was the only factor that significantly predicted all of the dependent variable outcomes. The factor that produced the next greatest variance, ManagePromote, indicated communicator emphasis on working with council leaders to focus on traditional media and promotion of council news and views. ManagePromote did not correlate significantly with any of the dependent variable outcomes. Regression showed that it made a small but significant positive contribution to favourability of media coverage, but contributed negatively to community approval.

CitizenCustomer communication, deriving from Lee (2012), emphasising intent to increase participation in decision-making, raise awareness of services, and gather community feedback, was more influential than his Accountable communication emphasizing intent to be accountable for funding and decisions.

The findings suggest that the closer an organisation is to achieving justice outcomes, the more likely it is to achieve community approval, favourable media and low staff turnover. The factors reflecting communication intent generally had weaker associations with Community approval, MediaCoverage and StaffTurnover outcomes than the EqualVoice factor reflecting organisational actualities (‘my organisation ensures …’; ‘my organisation evaluates …’), but were generally stronger than those based on activity such as ManagePromote and Internal communication. Over recent decades numerous public relations scholars and industry leaders have urged communicators to focus on communication outcomes not activity or outputs (Simmons and Watson, 2006; Macnamara, 1999). A justice outcomes-oriented approach to communication planning is supported by the findings here, and deserves further research, especially in the context of LGOV and other public sector communication.

The direction and significance of correlations among the dependent variables are suggestive of a pattern of interrelationship. Organisations with higher community approval might be expected to enjoy more favourable media coverage and lower staff turnover. Conversely, we might expect that organisations with lower approval would receive less favourable coverage and have higher staff turnover. Each of these variables is complex, but the intuitively logical pattern in their interrelationship adds credibility to the findings.

As indicated above, the findings here challenge the wisdom of overly focusing communication resources on the media, but they can also be interpreted as attesting to the importance of traditional media to LGOV and communicators. The correlations indicate that
where organisations most strongly perceive that the media ‘would love to catch us out’ (MediaAlert) they experience lower community approval, less favourable media coverage and higher staff turnover. In regression analysis MediaAlert significantly and negatively predicted Community Approval and Media Coverage. Each LGOV organisation operates in unique circumstances with different personalities and political imperatives. Doubtless some LGOV leaders and communicators must survive as best they can in Sadow’s (2012) media jungle, and these findings concerning the media may be interpreted by some as indicative of a need to focus more on the media. In the short term it can be tempting to be driven by bad publicity and unfavourable review, but in the long term the best public relations may come down to listening, engaging and informing.

Public relations should aid the fair distribution of resources and adversity (Nel, 2001) and it is important to capture different definitions and perspectives of distributions and processes. Future studies of LGOV communicator roles should examine perspectives and consequences for communities outside the organisation, and from different viewpoints within the organisation, especially senior management who are empowered to make strategic changes. The single item measure of community approval is a broad indicator. Future studies should focus on capturing different dimensions concerning ‘approval’, and the perspectives of a range of sub groups including those who may have special needs.

This study has focused on just a few outcomes from an organisational viewpoint, through the eyes of their communicators. It has not considered economic, infrastructure, equity or other factors that might drive approval or perceptions of acceptable LGOV performance. However the findings so strongly indicate that listening, inclusion and procedural fairness are associated with better outcomes - while managing media and promotion are not - that LGOV communicators, managers and scholars should reflect on current approaches and practices. Democracy requires skilled and often difficult communication, the findings suggest LGOV and their communicators should avoid being distracted from higher purposes to listen, include and represent.
REFERENCES


CIPR 2013, About public relations, Chartered Institute for Public Relations, viewed 12 May 2013, <http://www.cipr.co.uk/content/about-us/about-pr>


Grunig, L, Grunig, J, and Dozier, D 2002, Excellent Public Relations and Effective Organisations, Lawrence Erlbaum, New Jersey.


Neill, J 2008, *Writing up a factor analysis*, Australian National University creative commons website, viewed 1 June, 2013 <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.5/au/>


Simmons, P and Walsh, B 2012, ‘Public relations and organizational justice: More fairness or just more cooperation?’ Public Relations Inquiry, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 141-158.


ABSTRACT

Paradigm shift - Repositioning marketing communication as a strategic management function: A Thai case

Dr Raveena Singh
Senior lecturer, Marketing Communication
University of Canberra, Australia
raveena.singh@canberra.edu.au

Purpose
This paper explores the role of marketing communication as a strategic management function. It traces the epistemological development of marketing communication from earlier discourse of just a concept to its current status as a business process and builds by proposing that marketing communication has developed and is regarded as a strategic management function. Based on the systems and complexity theories of management, and a conceptual framework of strategic management, research was undertaken in Thailand to establish whether marketing communication was regarded as a strategic management function.

Methodology
A mixed methodology was adopted for this study. The study was undertaken in two phases. In phase one, quantitative research was used to gather demographic data of the respondents and their opinions on current and future demands on marketing communication in Thailand. In phase two, based on qualitative research, through depth interviews, views and opinions were sought on the practice of marketing communication in Thailand as a strategic management function. These issues were investigated among middle-management marketing communication professionals who had a master’s level qualification in marketing communication or a related field, agency executives, professional body executives, academics teaching in marketing communication and policy makers in Thai higher education.

Findings
Demographic data revealed that 95% of the respondents were in management level positions; work experience ranged from 1-6.5 years, contributing to a rich mix of responses. Respondents worked in agencies, media, information technology, pharmaceuticals, financial sector and retail banking, hospitality, educational institutions, the food and airline services sector. In terms of current demands in marketing communication in Thailand, the data indicated the strongest need for practitioners is to engage in strategic planning and decision making, followed by the practice of marketing communication at a management rather than a technical level. The identified needs for the next decade indicated focus on strategic planning, branding, social media, internet marketing, research and environmental scanning, media planning, corporate social responsibility and change management.

There was a strong view that marketing communication is a strategic management function and is integral to organisational success. Practices identified as contributing to the strategic management function included research, planning, analysis, strategy, problem resolution, stakeholder management, customer relationship management, branding, communication integration, competitor analysis and issue, reputation, crisis and change management.
Implications

Marketing communication is no longer an onlooker in organisational success but has matured to a higher order business function and strategy. This means that organisations must take heed of the contribution of marketing communication and enable it to contribute to higher levels of performance in the organisation. The findings also have implication for educating and skilling graduates with a stronger emphasis on business related content, rather than a technical and practical focus.

Originality

The findings in this research project proffers an advance in the theoretical frame and contributes to the body of knowledge through repositioning marketing communication from a process to a fundamental aspect of organisational success and demonstrates that marketing communication is a strategic management function.
Harley Davidson community toward brand loyalty

Kamolchanok Sreshthaputra
Lecturer, Department of Communication Arts
Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences
Burapha University
Thailand

ABSTRACT

The objectives of this research were: 1) to study the characteristics of the Harley Davidson motorcycle community and 2) to observe the influence that membership of the Harley Davidson community had upon its members towards Harley Davidson brand.

This research was based on two years of ethnographic fieldwork within the Thai Harley Davidson Community. The main aspect of the fieldwork was a method of fully integrating into the Harley Davidson Community from the onset as an outsider, to full acceptance as a member of the community.

The researcher ethnographically researched and documented this path to membership into a brand community and collected in-depth interviews with twenty members of Brother and H.O.G. community to further substantiate the influence of membership and brand loyalty. Ten more samples were purposive selected as samples including president of Harley Davidson famous groups (Immortal, Commander City, Bandidos, Heaven’s Devil), the web master of HD-playground website (the most popular website of Harley Davidson), the manager of Power Station (the authorized Harley Davidson service, parts and accessories dealer for Thailand), and the owner of Harley Davidson shops. Harley Davidson community’s websites and computer media communications were also examined during the research method.

It was found that the Harley Davidson Community in Thailand demonstrated the required characters of community recognition: consciousness of kind, rituals and traditions, and sense of moral responsibility. The significant reason for the formation of the community was the brand and the brand further solidified the characteristics of the community. However, members who were loyal to the brand community did not become more loyal to the brand. Sixteen members of H.O.G. and Brother Community got BMWs as their second motorcycles.

The findings showed clear evidence which was different from previous studies in two distinct manners: first, it revealed that a community organized by consumer enthusiasts through social media strengthens its allegiance to the brand and this formation of a brand focuses community could be considered as a direct communication path for the brand to its potential consumers. Second, data indicated that consumers who were highly integrated in the brand community did not always have a high loyalty to that brand. They are still loyal to the brand of Harley Davidson as long as they are in the Harley Davidson Community. But when they bought BMW, they were also part of another community. As a result, marketers will be better to develop programs targeting at members of Harley Davidson Community through social media in order to encourage increased levels of brand loyalty.

Introduction

Several years ago, traditional marketing communication was very popular. However, it has not been as successful as expected nowadays. The reasons are that the company has to
spend extravagantly on the advertising budget, the variables of external factors keep changing drastically, the consumer behavior is more distinct, and the marketing situation that has an impact throughout the world. Therefore, most marketers must put in an effort to create a new strategy that reaches their target consumer and establishes a long-term relationship with them. One of the most significant strategies having arisen was the Brand Community.

Brand Community is a marketing tool that has a widespread acceptance at present. It is a medium for the marketer to communicate with their consumers. They convey the brand to consumers and let those consumers communicate that brand to other members of their community who admire the same brand. It is believed that the Brand Community can create a strong loyalty between the brand and the consumers and within the consumers themselves (Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001).

Harley Davidson Community was selected because it obviously represented the core community commonalities. It has a unique characteristic and is more distinguished than other communities. The relationship between brand community and brand loyalty was the other topic to examine because such a relationship has been found significantly in previous studies and only positively affect consumer behavior. In consequence, the objectives of this research are: 1) to study the characteristics of the Harley Davidson motorcycle community and 2) to observe the influence that membership of the Harley Davidson community has upon its members towards Harley Davidson brand.

### Literature Review

#### Brand Community

Brand Communities represent an effective strategy to develop and maintain strong relationships with consumers (Fournier and Lee, 2009). Muniz and O’Guinn (1996) first introduced the concept of brand communities that attract new members who want to participate in the norms and satisfaction shared by the other members. Kover (1996) argues that brand communities offer an alternate form of community for individuals who have become members by buying and owning a particular branded product. Muniz and O’Guinn, (2001) defined a brand community as a specialized, non-geographically bound community which is built upon a structured set of social relationships among admirers of a branded good or service. McAlexander, Schouten and Koenig (2002) extend the conceptualization of a brand community from a customer-customer-brand triad (Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001) to a customer centric model involving owner-to-product, owner-to-brand, owner-to-company, and owner-to-other owner relationships. Greater integration in a brand community (IBC) results from the ties created between the individual brand owner and the company, the other brand owners, and the brand itself. It is a set of individuals who voluntarily relate to each other for their interest in some brand or product. In fact, from the marketing perspective, the concept of brand community has been recently introduced in several studies (Ouwersloot and Odekerken-Schroder, 2008; Blythe, 2008; Kalman, 2009; Alagoz, Ekici, and Islek, 2011; Here et al., 2011; Drengner et al., 2012; O’Donnell and Brown, 2012; Wright-Isak, 2012).

Muniz and O’Guinn (2001) who have carried out a lot of studies about the brand communities focus on the three important elements of brand communities;

a) **Consciousness of Kind**

Collective consciousness is about strong connection feelings between community members. Members feel like they know each other, although they have never met. Legitimacy and oppositional brand loyalty concepts are important in collective
consciousness. Legitimacy is about usage of the brand from the right reasons. Oppositional brand loyalty is about the thought that possession of that certain brand makes members special and different. Brand loyalty is so critical for continuity of collective consciousness.

b) Shared Rituals and Traditions
These are generally formed by celebrating the history of the brand and shared brand stories. Stories about brands and celebration of noteworthy days of the brand contribute to create and hear shared values amongst community members. One of the stories about the brand history is the logo or label of the brand. While a current logo or label has a commercial value, older ones have a nostalgic value. Stories exchanged are the elements that are shared and talked about by community members.

c) Moral Responsibility
To ensure the long-term survival of brand communities, it is necessary to retain old members and integrate new ones. To provide this, responsibility consciousness should be developed. A brotherhood sense is created and the idea of “If you use another brand, you betray the community” is developed. In this process, if some errors occur, community members try to overcome them by helping each other. In this respect, brand communities perform limited and specialized moral responsibility.

Virtual Brand Community

Firms have increasingly realized that, via the Internet, they can overcome the time and space constraints that have so far limited their involvement in brand community activities. There is thus reason to believe that web-enhanced brand communities will grow in importance and unleash a new potential for developing market value for users and producers alike. By reducing the efforts needed to find and join a community, by supporting non-synchronized dialogue over time and space among community members and making it possible for discussions groups to form and disband easily, and by freeing the community formation process from geographical restraints, making it possible both to create and join new communities and leave existing ones at will, the Internet is likely to boost the capability and utility of brand communities (Anderson, 2004, p. 39). As pointed out by Wurster and Evans (1996), one of the main virtues of the Internet is that it makes it economically feasible for producers to increase the reach and richness of dialogue at the same time. This improves the possibility of nurturing and also enhancing brand involvement and brand loyalty as a means of strengthening relationship-building efforts. The extent and quality of communication thus has a direct effect on the ability to create customer loyalty and customer relationships.

Differences between company-managed and enthusiast-run brand communities, as shown in Figure 1, create a ‘virtuous cycle’ leading to the evolution of a strong and vibrant community in the case of enthusiast-run communities, but operate to produce a ‘vicious cycle’ of superficial member relationships and short-term participation in many company-managed communities, causing them to fail (Dholakia and Vianello, 2011, p. 9).
Company-Managed Brand Community (Vicious Cycle)

- Focuses on recruiting from target customer segments; Results in homogeneous participant base
- Encourages narrowly defined product-related discussions and activities
- Brand community is not able to create consciousness-of-kind, a sense of obligation, or results and traditions; participants prone to leave
- Superficial customer relationships; Participation mainly for functional reasons
- Expressive freedom of participants is constrained through moderation and censorship

Enthusiast-Run Brand Community (Virtuous Cycle)

- Welcoming to all customers resulting in a diverse participant base
- Encourages broad range of activities such as networking and socializing
- Brand community develops consciousness-of-kind, a sense of obligation, and rituals and traditions; becomes a 'true' community
- Strong customer relationships; Participation for intrinsic, emotional and social motivations
- No restriction on expressive freedom of community participants
Social networking online is the main reason users keep spending time with social media such as Facebook. Therefore, users perceive and respond to marketing venues such as advertising and brand communities, in a different way than they do to traditional media (Chi, 2011, p. 56). A virtual brand community is a structured set of brand-consumer social relations articulated online (Muniz and O’Guinn 2001; Wellman and Gulia 1997). Virtual brand communities are powerful tools of marketing communication, because they help reveal consumer needs and brand loyalty (Cassalo, Flavian, and Guinaliu 2008). Ridings and Gefen (2004) find that social support and friendship are the two major reasons people spend time in online communities. Whereas brand-consumer relations are the focus of a virtual brand community, social connections among community members are the emphasis of online social networking. Despite the difference in focus and emphasis, virtual brand communities and online social networking share the same communication feature: social connectivity among people. Social identity, group norms, and intention are important for user perceptions of and responses to marketing communication in social media (Koh and Kim 2004; Aeng, Huang, and Dou 2009).

Brand Loyalty

There are two ways to think of brand loyalty: brand loyalty as a behavior, and as an attitude. That is marketers define brand loyalty in terms of what brands people buy and how they feel about brands. Day's (1969) two-dimensional definition of consumer loyalty (cited in Selin, Howard, Udd, & Cable, 1988, p. 220) provides an example of the advances at the research's next evolutionary stage. Day's results showed his consumer loyalty index combining behavioral and attitudinal dimensions to have twice the predictive power of the behavioral approach.

Aaker (1991, cited in Sheth et al., 2008, p. 399) defined brand loyalty as a measure of the attachment that a customer has to a brand. It reflects how likely a customer will be to switch to another brand, especially when that brand makes a change, either in price or in product features. In his Brand Loyalty pyramid, Aaker identifies five levels of brand loyalty, ranging from not loyal to very loyal. He describes the customer behavior for each level, and pinpoints challenges faced by marketing professionals in their efforts to lift a consumer to a higher level. The greater the number of consumers in the higher sections of the pyramid, the more effective the pursued branding policy. Aaker’s Brand Loyalty pyramid describes five types of consumer behavior on the brand loyalty scale: (1) switchers, (2) satisfied/habitual buyer, (3) satisfied buyer with switching costs, (4) likes the brand, and (5) committed buyer.
Several factors contribute to brand loyalty. The three major contributors are the perceived brand-performance fit, social and emotional identification with the brand, and habit combined with a long history of using the brand. However, the attraction of alternatives is how attractive a customer finds alternative brands to be. It depends on factors relating to the market environment, and others pertaining to the customer personally.

Therefore, the definition of loyalty includes both behavior and attitude. These two components define four possible situations. When both attitude and behavior are weak, no loyalty exists. When both are strong, strong loyalty exists. When behavior is high but attitude is low, the customer has spurious loyalty. When attitude is high but behavior is low, the customer has latent loyalty (Dick and Basu, 1994, cited in Sheth et al., 2008, p. 407).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BEHAVIOR</th>
<th>STRONG</th>
<th>WEAK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ATTITUDE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STRONG</td>
<td>Loyalty</td>
<td>Latent Loyalty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEAK</td>
<td>Spurious Loyalty</td>
<td>No Loyalty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: Aaker’s Brand Loyalty pyramid
Brand loyal consumers buy known brands and are likely to be brand loyal even when this costs more; they are less likely to check prices or shop around for bargains. Satisfaction is not necessarily enough to generate loyalty. East, Hammond and Gendall (2006, cited in Blythe, 2008, p. 189) found no evidence that satisfaction breeds loyalty, but have found evidence that satisfaction leads to personal recommendations and therefore to recruitment of new customers. If loyalty can be generated, it does increase profitability (Helgesen, 2006 cited in Blythe, 2008, p. 305). Since companies are often not good at acquiring new customers, loyalty becomes important (Ang and Buttle, 2006 cited in Blythe, 2008 p. 305). It also has the effect of reducing the evaluation of brand extensions people tend to assume that the extension will be as good as the original brand (Hem and Iversen, 2003 cited in Blythe, 2008 p. 305).

Methodology

This exploratory research was based on two years of ethnographic fieldwork within the Harley Davidson Thai community. The main aspect of the fieldwork was a method of fully integrating into the Harley Davidson Community from the onset as an outsider to full acceptance as a member of the community.

The researcher ethnographically researched and documents this path to membership into a brand community and collected in-depth interviews with twenty members of Brother and H.O.G. community to further substantiate the influence of membership and brand loyalty. The sampling was thoroughly selected from Harley Davidson community in Thailand. The reason of choosing Brother Community was that it was the largest (30 members) Haley Davidson community in Bangsean where the researcher resides. Furthermore, it has been established for more than 7 years. H.O.G. was also selected as another community because it was the most well-known official Harley Davidson community from the United States that established 17 years ago with 400 members. H.O.G. was very well organized and based in Bangkok. Both communities were comprised of three important elements of brand communities which correspond to the main objective of this study.

Ten more samples were purposive selected including the president of Harley Davidson from famous communities (Immortal, Commander City, Bandidos, Heaven’s Devil), web master of HD-playground website (the most popular website of Harley Davidson), manager of Power Station (the authorized Harley Davidson service, parts and accessories dealer for Thailand), and the owners of Harley Davidson shops. With a Snowball Sampling technique, the researcher interviewed with the president of each group first, and then asked them to further recommend other interviews. With this method, the researcher received all necessary information from members who were different in gender, age, occupation, and the period of being a member.

Harley Davidson community’s websites and computer media communications were also examined during the survey to investigate the communication platform of members in that community and to gather information that is essential for the research. After collecting data, the researcher concluded and analyzed those findings. HD-Playground website was selected because it was the largest Harley Davidson community’s websites in Thailand.
Results

The ages of those interviewed varied between 28 years and 45 years and above with the majority being in the older age group. Over 75% of the respondents were aged between 35 years and 50 years with almost 50% being under 45 years. The occupation of respondents varied from senior government official through successful businessmen and skilled professionals. The duration of involvement in the community was more than 2 years. Each respondent lived in Bangkok, Chon Buri, and many other provinces in Thailand. Members communicated via LINE group and post their activity pictures in Facebook and HD-Playground website.

Brand community commonalities

a) Consciousness of kind – members of Harley Davidson community have a consciousness of kind. Even though there are more than 2,000 members who live in different places over the country they can still be friends. They are connected to the brand and they feel stronger connection toward one another. They chat, help each other, and join the activity together. Legitimacy is not found in Harley Davidson Community. Anyone who is devoted to the brand can be a member of the community. The community is an open social organization and does not deny membership, but like most communities, it does have status hierarchies. There is a rank from the president, vice president, officer, to prospect in the community. The oppositional brand loyalty does not happen in Harley Davidson Community either. Even though they have to own Harley Davidson to become members, it seemed that after that they can ride their BMW (their other motorcycle) to join Harley Davidson Community trip which is even supported by Harley Davidson dealer.

b) Rituals and traditions - Members of Harley Davidson Community meet every month as a tradition. They may take a trip or do some activities together such as playing soccer, joining the riding course, making merit. They also arrange one big event each year for their community. The greeting rituals happen when members meet other Haley Davidson riders. Those greeting include a knowing nod, honking, waving, and asking them about their brand model. They also create a symbol for their community such as patch, badge, sticker, etc. Besides, members always celebrate the history of the brand by searching information from books, magazines, and website. Then, they proudly post that information on the web board. Members also share stories about engine, spare parts, maintenance, modification, and performance of their Harley Davidson. They also talk about the sound of exhaust pipe which is the most fascinating Harley Davidson identity. Furthermore, members enjoy talking about their latest activity they had together or the upcoming event of their community.

c) Sense of moral responsibility - Members of Harley Davidson Community do not integrate other new members. Anyone who is first interested in Harley Davidson, with or without having a motorcycle, can always apply via HD-Playground website. There are many Harley Davidson communities in HD-Playground website. After owning a Harley Davidson, they choose the community that suits them most and ask to join that community. Each community has rules for accepting a member. The communities formally and informally recognize the bounds of what is right and wrong, appropriate and inappropriate. In any case, former members invite only the people they know to
join their community. Retaining old members occur when they join activities together
or help each other on every subject, either related to Harley Davidson or not.

*Harley Davidson community towards brand loyalty*

Most respondent rode only Harley Davidson. Some of them started riding with Harley
Davidson while others started with Japanese motorcycles that were less expensive. All
respondents preferred Harley Davidson rather than other brands and talked about it all the
time. They also recommended Harley Davidson to others and tended to buy it in the future.
However, it was noted that half of the respondent bought or planned to buy other brands for
riding alternating with Harley Davidson. The reasons of choosing other brands were that
Harley Davidson had limitation on size, performance, and technology.

**Discussions**

This research found evidence of brand community as Muniz and O’Guinn (2001)
indicated that a brand community was a specialized, non-geographically bound community,
based on a structured set of social relations among admirers of a brand. Harley Davidson
community also exhibited three traditional markers of community: shared consciousness,
rituals and traditions, and a sense of moral responsibility.

For a consciousness of kind, members of Harley Davidson Community would discuss,
share, support, and help each other on every subject. Computer-mediated environments,
especially Facebook and LINE group help them get closer and feel comfortable to share on
every topic apart from Harley Davidson. These environments create a ‘virtuous cycle’
leading to the evolution of a strong and vibrant community in this enthusiast-run community
as indicated in Figure 1 by Dholakia and Vianello (2011).

Legitimacy and oppositional brand loyalty were not found in Harley Davidson, as
well as BMW, VW (Prayulhong and Anantachat, 2005), Vespa (Tivaporn et. all, 2007), and
Blythe (Suvong and Tokavanij, 2009) communities in Thailand. In contrast, Muniz and
O’Guinn (2001) found that legitimacy was apparent in Ford Bronco and Sabb communities
while oppositional brand loyalty was found in Bronco, Sabb, and Macintosh. Such legitimacy
and oppositional tendencies undoubtedly explain some of the strengths of those communities.

It is also the same for sense of moral responsibility that members of Ford Bronco and
Macintosh must devote themselves to the brand and community. If anyone quits or switches
to other brand, other members will show their disapproval with a protest and a strong
resistance that the switcher betrayed the brand and community (Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001).
Nevertheless, it was not necessary a moral failing for members of Harley Davidson Thailand
community to buy BMW motorcycle as their alternative and ride with Harley Davidson
community. It did not affect their personal relationship. From the moment that they became a
member of Harley Davidson Community, the brotherhood was never ending.

Reasons might be that for Thai culture, they hate to fight, they pay respect to the
elders, love to help each other and always be generous (Polsri, 2002). On the other hand, for
American culture, people seem to have lots of freedom, self-esteem, high confidence, self-
centered, and competed for a better position (Mueller, 1978 as cited in Prayulhong and
Anatachart, 2005). As Flavian and Guinaliu (2005) indicated that a wide variety of
communities have been typified according to different criteria. Culture might be based on
ethnic background that made a distinct set of behaviors and beliefs (Kates, 2002). They are
distinctive groups of people that share common cultural meanings, behaviors, and environmental factors. Its members have a distinct and identifiable set of behavioral norms, customs, scripts and so forth which distinguish them from the rest (Blythe, 2008). The lack of legitimacy and opposition in Harley Davidson Thai community perhaps make them feel free to ride other motorcycle brands while taking a trip with Harley Davidson Community.

The positive aspects of brand community were observed in the Harley Davidson Community. First, brand community represented a form of consumer agency. By virtue of its collective nature, and enhanced by new forms of computer-mediated communication, consumers simply have a greater voice than would be the case in more isolated and atomistic situations (France and Muller, as cited in Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001). Therefore, a marketer should create a communication platform that use simple technologies and design systems and procedures that can transmit complex messages (combining texts with images and sounds), and which are adapted to the usual method by which the community members interact offline. The support to customer enthusiast-run brand communities would help to increase intangible and emotional attributes associated with the product and brand. Second, brand communities represented an important information resource for consumers. Community members can more easily turn to one another in an established collective for information on the brand (Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001). It accumulated information related to product issues. It provided a forum where consumers could meet, chat, raise questions, and exchange ideas and knowledge. It also supports the development of product and brand awareness, through the hosting of web events. Third, to the extent that communal interaction generally provides wider social benefits to its members, brand communities likewise provide these (Muniz and O’Guinn, 2001). The consumer’s relationship with the brand preceded and contributed to his or her relationship with the brand community. Many consumers first discover and value the brand for the functional and symbolic benefits it provides. Brand community helped extend relationships within the social arena. A harmonious relationship with the brand can lead consumers to seek out and interact with like-minded consumers who share their enthusiasm even though they were not in the same community. So, an affirmative relationship between members in the brand community could lead to a positive consequence which brought to the greater harmonious community.

For the impact of Harley Davidson Community towards brand loyalty, members of Harley Davidson community were loyalty to several brands. They bought, satisfied, liked, committed to Harley Davidson but could switched to other brands as an alternative because of the performance risk. Some members had a high relative attitude but low repeat patronage as Dick, Alan, and Basu (1994) called a latent loyalty. That means when they first started riding a motorcycle, even though they liked Harley Davidson, they could not afford it. So, they bought other brands that were less expensive. Jagdish, Benwari, and Michel (2008) also indicated that consumers’ price sensitivity was negatively related to brand loyalty as some members had to sell their Harley Davidson and bought other brand instead because they had financial problem. For the repurchase of Harley Davidson, half of the member in the community bought or plan to buy other motorcycle brands as an alternative to Harley Davidson. The reason was that other motorcycles such as BMW had higher performance and technology. When they took a long trip, it was easier and more comfortable for them to ride BMW than Harley Davidson. Jagdish, Benwari, and Michel (2008) indicated that basically, customers like brands that meet their needs and wants well. If they have a positive usage experience, customers want to seek that reward again. Brands differ not only in the quality of their performance but also on specific performance dimensions. Furthermore, customers have different needs for specific performance features. Consequently, brand loyalty depends not
merely on whether a brand does what it is intended to do, but also on the degree of fit between the customer’s specific performance requirements and the brand’s performance capability. So, the detractors of brand loyalty here came from customer factors: variety seeking, price sensitivity and multi-brand loyalty. This study revealed different aspect from the five levels of Aaker’s (1991) brand loyalty pyramid. In this case, one consumer could have several levels of brand loyalty combined together. He could be a committed buyer and a satisfied buyer while switching cost at the same time. Harley Davidson members were proud of a brand in whose daily lives the brand actually plays an important role. They bought Harley Davidson because it closely tied in with their personal values. Meanwhile, even though they were satisfied with the brand they could buy other brands for an alternative because of the performance risk of Harley Davidson that a competing brand had a higher perceived quality.

**Limitations and Implications**

This is only a basic research of ethnographic that does not afford the same kind of generalizability that probability sampling does. All samplings are only members of one brand, Harley Davidson, and those members only live in Thailand. This study offers little scope for generalization. Two idiosyncratic communities have been researched and although the concepts presumably apply in general to brand communities, the findings require further research on more communities, before general conclusions can be drawn. Therefore, findings should not be taken as a final conclusion but rather as a preliminary finding that provokes further thought. This study does not examine each member in detail about their roles, behaviors, and social interactions in the community that effected their brand consumption. The brand community concept, as defined by Muniz and O’Guinn (2001), and which seemed to have gained wide acceptance in the literature, encompasses a much broader scope. Communities may consist of consumers who mentally admire a brand but are not administratively connected to an organization of any kind. That is, researchers cannot assume that communities consist of members only. Further research should explore the role of brand communities in this broad perspective, for brand marketing and their influence on building brand equity.

This work showed that virtual community as a tool could increase the chances of success in the marketing and distribution of products over the internet. However, it did not explore the consumer involvement level which was proved that a higher level of involvement with the products would make communication easier and loyalty levels higher (Blythe, 2008, p. 304).

For further research, it would also be valuable to examine circumstances that may lead to defection from the community or conflict within it and explore the implications of such issues to community vitality and potential impacts on brand positioning or brand equity.

The success of Harley Davidson lies in their focus, not merely on the product or its positioning, but also on the experience of ownership and consumption. Differentiating on the basis of ownership experience could be achieved through programs strategically designed to enhance customer-centered relationships. The events examined here provided opportunities for consumers to experience anticipated but unrealized product benefits, shared those experiences with others, met with the people behind the brand which were the official Harley Davidson dealer, and learn more about the brand’s heritage and values. Our research demonstrates that such marketing programs can have a measurable impact on the full range of customer-centered relationships. Marketers should cultivate community in ways that enhance
brand community and thereby increase customer loyalty (McAlexander, Schouten, and Koenig, 2002, p. 51). Community-integrated customers serve as brand missionaries, carrying the marketing message into other communities. They are more forgiving than others of product failures or lapses of service quality (Berry 1995). They are motivated to provide feedback to corporate ears. They constitute a strong market for licensed products and brand extensions. Understanding brand communities and thus structuring the socially complex phenomenon of a brand may help marketers effectively influence the development of their brands. So, the small or new startup companies that have yet to find a way to communicate with their consumers are well advised to incorporate brand community markers of existing and powerful associated communities into their current marketing mix.

However, marketers should recognize that relationships are reciprocal: both parties give and receive. The activities discussed in this study were events in which marketers made conscious decisions not to view the events as strictly short-term investments. The marketers provided experiences, entertainment, and education that customers perceived to be in excess of the costs they incurred to participate. Otherwise, they might switch to other brands when confronted with superior performance by competing products.

For the computer-mediated communication, marketers should generate and retain sufficient activity in web communities because it is the single most critical parameter for success. When customers with specialist knowledge discuss product features among themselves, industrial marketers may listen and learn. Web-enhanced community strategy should not aim directly at improving sales but should create a fruitful dialogue which, in the long run, may improve product loyalty drastically. Marketers must recognize what interactive digital advertising and virtual brand communities can do, not only for a brand but for users and potential consumers. As marketing venues in social media, advertising and brand communities provide different communication platforms because a brand community allows for two-way communication among users. Users are more willing to trust, like, and participate in a brand community in social media. The user motivation that drives social networking online exert significant effects on user responses to advertising and brand communities in social media. Practitioners of social media marketing should create content that is specific to each marketing communication platform, as well as relevant to what users of social media want and need. Social media are personalized, user-generated media, in which users exercise great control over use and content creation (Dickey and Lewis 2001). As social media become more personalized, users of social media are more reluctant to accept advertiser-generated, pushed messages. As a result, the degree of user control that advertising and brand community can provide becomes very important in developing brand communication platforms. The nature of the content that advertising and brand communities put forward also should be considered. Brand communication platforms in social media could consider the relevance of content to users, especially if social media marketers hope to connect brand messages with potential consumers.
REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

The influence of Wattana-dharm Thai [Thai culture] on Thai PR practice: A validation of a qualitative analysis using statistical factor analysis

Suttanipa Srisai
Department of Public Relations
School of Communication Arts
University of the Thai Chamber of Commerce,
126/1 Vibhavadee-rangsit Road, Dindaeng,
Bangkok, Thailand 10400
suttanipa@googlemail.com

Earlier in 2011, I finished my PhD research with the aim of studying how and what Wattana-dharm Thai has influenced Thai public relations (PR) practice through the eyes of forty-three Thai PR managers and practitioners. It also focused on examining the activities of Thai PR practice. The study employed a qualitative paradigm with in-depth interviews as a main method. The findings found that there were fourteen areas of Thai PR activities: 1) Publicity; 2) Media Relations; 3) Community Relations; 4) Issue Management; 5) Social Contribution to Corporate Social Responsibility; 6) Internal PR; 7) Special Events; 8) Executives counseling; 9) Partnership; 10) Crisis Management; 11) Research and Evaluation; 12) Online Community Relations; 13) Content and Website Management; and 14) ICTs Counseling. It also highlighted that Wattana-dharm Thai has a strong influence on Thai PR practice.

There were eight main Wattana-dharm Thai aspects that influenced Thai PR practice: 1) Relationship orientation (relationships in a Thai style including Bunkhun, Pen-Mitr, and Alum aluy relationships); 2) Community-based orientation; 3) Sanook orientation; 4) Hierarchical structure; 5) Buddhist orientation; 6) Monarchy institution respect; 7) Face and eyes in society; and 8) Form over the content. In addition, it was found that Thai PR practice has an emphasis on Saang Kwaampratabjai [impression building] through Wattana-dharm Thai.

However, in order to validate my qualitative analysis, I have recently extended my study by conducting a survey research to translate my qualitative themes to statistic factors. The study examined triangulation of the findings of a previous qualitative approach by applying factor analysis, identifying in an empirical quantitative study. A questionnaire was developed from my qualitative findings on Wattana-dharm Thai and administered to five hundreds PR practitioners in Thailand. The data were randomized by using a multi-stage random sampling technique.

Hence, this article aims to describe the Influence of Wattana-dharm Thai on Thai PR Practice based on mixed methods research approaches. Also, it aims to fill the gap in knowledge relating to PR and culture. Finally, it will make a contribution to the academic literature on culture and public relations, not only in the West, but globally.
ABSTRACT – Best Paper award

The Interconnection between Public Relations and Corporate Social Responsibility, Case Studies in the Indonesian Mining Industry

Gregoria Arum Yudarwati, PhD
Communications Department,
University of Atma Jaya Yogyakarta,
Indonesia

Purpose - This study aims to reach a better understanding of (1) how companies perceive PR and CSR; (2) how companies perceive the interconnection between these functions; and (3) what factors contributing to their perceptions.

Methodology - This is an interpretive qualitative study involving three mining companies in Indonesia. Semi-structured interviews with thirty-four members of PR and CSR departments and three members of top management were carried out.

Findings - PR and CSR are perceived as community relationship functions to gain organizational legitimacy from the communities and shareholders. Three factors that have shaped these functions: (1) the social and political changes in Indonesia; (2) the communities’ collective culture; and (3) the characteristic of mining industry. These factors have led to the enactment of different roles of PR.

Research limitations/implications - This study focused on how companies interpret and enact their interpretations of their organizational environments. This study suggests further research into how the community and other stakeholders interpret the company’s activities and environment. This study also suggests further study on another type of industry.

Practical implications - It is critical for PR practitioners to develop analytical skills and tools to draw multiple interpretations about their environment as stakeholders are not passive.

Originality/value - This study provides another approach to understanding how CSR and PR are constructed and enacted in an organization as well as to understanding the company’s justification in enacting particular CSR and PR functions. This study maintains the need to consider local values while keeping the global standard.

Key words – corporate social responsibility, public relations, mining industry, community, local values

Paper type – research paper
ABSTRACT

Communication strategy for increasing government officer awareness as information officers: Case Study of Directorate General of ICT Application Official Website

Maydina Zakiah S.
Student, Postgraduate Program in Communication
Faculty of Social and Political Science
Universitas Indonesia
maydina.zakiah@gmail.com

Moh. Wildan
Student, Postgraduate Program in Communication
Faculty of Social and Political Science
Universitas Indonesia

Since Indonesia has passed Law on Public Information (KIP) in 2008 and the use of the Internet and social media are increasingly widespread in the community, Indonesian Government is urged be more open in cyberspace. The new era of government openness has arrived. Open Government/Government Openness makes government more intelligent in solving problems and serving the community.

In September 2011, Indonesia joined the Open Government Global (OGP). OGP movement has been supported by 58 countries representing more than 2 billion people in the world. Partner countries in the OGP are collaborating to bring community and government together to create better countries (opengovindonesia.org)

One form of Indonesian government participation in government openness is reflected in the government institution official website such as the website of The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT), including: Directorate General of ICT Applicaton. There are a lot of media to support information disclosure of government agencies, but the website is a real-time media which have wider coverage.

The website of Directorate General of ICT Applicaton which is http://aptika.kominfo.go.id is a means to communicate the activities and achievements or institution performance to the public. In the era of openness all of government officer should act as Information Officer. Even though data found that officer participation for submitting the content on the media, especially in the Directorate General of ICT Applicaton, is low.

Therefore, this study aims to create a communication strategy for effective communication design or model to raise awareness of the government officer with Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats (SWOT) analysis and in-depth interview methods to the key person for finding the limited factors. We expected that a good communication strategy will be formulated as role model for other government institutions in Indonesia.

References


Law on Public Information, *No.14 of 2008*